

The melting curve of Ni to 1 Mbar

Oliver T. Lord, Ian G. Wood, David P. Dobson, Lidunka Vočadlo, Weiwei Wang, Andrew R. Thomson, Elizabeth T.H. Wann, Guillaume Morard, Mohamed Mezouar, Michael J. Walter

To cite this version:

Oliver T. Lord, Ian G. Wood, David P. Dobson, Lidunka Vočadlo, Weiwei Wang, et al.. The melting curve of Ni to 1 Mbar. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 2014, 408, pp.226-236. $10.1016/j.epsl.2014.09.046$. hal-01089876

HAL Id: hal-01089876 <https://hal.sorbonne-universite.fr/hal-01089876v1>

Submitted on 2 Dec 2014

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

The melting curve of Ni to 1 Mbar

Oliver T. Lord^{a,}*, Ian G. Wood^a, David P. Dobson^a, Lidunka Vočadlo^a, Weiwei Wang^b, ANDREW R. THOMSON^b, Elizabeth T. H. Wann^a, Guillaume Morard^c, Mohamed Mezouar^d, MICHAEL J. WALTER^b

^aDepartment of Earth Sciences, University College London, Gower Street, London, WC1E 6BT, UK

^bSchool of Earth Sciences, University of Bristol, Wills Memorial Building, Queen's Road, Bristol, BS8 1RJ, UK

c Institut de Minéralogie, de Physique des Matériaux, et de Cosmochimie (IMPMC)

Sorbonne Universités - UPMC Univ Paris 06, UMR CNRS 7590, Muséum National d'Histoire Naturelle, IRD

UMR 206, 4 Place Jussieu, F-75005 Paris, France.

^dEuropean Synchrotron Radiation Facility, BP 220, F-38043 Grenoble Cedex, France.

*Corresponding Author Email: Oliver.Lord@bristol.ac.uk Phone: +44 117 9545421 Fax: +44 117 9253385

Total number of words in Main text: 6491

Abstract: 293

Number of tables: 1

Number of figures: 7

References: 68

1 **Abstract**

2 The melting curve of Ni has been determined to 125 GPa using laser-heated diamond anvil 3 cell (LH-DAC) experiments in which two melting criteria were used: firstly, the appearance of 4 liquid diffuse scattering (LDS) during *in situ* X-ray diffraction (XRD) and secondly, plateaux in 5 temperature vs. laser power functions in both *in situ* and off-line experiments. Our new melting curve, defined by a Simon-Glatzel fit to the data where $T_M(K) = \left[\frac{P_M}{18.78 \pm 10^{-10}}\right]$ 6 curve, defined by a Simon-Glatzel fit to the data where T_M $(K) = \left[\left(\frac{FM}{18.78 \pm 10.20} + 1 \right) \right]^{1/2.42 \pm 0.66} \times$ 7 1726, is in good agreement with the majority of the theoretical studies on Ni melting and matches 8 closely the available shock wave melting data. It is however dramatically steeper than the previous 9 off-line LH-DAC studies in which determination of melting was based on the visual observation of 10 motion aided by the laser speckle method. We estimate the melting point (T_M) of Ni at the inner-11 core boundary (ICB) pressure of 330 GPa to be $T_M = 5800 \pm 700$ K (2 σ), within error of the value 12 for Fe of $T_M = 6230 \pm 500$ K determined in a recent *in situ* LH-DAC study by similar methods to 13 those employed here. This similarity suggests that the alloying of 5-10 wt.% Ni with the Fe-rich 14 core alloy is unlikely to have any significant effect on the temperature of the ICB, though this is 15 dependent on the details of the topology of the Fe-Ni binary phase diagram at core pressures. Our 16 melting temperature for Ni at 330 GPa is ~2500 K higher than that found in previous experimental 17 studies employing the laser speckle method. We find that those earlier melting curves coincide with 18 the onset of rapid sub-solidus recrystallization, suggesting that visual observations of motion may 19 have misinterpreted dynamic recrystallization as convective motion of a melt. This finding has 20 significant implications for our understanding of the high-pressure melting behaviour of a number 21 of other transition metals.

23 **Keywords**

24 Nickel; melting; laser-heated diamond anvil cell; high-pressure

25 **1. Introduction**

26 The inner core of the Earth is perpetually solidifying at the expense of the overlying liquid 27 outer core as the Earth undergoes secular cooling over geological time. The boundary between these 28 two regions (the inner core boundary or ICB) is, by definition, close to the *P-T* condition at which 29 the geotherm intersects the solidus of the Fe-rich core alloy. An accurate knowledge of this solidus 30 at the ICB pressure of 330 GPa would provide an anchor for the construction of an accurate 31 geotherm, which would in turn allow us to model more accurately the thermal and chemical 32 structure of the Earth's core, and by extension, the overlying mantle.

33 Attempts to estimate the solidus of the core alloy at 330 GPa are complicated by the fact that 34 the composition of the core alloy is itself poorly constrained and the subject of on-going research 35 (e.g.: Fischer et al., 2013; Antonangeli et al., 2010; Aitta, 2010). However, an upper bound is 36 provided by the melting temperature of pure Fe, given that Fe is the dominant component of the 37 core. Although a broad range of techniques have been applied to this end, the resulting estimates for 38 this upper bound on the ICB temperature (T_{ICB}) were, until recently, highly contradictory, spanning 39 nearly 3000 K. The lowest published estimate is that of Boehler (1993) at 4850±200 K. This is 40 based on a melting curve for Fe determined from visual observations of motion, interpreted as 41 convection in a melt, up to 200 GPa in the laser-heated diamond anvil cell (LH-DAC). The highest 42 estimate is that of Williams et al. (1987), who estimated a temperature of 7600 ± 500 K by 43 combining similar measurements in the LH-DAC with data from the earlier shock experiments of 44 Brown & McQueen (1986) in which the melting temperature was determined from discontinuous 45 changes in the sound velocity of a shocked Fe sample.

46 More recently, a consensus has begun to emerge toward the hot end of this range. The most 47 recent *ab initio* molecular dynamics (MD) simulations, based on density functional theory (DFT) 48 lead to an estimate of 6370±100 K (Alfè, 2009) while the state-of-the-art quantum Monte Carlo 49 (QMC) simulations of Sola & Alfè (2009) give 6900±400 K. Both of these estimates compare

73 330 GPa, the melting curve proposed by Lazor et al. (1993) and that based on the combined datasets

74 of Errandonea et al. (2013; 2001) and Japel et al. (2005) yield melting temperatures of 3300 K and

75 3200 K respectively which are 2400-3700 K lower than the range of Fe melting temperatures 76 described above (Fig. 1). Many topologies are possible for the liquidus in the Fe-Ni system, and on 77 the basis of the subsolidus phase relations of Kuwayama et al. (2008) and Tateno et al. (2012), two 78 likely alternatives are shown in Supplementary Figure 1. Assuming melting temperatures of 6230 K 79 for Fe (Anzellini et al., 2013) and 3300 K for Ni (Lazor et al., 1993), a simple linear interpolation 80 indicates that 10 wt.% Ni in the bulk core alloy could reduce the melting temperature by \sim 300 K. 81 But the depression might be much greater, especially for a topology like that shown in SF1b. Thus, 82 on the basis of the current data for melting of Ni at high pressures, a large melting point depression 83 might be the expectation in the Fe-Ni system.

84 However, as Fig. 1 illustrates, this conclusion suffers from a significant problem: although 85 the existing experimentally determined melting curves for Ni agree closely with one another, there 86 is a very considerable mismatch between these experimental curves and those determined from MD 87 simulations. These have much steeper melting slopes than their LH-DAC experimental counterparts 88 and consequently much higher Ni melting points at 330 GPa: simulations using classical potentials 89 give 5300 K (Bhattacharya et al., 2011), 5900 K (Koči et al., 2006), 6700 K (Weingarten et al., 90 2009), 6800 K (Zhang et al., 2014b) and 10,000 K (Luo et al., 2010) while extrapolating the only 91 DFT based *ab initio* study gives 6700 K (Pozzo & Alfè, 2013). The available shock melting data for 92 Ni fall in the middle of this spread of MD melting curves (Fig. 1; Urlin et al., 1966). Although there 93 is huge variation between these MD values, even the lowest (that of Bhattacharya et al., 2011) is 94 ~2000 K higher than the estimates based on the LH-DAC experiments. The absolute reduction in 95 *TICB* due to the mixing of Ni with Fe is dependent on the detailed topology of the Fe-Ni system at 96 330 GPa and it is formally impossible to determine its magnitude from the melting points of the 97 end-members alone. Nonetheless, if these MD melting curves are correct, then for any given 98 topology of the Fe-Ni system, the reduction in T_{ICB} is likely to be significantly smaller than would 99 be expected on the basis of the existing experimental Ni melting curves (Fig. S1). Thus, the

100 accuracy of any estimate of T_{ICB} (and more generally, the accuracy of any Fe-Ni binary phase 101 diagram at inner core pressures) is strongly dependent upon which of the published melting curves 102 of Ni is correct.

138 **2. Methods**

139 *2.1 Sample assemblies*

140 Pressure was generated using Princeton-type symmetric DACs with culets ranging from 250 141 μm to 150 μm in diameter (the latter bevelled at 8° out to a diameter of 250 μm). Rhenium, initially 142 250 μm thick was indented to a pressure of 25 GPa and drilled centrally to create a sample chamber 143 ^{1/3} the diameter of the culet. Samples consisted of either ∼5 μm thick densified foils made by 144 compressing Ni powder between diamond anvils, or discs cut from 12.5 μm thick Ni sheet (both 145 99.95% purity; Goodfellow Cambridge Ltd.) using a UV laser ablation unit. The discs were then 146 polished on both sides to a thickness of \sim 5 μm using 0.1 μm grade Al₂O₃ impregnated Mylar 147 lapping film and then cleaned under acetone to remove any polishing debris. 148 Samples slightly smaller than the diameter of the sample chamber were loaded between 149 form fitting discs of KCl or MgO, ~15 μm thick, that acted as both pressure medium and thermal 150 insulation. These discs were cut, also using UV laser ablation, from sheets made by compressing 151 powder in a hydraulic press. Pressure was monitored during compression (in all experiments) as 152 well as before and after laser heating (in the off-line experiments) using the fluorescence of sub-153 micron grains of Cr:Al₂O₃ (ruby). In the off-line experiments, these grains were placed next to the 154 sample and between the layers of pressure medium whereas in the *in situ* X-ray diffraction 155 experiments (in which the ruby was not used to determine the pressure of the experiment) they were 156 placed next to the sample chamber, between the gasket and the diamond anvil, to simplify the 157 analysis of our XRD patterns. After loading, each cell was heated at 120°C for 1 hour under an 158 argon atmosphere before being sealed under the same conditions to remove any water adsorbed 159 during loading.

- 160
- 161
- 162

163 *2.2 In situ experiments*

164 Samples were laser-heated in a double-sided off-axis geometry with temperatures measured 165 spectroradiometrically from the light collected using reflective optics from a 2×2 µm area centred 166 on the 20-30 μm diameter laser-heated spot. Before the start of XRD, temperatures were measured 167 on both sides and were equalized by varying the power of the lasers; during XRD, temperature was 168 measured only on the upstream side, due to the need to remove the temperature-measuring optics 169 from the path of the diffracted X-rays on the downstream side. The laser power was increased 170 incrementally and linearly with a 3 s dwell time at each power during which the detector was 171 automatically exposed to the diffracted X-rays. Temperatures were measured continuously and as 172 often as allowed by the acquisition time of the spectrometer, which varied inversely with 173 temperature. Typical temperature steps are <100 K (Fig. 4a) and a complete heating cycle took 5-15 174 minutes to complete. For further details of the laser heating system see Schultz et al. (2005). 175 The X-ray beam (33 keV; $\lambda = 0.3738$ Å; FWHM = 3 µm) was co-aligned to the centre of the 176 laser heated spot using the X-ray induced fluorescence of either the pressure medium or the Re 177 gasket. Diffracted X-rays were collected with a MAR165 CCD detector calibrated for sample to 178 detector distance using a LaB₆ standard. The resulting patterns, masked to remove saturated spots, 179 were integrated into 1-D spectra using the Fit2D program (Hammersley, 1997) and fitted using the 180 Le Bail method (Le Bail *et al.*, 1988) as implemented in the GSAS suite of programs (Larson & 181 Von Dreele, 2000; Toby, 2001). Further details of the X-ray optics and beam-line design can be 182 found in Mezouar et al. (2005). 183 Pressure was determined before and after each melting experiment from the measured unit-184 cell volume of the Ni sample using the Vinet equation of state (EOS) reported by Dewaele et al. 185 (2008). During laser heating, the total pressure (P_M) , including the thermal pressure component,

- 186 P_{TH} , was determined from the sample volume and temperature using a Mie-Gruneisen-Debye
- 187 thermal EOS. This EOS was determined by fitting the high temperature *P-V-T* data reported in

197 Melting was detected using two criteria: 1) the appearance of plateaux in temperature vs. 198 laser power curves and 2) the appearance of LDS in the XRD patterns. In all experiments we define 199 T_M as the average of the temperatures within the plateau in the temperature vs. laser power function 200 rather than using the appearance of LDS, to make our *in situ* results directly comparable to our off-201 line data (§2.3). Because LDS was always observed after the onset of and within a temperature 202 plateau, using the appearance of LDS to define T_M makes almost no difference to our reported 203 values. Our reported uncertainties in T_M are calculated by combining the average of the analytical 204 uncertainty in the temperature measurements used to calculate T_M (2-5 K) with their standard 205 deviation (50-100 K). Similarly, P_M is defined as the average of the pressures determined from all 206 the diffraction patterns collected during the plateau used to define T_M . The uncertainties in P_M are 207 calculated in the same way, by combining the average of the uncertainties in the pressures used to 208 determine P_M with their standard deviation. In both cases errors have been combined assuming that 209 they are uncorrelated.

210 *2.3 Off-line experiments*

211 Samples were heated using the on-axis double-sided laser heating system in the School of 212 Earth Sciences, University of Bristol, which is described in detail in a previous publication (Lord et 213 al., 2014). Briefly, the system consists of two 100 W diode pumped TEM₀₀ fibre lasers (λ = 1070 214 nm). Beam-shaping optics and variable beam expanders were employed in the laser path to produce 215 a flat-topped temperature profile with a diameter of 10-30 μm at the sample surface. The power to 216 the lasers was automatically increased linearly as a function of time, with a constant offset designed 217 to equalize the initial temperature of the two sample surfaces.

218 In every experiment, temperature cross-sections were measured spectroradiometrically along 219 a transect across the laser heated spot (simultaneously, on both sides) by fitting the Wien function to 220 spatially resolved spectra of the emitted incandescent light (Walter & Koga, 2004). Details of this 221 technique, the associated uncertainties and the results of ambient pressure calibration experiments 222 are all described in detail elsewhere (Lord et al., 2014; 2010; 2009). In a few experiments, the 1-D 223 spectroradiometric cross-sections were supplemented with 2-D temperature maps measured on the 224 left hand side only using a newly installed multi-spectral imaging radiometry system, based on the 225 design described in Campbell (2008). Briefly, this method involves the acquisition of images of the 226 laser-heated spot at four different wavelengths (670, 750, 800 and 900 nm) on a single CCD 227 camera. The four images are then spatially correlated, based on a calibration image of a backlit 228 pinhole with a diameter of \sim 2-3 μ m such that, at each pixel, four intensity-wavelength data points 229 are available. Temperature and emissivity are then determined at the pixel of interest by fitting the 230 grey-body Wien function to the combined data from a 9×9 pixel box centred on the pixel of 231 interest (giving a total of 324 data points). This last step is done to smooth the measured 232 temperatures to match the optical resolution of the temperature measurement system $(\sim$ 3 µm; Lord 233 et al., 2014). These procedures are replicated for every pixel to give 2-D maps of temperature and 234 emissivity. This method has several advantages over traditional 1-D apertured spectroradiometry.

235 First of all, because the entire hotspot is imaged, the peak temperature can always be determined. In 236 spectroradiometry, any slight misalignment of the hot spot with the spectrometer aperture will lead 237 to an underestimation of the peak sample temperature. This is especially true during melting 238 experiments, where the hotspot may move rapidly. Secondly, because each of the images can be 239 focused independently onto the CCD, imaging radiometry should lead to the complete removal of 240 chromatic effects from the measured temperatures (Lord et al., 2014). Finally, imaging the entire 241 temperature field potentially allows us to observe the dynamic changes in sample temperature and 242 morphology that occur during melting which are only partially evident when using 243 spectroradiometry. These changes may also form the basis of an additional corroborative melting 244 criterion. 245 After quenching to room temperature, the fluorescence of the ruby closest to the location of 246 melting was used to determine the melting pressure, using the calibration of Dewaele et al. (2008). 247 The uncertainty in these measurements is obtained by combining three uncorrelated terms: one 248 which encompasses the disagreement between the various recently published ruby scales available 249 (to a maximum of ± 3 GPa at 110 GPa; see Fig. 3 of Dewaele et al. 2008), a second (of ± 0.5 -1.0 250 GPa) to take account of radial pressure gradients and a third $(\pm 0.2 \text{ GPa})$ to take account of the error 251 in determining the position of the R_1 fluorescence line. To determine P_M for the off-line 252 experiments, these post-heating pressures have been corrected for the effects of thermal pressure as 253 estimated from the *in situ* experiments in which the thermal pressure was measured directly (§2.5). 254 Reported values of T_M and their uncertainties were determined as in the *in situ* experiments. 255 256 *2.4 Melt detection*

257 As described in §2.2, T_M was determined from the appearance of features, often plateaux, in 258 the temperature vs. laser power functions recorded during both the *in situ* and off-line experiments. 259 This was corroborated, in nearly every *in situ* experiment, by the appearance of LDS in the XRD

13 of 44

260 patterns; whenever this was the case, the LDS appeared at the same temperature as the plateau, 261 though usually at a higher laser power.

262 For an in-depth discussion of the rationale behind the use of plateaux in laser power vs. 263 temperature functions as a melting criterion, the reader is referred to Lord et al. (2014; 2010; 2009) 264 and Thomson et al. (2014). In summary, we have successfully applied this technique to a range of 265 materials, including Fe, Pt, Pb, FeS, Fe₃C, Fe₇C₃, the Fe-Fe₃C eutectic, FeSi, and NiSi and the 266 solidi in the MgCO₃-CaCO₃ and MgCO₃-MgSiO₃ systems. In the case of FeSi, Fe₃C, Fe₇C₃, the Fe- 267 Fe₃C eutectic and the eutectics in the MgCO₃-CaCO₃ and MgCO₃-MgSiO₃ systems, our melting 268 curves are corroborated by the *ex situ* textural analysis of large volume press (LVP) experiments, 269 where measurements overlap. More importantly, there are now several materials for which melting 270 temperatures have been determined using this method and are found to be in excellent agreement 271 with direct observations of melting from the appearance of LDS during *in situ* XRD. These include, 272 but are not limited to, FeSi (plateaux: Lord et al., 2010; LDS: Fischer et al., 2013), $Fe_{85}Ni_5Si_{10}$ 273 (plateaux: Lord et al., 2014; LDS: Morard et al., 2011) and Fe₉₁Si₉ (plateaux: Fischer et al., 2013 274 and Asanuma et al, 2010; LDS: Fischer et al., 2013 and Morard et al., 2011). Most important of all 275 is the case of NiSi, in which LDS was observed to occur concurrently with plateaux in the 276 temperature vs. laser power function (Lord et al., 2014).

277

278 *2.5 Thermal pressure correction of off-line experiments*

279 To allow our off-line and *in situ* melting data to be combined, we have corrected our off-line 280 data to include the effects of P_{TH} . For these experiments, the relation $P_{TH} = \alpha K_T (T_m - T_0)$, which 281 assumes that αK_T is a constant, does not accurately reproduce our measured values of P_{TH} . Instead, 282 we have determined, by linear regression, the empirical relationship between $P_{TH} = P_M - P_{300}$ and 283 P₃₀₀ in our *in situ* experiments (where P₃₀₀ is the pressure measured after quenching to room 284 temperature). This relationship is presented in Fig. 2 for experiments in which the pressure medium

285 was MgO (filled circles) and KCl (open circles). In both cases the data indicate a linear correlation 286 that is slightly positive, indicating that the magnitude of the thermal pressure will increase with 287 increasing compression, as expected. 288 It is also clear that at any given value of P_{300} , P_{TH} is at least a factor of ~8 smaller when 289 KCl, as opposed to MgO, is used as the pressure medium. This is not surprising because P_{TH} 290 depends on the coefficient of thermal expansion of the sample and the compressibility of the 291 pressure medium and KCl is significantly more compressible than MgO over the *P-T* range of the 292 data. 293 The data in Fig. 2 relating to each pressure medium are fitted separately, with equal weights, 294 to a straight line, giving $P_{TH} = 7.7(23) + 0.06(5)P_{300}$ for experiments in MgO and $P_{TH} =$ 295 0.03(1) P_{300} for experiments in KCl (in the latter case the y-intercept was set to 0 to prevent 296 negative thermal pressures at $P < 10$ GPa). The value of P_M for each off-line experiment was then 297 calculated as the sum of P_{TH} , calculated using the relations defined above, and P_{300} , determined 298 after heating by ruby fluorescence spectroscopy. The uncertainties involved in this P_{TH} correction 299 procedure are fully propagated through to the uncertainties on the reported values of P_M (Table 1).

300 **3. Results**

301 The corrected Ni melting data are presented in Fig. 3 while Table 1 contains the data both 302 with and without correction for P_{TH} . It is clear that the off-line and *in situ* measurements (squares 303 and circles in Fig. 3 respectively) are in excellent agreement with one another, as observed in a 304 previous study on NiSi (Lord et al., 2014). The pressure medium used, either MgO or KCl, also has 305 no significant effect on melting temperature. Our preferred melting curve for Ni (the thick black 306 line in Fig. 3) is an equally weighted fit to all the data, corrected for thermal pressure, using the Simon-Glatzel equation (Simon & Glatzel, 1929), that yields $T_M = \left[\frac{P_M}{18.78 \pm 10^{-10}}\right]$ 307 Simon-Glatzel equation (Simon & Glatzel, 1929), that yields $T_M = \left[\left(\frac{F_M}{18.78 \pm 10.20} + 1\right)\right]^{1/2.42 \pm 0.66} \times$ 308 T_0 , where $T_0 = 1726$ K (the ambient pressure melting point of Ni; Weast et al., 1985). 309 Extrapolating this fit to the ICB pressure of 330 GPa gives $T_M = 5800 \pm 700$ K (2 σ). Fitting the uncorrected data in the same manner gives $T_M = \left[\frac{P_M}{11.65 \pm 1.65}\right]$ 310 uncorrected data in the same manner gives $T_M = \left[\left(\frac{P_M}{11.65 \pm 7.93} + 1 \right) \right]^{1/2.82 \pm 0.89} \times T_0$ (the thin black 311 line on Fig. 3) and yields an almost identical value of $T_M = 5700 \pm 900$ K (2 σ) at the ICB, 312 suggesting that the effects of thermal pressure and the correction applied to the off-line data has no 313 substantive effect. It should be noted that both fits are highly anti-correlated, with coefficients of - 314 0.99; thus the uncertainties on the two fitting parameters should not be considered independent. 315 Fig.4 shows an example of the *in situ* measurements in which MgO was used as the pressure 316 medium. The sample temperature increases rapidly as a function of total laser power up to 2900 K 317 at 27.8 % (Fig. 4a). At this point the temperature drops slightly and then rises again at a slower rate 318 until remaining essentially constant from 32.2 % laser output until the end of the experiment. 319 Averaging these temperatures (the filled circles) gives $T_M = 2820 \pm 90$ K. At 38.8 % output 320 (marked by the arrow) LDS appears in the XRD patterns (Fig. 4b) and grows in intensity with 321 increasing laser power until reaching a maximum at ~43 % laser output. As in our previous study 322 on NiSi (Lord et al., 2014), we interpret the correlation between the plateaux in the temperature vs. 323 laser power data and the LDS signal as confirmation that the generation of the plateau is directly

324 related to melting and is thus an accurate melting criterion. There are several possible reasons as to 325 why the diffuse signal does not appear until after the onset of the plateau. Firstly, the diffuse signal 326 may not be resolvable from the background until a sufficient melt volume is produced. Secondly, 327 the melt may be mobile, making it hard to observe until the majority of the sample is melted at 328 higher laser power; it is common for melted samples to exhibit holes after quenching, suggesting 329 the melt has flowed away from the hotspot, and thus also away from the X-ray beam. Thirdly, this 330 behaviour could be due to slight misalignments between the laser heated spot and the X-ray beam. 331 When MgO was used as the pressure medium, minor reaction between the mobile melt and 332 the diamond anvils was evident in our *in situ* experiments. Fig. 5a shows a pattern collected at high 333 temperature just before melting from experiment 65A; all the peaks can be indexed to fcc-Ni and 334 MgO. After quenching (Fig. 5b), new, weak peaks appear that can be indexed using the cementite 335 (Fe₃C) structure (space group *Pnma*), with a = 4.219(1) Å, b = 4.702(5) Å, c = 6.338(6) Å and V = 336 125.7(1) \mathring{A}^{-3} . These values are very close to (but slightly smaller than) the values predicted for Fe₃C 337 by Sata et al. (2010) at the post heating pressure of 56.1 GPa, suggesting that the trace phase is 338 Ni₃C, which is a known metastable phase at 1 atm, albeit with a different, hexagonal, structure 339 (Goto et al., 2008). An analysis of the relative areas of the Ni and Ni₃C peaks indicate that this 340 phase represents a maximum of 13% of the sample by volume, which corresponds to a maximum C 341 content of 0.55 wt. %. The effect of this minor contamination, which is hard to avoid, would be to 342 reduce the measured melting temperature, assuming the Ni-C system is eutectic at these conditions, 343 thus strengthening further the central conclusion of this paper that the Ni melting curve is hotter 344 than previously thought. No such reaction products were observed after quench in the only *in situ* 345 experiment in which KCl was used as the pressure medium (Fig. 5c). 346 Figs. 6 (experiment 77A at 28 GPa) and 7 (experiment 79B at 125 GPa) show examples of

347 the *ex situ* data spanning the investigated pressure range. In the case of experiment 77A, the sample 348 temperature was measured not only using spectroradiometry on both sides (the circles in Fig. 6a),

374 sample surface, while the aperture on the left (the open circles) does not. It is this kind of 375 misalignment between the rapidly moving melt and the 1-D spectroradiometric aperture that likely 376 accounts for the fact that the scatter in the data in Fig. 3 (up to 300 K) is significantly larger than the 377 formal error bars on the individual data points. In this case, the value of $T_M = 2620 \pm 70$ K was 378 determined by averaging the right hand side spectroradiometric measurements and the multispectral 379 imaging radiometry measurements made on the left hand side. 380 In the manner of Fischer & Campbell (2010) we looked for melting-related discontinuities 381 in temperature vs. emissivity plots taken from our multispectral imaging radiometry data. However, 382 we did not see any features that correlated consistently with our primary melting criterion. It is 383 probable that such discontinuities, which Fischer & Campbell (2010) observed in melting 384 experiments on wüstite (Fe_{0.94}O), depend on there being a change in the emissivity of the sample 385 upon melting. The magnitude of this change will be material specific and perhaps is not large

386 enough to be observable in Ni.

387 **4. Discussion**

388 *4.1 Comparison with the literature*

389 Over the range of the measurements (to 125 GPa) our new Ni melting curve is in excellent 390 agreement with the majority of the MD studies of Ni melting: the *ab initio* study of Pozzo & Alfè 391 (2013), and the studies of Weingarten et al. (2009) and Koči et al. (2006) which employed classical 392 potentials. Indeed, the study of Luo et al. (2010), which also used classical potentials, is the only 393 non-experimental study that significantly contradicts our new melting curve (1500 K hotter at 125 394 GPa). In addition to the MD simulations, the two shock melting points recalculated by Pozzo $\&$ 395 Alfè (2013), on the basis of the equations of state of liquid and solid Ni reported by Urlin et al. 396 (1966), fall almost exactly on our new melting curve.

397 However, our new Ni melting curve, along with all those determined on the basis of the 398 theoretical and shock-wave data discussed above, diverges dramatically from the melting curves 399 determined from the previous LH-DAC studies (Japel et al., 2005; Errandonea et al., 2001; Lazor et 400 al., 1993). At 125 GPa, these curves are at least 1200 K below that reported here. This difference is 401 most easily explained by the different melting criteria employed in the various studies. In all three 402 of the previous LH-DAC studies, melting was determined on the basis of the observation of motion 403 in the 'speckle' pattern created by a green Ar laser on the sample surface during laser heating (the 404 laser speckle method), with the assumption being that such motion represented the convection of a 405 liquid. However, the recent work of Anzellini et al. (2013) on Fe, in which melting was determined 406 using the appearance of LDS during *in situ* XRD in the LH-DAC suggests an alternative 407 explanation. They observed that an earlier (lower) melting curve (Boehler, 1993) that was 408 determined using the laser speckle method, coincided with the onset of sub-solidus recrystallization 409 as evidenced by the rapid change in the position of saturated spots around the Debye-Scherrer 410 diffraction rings from the Fe sample. The supplementary video (S1) accompanying this paper shows 411 the sequence of raw 2-D diffraction patterns collected during *in situ* run 65B at $P_M = 77.4 \pm 2.2$

412 GPa (see Table 1). At the start of the experiment, semi-continuous Debye-Scherrer rings can be 413 seen from the Ni sample (the rings from the MgO pressure medium remain continuous throughout 414 the experiment). At 2530 K, several large spots appear, associated with one of the Ni rings, 415 indicative of the onset of rapid recrystallization; as the temperature rises, similar spots are present in 416 nearly every pattern, but always in different locations around the Ni rings. In the pattern marked 417 3820 K toward the end of the video, a single, continuous diffuse ring, indicative of the presence of 418 melt, appears suddenly. In this example, rapid recrystallization begins more than 1000 K before the 419 first appearance of melt, which suggests that this commonly observed pre-melting phenomenon is 420 not an accurate melting criterion. The open triangles on Fig. 3 represent the temperatures at which 421 rapid recrystallization begins in all of the *in situ* experiments on pure Ni reported here. These 422 temperatures correlate well with the earlier experimental melting curves determined in the LH-DAC 423 using the laser speckle method, which suggests that those earlier studies on Ni, as is likely the case 424 with Fe, were determining the temperature of sub-solidus recrystallization rather than melting. The 425 new results further suggest that local structures in the liquid phase do not control the gradient of the 426 Ni melting curve. Such local structures were proposed by Ross et al. (2007b) as a possible reason 427 for the low gradient of the Ni melting curve as determined by the laser speckle method; in fact, their 428 model from which the entropic effects of local liquid structure is removed matches well with our 429 new melting data, the shock compression data, and the majority of the MD based simulations (cf. 430 Fig. 3 from this paper with Fig. 4 of Ross et al. 2007b).

431 In contrast, the new Ni melting curve reported here is based on the direct observation of the 432 presence of melt from its diffuse scattering signal during *in situ* XRD experiments, and the 433 appearance of plateaux in temperature vs. laser power curves, which are themselves correlated with 434 the appearance of LDS in the *in situ* experiments. The fact that our melting curve agrees closely 435 with both the existing shock wave data and the majority of the computational studies gives us 436 confidence in its accuracy.

437

438 *4.2 Implications for the phase diagrams of the transition metals*

439 The possibility that the laser speckle method may lead to the misidentification of sub-solidus 440 recrystallization as melting has considerable implications for many other transition metals for which 441 melting curves have been determined using this method. It is well known (Errandonea et al., 2005) 442 that the laser speckle studies on the bcc metals Mo, Ta and W define melting curves which are 443 much lower in temperature than those determined from MD simulations, shock wave experiments, 444 and in the case of Ta, *in situ* XRD in the LH-DAC where LDS was used as the melting criterion 445 (Dewaele et al., 2010). Co, Ti, V and Cr (Errandonea et al., 2001) have also been studied using the 446 laser speckle method, though less extensively by MD. Nevertheless, a recent MD study on Co 447 (Zhang et al., 2014a) yet again indicates a much steeper melting curve compared to the one 448 generated using the laser speckle method. In contrast, it is also apparent that the laser speckle 449 measurements on Al (Ross et al., 2004) and Cu, Pt and Pd (Errandonea et al., 2013) are in very 450 good agreement with the available shock wave and MD melting curves. We suggest that additional 451 studies should be performed on all of these metals, using the melting criteria employed in this 452 study, to determine whether the shallow slopes genuinely represent melting, and why the laser 453 speckle method appears to define melting accurately in some materials but not others.

454

455 *4.3 Implications for the temperature at the ICB*

456 Extrapolating our melting curve to the pressure of the ICB (330 GPa) yields $T_M = 5800 \pm 100$ 457 700 K (2 σ), which falls within error of the classical MD study of Koči et al. (2006; $T_M = 5950 \pm 10^{-10}$ 458 50 K) and the cell-theory based study of Bhattacharya et al. (2011; $T_M = 5330 \pm 50$ K). In

459 contrast, the only *ab initio* MD study of Ni melting (Pozzo & Alfè, 2013) predicts a value of

- 460 6740±180 K, nearly 1000 K higher. This value is however, like ours, an extrapolation, with
- 461 simulations having only been performed to 100 GPa, all of which give values within error of our

479 **5. Conclusions**

480 We have presented a new melting curve for Ni to 125 GPa, based on the appearance of LDS 481 during *in situ* XRD in the LH-DAC and plateaux in temperature vs. laser power functions in both *in* 482 *situ* and off-line experiments. The new melting curve is in excellent agreement with the majority of 483 the theoretical (primarily MD) studies on Ni melting, and matches closely the available shock wave 484 data. We estimate the melting temperature of Ni at the ICB pressure of 330 GPa as $T_M = 5800 \pm 100$ 485 700 K (2 σ), which is 2500 K higher than the value of $T_M \approx 3300$ K from the studies of Lazor et al. 486 (1993), Japel et al. (2005) and Errandonea et al. (2013; 2001) which employed the laser speckle 487 method as the melting criterion but close to the value of $T_M = 6230 \pm 500$ K for Fe from the recent 488 study of Anzellini et al. (2013) as determined by methods comparable to those used here. Our new 489 melting curve for Ni suggests that the reduction in T_{ICB} is likely to be significantly smaller than 490 would be expected were the existing experimental Ni melting curves correct, further bolstering 491 claims that Earth's core is hotter than previously thought (Anzellini et al., 2013). 492 Along with FeSi (Fischer et al., 2013) and NiSi (Lord et al., 2014), this study provides a 493 further example of the accuracy as a melting criterion of plateaux in temperature vs. laser power 494 functions because, in each case, melting temperatures determined in this way correlate exactly with

495 direct observations of melting from the appearance of LDS during *in situ* XRD.

496 Analysis of our XRD patterns indicates that the earlier melting curves for Ni, determined by 497 the laser speckle method, correlate with the onset of sub-solidus recrystallization rather than 498 melting, as was observed in Fe (Anzellini et al., 2013). This has significant implications for a 499 number of other transition metals, such as Mo, W, Co, V, Ti and Cr that also exhibit shallow 500 melting slopes, but have thus far only been studied in the LH-DAC using the laser speckle method. 501 Finally, our 2-D temperature mapping, generated using multispectral imaging radiometry 502 (Campbell, 2008) shows dramatic changes on melting in the dynamics of the temperature field that 503 could be employed as a useful additional melting criterion in off-line LH-DAC studies.

504 **Acknowledgements**

- 505 This work was supported by the Natural Environment Research Council by grants awarded
- 506 to LV at UCL (grant number NE/H003975/1), to MJW at Bristol (NE/H003541/1) and by a
- 507 fellowship awarded to OTL at Bristol (NE/J018945/1) and by the PlanetLab program of the French
- 508 National Research Agency by a grant awarded to GM (ANR-12-BS04-0015-04). We wish to thank
- 509 Denis Andrault, Daniele Antonangeli and Julien Siebert for their generous help with both the
- 510 preparation and running of in situ melting experiments at the ESRF.

512 **References**

- 513 Ahrens TJ, Holland KG, Chen GQ (2002) Phase diagram of iron, revised-core temperatures.
- 514 Geophys Res Lett 29<http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2001GL014350>
- 515 Aitta A (2010) The identity and quantity of the light matter on each side of the Earth's inner core
- 516 boundary. Phys Earth Planet Inter 181:132-140
- 517 Allègre CJ, Poirier J-P, Humler E, Hofmann AW (1995) The chemical composition of the Earth. 518 Earth Planet Sci Lett 134:515-526
- 519 Antonangeli D, Siebert J, Badro J, Farber DL, Fiquet G, Morard G, Ryerson FJ (2010) Composition
- 520 of the Earth's inner core from high-pressure sound velocity measurements in Fe–Ni–Si
- 521 alloys. Earth Planet Sci Lett 295:292–296
- 522 Anzellini S, Dewaele A, Mezouar M, Loubeyre P, Morard G (2013) Melting of Iron at Earth's 523 Inner Core Boundary Based on Fast X-ray Diffraction. Science 340:464-466
- 524 Asanuma H, Ohtani E, Sakai T, Terasaki H, Kamada S, Kondo T, Kikegawa T (2010) Melting of 525 iron–silicon alloy up to the core–mantle boundary pressure: implications to the thermal
- 526 structure of the Earth's core. Phys Chem Min 37:353-359
- 527 Bhattacharya C, Srivastava MK, Menon SVG (2011) Melting curves of FCC-metals by cell-theory. 528 Physica B 406:4035-4040
- 529 Boehler R, Ross M, Boercker DB (1996) High-pressure melting curves of alkali halides. Phys Rev 530 B 53:556-563
- 531 Boehler R (1993) Temperatures in the Earth's core from melting-point measurements of iron at 532 high static pressures. Nature 363:534-536.
- 533 Brown JM, McQueen RG (1986) Phase transitions, Grüneisen parameter, and elasticity for shocked 534 iron between 77 GPa and 400 GPa. J. Geophys. Res. 91:7485-7494

- 603 Lord OT, Walter MJ, Dobson DP, Armstrong L, Clark SM, Kleppe A (2010) The FeSi phase
- 604 diagram to 150 GPa. J Geophys Res 115:B06208
- 605 Lord OT, Walter MJ, Dasgupta R, Walker D, Clark SM (2009) Melting in the Fe–C system to 70 606 GPa. Earth Planet Sci Lett 284:157-167
- 607 Lindholm M, Sundman B (1996) A thermodynamic evaluation of the nickel-silicon system. Met 608 Mat Trans A 27:2897-2903

660 Thomson A, Walter MJ, Lord OT, Kohn SC (in press) Experimental determination of the Eutectic 661 melting Curves in the systems Enstatite-Magnesite and Magnesite-Calcite from 15 – 80

662 GPa. Am Min doi:10.2138/am.2014.4735

- 663 Toby BH (2001) EXPGUI, a graphical user interface for GSAS. J App Cryst 34:210-213
- 664 Urlin VD (1966) Melting at ultra high pressures in a shock wave. Soviet Phys JETP 22:341
- 665 Weast RC, Astle MJ, Beyer WH (1985). Handbook of Chemistry and Physics. CRC Press Inc., 666 Boca Raton, Florida.
- 667 Weingarten NS, Mattson WD, Rice BM (2009) Determination of the pressure dependent melting 668 temperatures of Al and Ni using MD. J App Phys 106:063524
- 669 Williams Q, Jeanloz R, Bass J, Svendsen B, Ahrens J (1987) The melting curve of iron to 250 670 gigapascals: A constraint on the temperature at Earth's centre. Science 236:181-182
- 671 Wu CJ, Söderlind P, Glosli JN, Klepeis JE (2009) Shear-induced anisotropic plastic flow from 672 body-centered-cubic tantalum before melting. Nature Mat 8:223-228
- 673 Yamazaki D, Ito E, Yoshino T, Yoneda A, Guo X, Zhang B, Sun W, Shimojoku A, Tsujino N,
- 674 Kunimoto T, Higo Y, Funakoshi K (2012) P-V-T equation of state for ε-iron up to 80 GPa
- 675 and 1900 K using the Kawai-type high Pressure apparatus equipped with sintered diamond 676 anvils. Geophys Res Lett 39:L20308
- 677 Zerr A, Boehler R (1994) Constraints on the melting temperature of the lower mantle from high-678 pressure experiments on MgO and magnesiowüstite. Nature 371:506-508
- 679 Zhang W-J, Peng Y-F, Liu Z-L (2014a) Molecular dynamics study of melting curve, entropy of
- 680 fusion and solid–liquid interfacial energy of cobalt under pressure. Physica B 440:33-40
- 681 Zhang W-J, Liu Z-L, Peng Y-F (2014b) Molecular dynamics simulations of the melting curves and 682 nucleation of nickel under pressure. Physica B 449:144-149
- 683 Zhang X-L, Cai L-C, Chen J, Xu J-A, Jing F-Q (2008) Melting Behaviour of Mo by Shock Wave
- 684 Experiment. Chin Phys Lett 25:2969-2972

685 **Figure Captions**

686

698

699 **Figure 2:** $P_{TH} = P_M - P_{300}$ plotted as a function of P_{300} for *in situ* experiments, where P_M is the 700 total pressure determined from the volume and temperature of the sample as measured during 701 melting and P_{300} is the pressure measured after quenching to room temperature. Closed symbols, Ni 702 with MgO as the pressure medium; Open symbols, KCl as the pressure medium with samples of 703 pure Ni (empty), Ni_{91.6(4)}Si_{8.4(4)} (crosses) and Ni_{95.8(2)}Si_{4.2(2)} (pluses). The data from the two Ni-Si 704 alloy compositions are from unpublished experiments in which the KCl pressure medium was also 705 used as the pressure standard. The lines are equally weighted linear regressions of the data with the 706 fit for KCl forced through zero to prevent negative thermal pressures at $P < 10$ GPa.

707

708 **Figure 3:** Ni melting data collected *in situ* at the ESRF (circles) and off-line at Bristol (squares). 709 For clarity, only the data corrected for the effects of thermal pressure P_{TH} are shown. See §2.5 of

34 of 44

710 the text for details of the correction procedure and Table 1 for the uncorrected values. The thick 711 black line is an equally weighted fit using the Simon-Glatzel equation while the grey field is a 2σ 712 error envelope. The thin black line is a similar fit to the uncorrected data (not shown). The red open 713 triangles represent the estimated temperature of the onset of rapid recrystallization in our *in situ* 714 experiments. The grey lines represent other Ni melting curves reported in the literature based on 715 experiments (thick) and MD simulations (thin) labelled as in Fig. 1, with dashed lines representing 716 extrapolation. Closed triangles: shock melting points recalculated by Pozzo & Alfè (2013) on the 717 basis of the equations of state of liquid and solid Ni reported by Urlin et al. (1966). The black cross 718 at 330 GPa represents the melting point of pure Fe based on the *in situ* experiments of Anzellini et 719 al. (2013). Experimentally determined melting curves for the MgO and KCl pressure media are 720 from Zerr & Boehler (1994) and Boehler et al. (1996) respectively.

721

Figure 4: *In situ* run 59A (Ni in MgO at $P_M = 45.8 \pm 1.3$ GPa). (a) Temperature vs. laser power 723 plot. The grey bar represents the melting temperature determined from the points within the melting 724 plateau (filled circles). The arrow represents the laser power at which LDS was first observed; LDS 725 was observed in all subsequent data above this power, which are colour coded as a function of laser 726 power. (b) XRD patterns colour coded to match (a). The black spectrum is the pattern collected 727 immediately before the onset of LDS; the dashed line is a fit to its background. Tick marks from top 728 to bottom represent Ni in the fcc structure and MgO. A constant intensity offset is applied to each 729 pattern such that all the patterns match at $2\theta = 8^{\circ}$.

730

731 **Figure 5:** Le Bail fits (red lines) and difference curves (blue lines) of XRD data (black crosses) 732 from experiment 65A immediately before melting (a) and after temperature quench (b) and from 733 experiment 35A, also after quenching (c). Upper tick marks are for fcc-Ni; lower tick marks are for 734 MgO in (a) and (b) and for B2-KCl in (c). The arrows in (b) represent a quenched trace carbide

748 **Figure 7:** Off-line run 79B (Ni in MgO at $P_M = 125.1 \pm 2.6$ GPa). Symbols as in Fig. 5.

Figure 1:

Pressure (GPa)

Figure 2:

Figure 3:

Figure 4:

Figure 5:

Figure 6:

770

771 **Table 1:** Melting data

Data in bold were collected *in situ*