

# **Ocean acidification in the Mediterranean Sea: pelagic mesocosm experiments. A synthesis**

L. Maugendre, Cecile Guieu, Jean-Pierre Gattuso, Frédéric Gazeau

# **To cite this version:**

L. Maugendre, Cecile Guieu, Jean-Pierre Gattuso, Frédéric Gazeau. Ocean acidification in the Mediterranean Sea: pelagic mesocosm experiments. A synthesis. Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science, 2017, 186 (A), pp.1-10.  $10.1016/j.eess.2017.01.006$ . hal-01436273

# **HAL Id: hal-01436273 <https://hal.sorbonne-universite.fr/hal-01436273>**

Submitted on 16 Jan 2017

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



16 Mediterranean Sea.

# 17 **1. Introduction**



ig the impacts of ocean acidification on the CO<sub>2</sub> uptake capacity of the ocean. Since<br>significant number of perturbation experiments have been performed to fill this<br>dge gap by focusing on communities rather than on isol 42 As changes in the efficiency of this biological pump have the capacity to alter the capacity 43 of the ocean to store anthropogenic  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ , there is therefore a great need in projecting its future 44 evolution. Ocean acidification experiments focussing on single plankton species do not allow 45 assessing the impacts of ocean acidification on the  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  uptake capacity of the ocean. Since 46 2000, a significant number of perturbation experiments have been performed to fill this 47 knowledge gap by focusing on communities rather than on isolated species (Figure 1 and 48 Table 1). Most have been performed in the northern hemisphere with a focus on coastal meso-49 and eutrophic sites, or following nutrient addition at the start or during the experiments. 50 However, ocean provinces are very diverse (Longhurst et al., 1995) but around 60% of the 51 ocean is oligotrophic, an area that is expected to expand in the future (Polovina et al., 2008; 52 Irwin and Oliver, 2009). Yet, the impacts of ocean acidification on these regions are almost 53 unknown. Past community perturbation experiments were performed using various 54 approaches, from small bottle incubations  $(\leq 1 \text{ L})$  to large mesocosms ( $> 50,000 \text{ L}$ ), and over 55 different time scales (a few days to a few weeks). Mesocosms allow for the maintenance of 56 natural communities under close-to-natural conditions and the collection of sinking organic 57 matter (Riebesell et al., 2008; Riebesell et al., 2013). They therefore are attractive tools to 58 study the impact of ocean acidification on plankton community structure and functioning as 59 well as on organic matter export.

60 The European MedSeA project (http://medsea-project.eu) was launched in 2011 with 61 the objective to focus on the impacts of ocean acidification and warming in the Mediterranean 62 Sea. In this semi-enclosed sea, pH has decreased by 0.055 to 0.156 units from pre-industrial 63 to 2013, depending on the location (Hassoun et al., 2015). A further decrease of 0.24 to 0.46 64 units is projected for the end of the century (Goyet et al., 2016). The Mediterranean Sea is 65 characterised by low concentrations of nutrients and chlorophyll (The Mermex group, 2011). 66 Based on satellite-derived estimates, chlorophyll *a* concentrations exhibit low values (less



### 81 **2. Overview of the experimental set-up**

the Bay of Villefranche (France; Fig. 2) in winter (February-March 2013). The<br>nental set-up and mesocosm characteristics are described in Gazeau et al. (this issue-a)<br>for each experiment, nine 50 m<sup>3</sup> mesocosms (2.3 m in 82 Two experiments were conducted in the Northwestern Mediterranean Sea: the first 83 one, in the Bay of Calvi (Corsica, France; Fig. 2) in summer (June-July 2012), and the second 84 one in the Bay of Villefranche (France; Fig. 2) in winter (February-March 2013). The 85 experimental set-up and mesocosm characteristics are described in Gazeau et al. (this issue-a). 86 Briefly, for each experiment, nine  $50 \text{ m}^3$  mesocosms (2.3 m in diameter and 15 m deep; Fig. 87 3A) were deployed for 20 and 12 d in the Bay of Calvi and the Bay of Villefranche, 88 respectively. Once the bottom of the mesocosms was closed,  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  saturated seawater was 89 added to generate a  $pCO_2$  gradient across mesocosms ranging from ambient level to 1,250 90 µatm, with three control mesocosms (C1, C2 and C3) and six mesocosms with increasing 91 *p*CO<sub>2</sub> (P1 to P6). In the Bay of Calvi, the six *p*CO<sub>2</sub> levels were P1: 550, P2: 650, P3: 750, P4: 92 850, P5: 1000 and P6: 1250 µatm. In the Bay of Villefranche, the levels were P1: 450, P2: 93 550, P3: 750, P4: 850, P5: 1000 and P6: 1250 µatm. Mesocosms were grouped in clusters of 94 three with each cluster containing a control, a medium and a high  $pCO_2$  level (cluster 1: C1, 95 P1, P4; cluster 2: C2, P2, P5 and cluster 3: C3, P3, P6; Fig. 3B). Acidification of the 96 mesocosms was performed over 4 d by addition of various volumes of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ -saturated 97 seawater. Once the target  $pCO<sub>2</sub>$  levels were reached, the experiments started (day 0; 24 June 98 2012 and 22 February 2013 for the Bay of Calvi and the Bay of Villefranche, respectively). 99 No further  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  addition was performed and  $pCO<sub>2</sub>$  levels evolved in mesocosms driven by air-100 sea fluxes, temperature changes and net community production. Weather permitting, 101 conductivity-temperature-depth (CTD) casts were performed every day in each mesocosm as 102 well as in the ambient environment with a Sea-Bird Electronics (SBE) 19plusV2. Depth-103 integrated (0-10 m) samplings from the mesocosms and from the ambient environment were 104 performed daily using integrating water samplers, IWS (HYDRO-BIOS©). Sediment traps 105 located at the bottom end of the mesocosms were collected by SCUBA diving (daily in the

- 106 Bay of Calvi and every 2-3 d in the Bay of Villefranche) and a zooplankton net haul (200 µm
- 107 mesh size) was performed in each mesocosm at the end of the experiment, only in the Bay of
- 108 Calvi. While in the Bay of Calvi, the experiment lasted 20 d as scheduled, a storm irreversibly
- 109 damaged the bags on March  $7<sup>th</sup>$  in the Bay of Villefranche, and the experiment had to be
- 110 interrupted after 12 d. All data collected during the two experiments are openly available on
- 111 Pangaea, Bay of Calvi: http://doi.pangaea.de/10.1594/PANGAEA.810331 and Bay of
- 112 Villefranche: http://doi.pangaea.de/10.1594/PANGAEA.835117.

d the bags on March  $7^{\circ}$  in the Bay of Villefranche, and the experiment had to be order 12 d. All data collected during the two experiments are openly available on a, Bay of Calvi: <u>http://doi.pangaea.de/10.1594/PANGAE</u>

# 113 **3. Main results**





is could be detected in winter (Rees, unpublished data). During both experiments,<br>of carbon to the sediment traps was highest at the start of the experiments, and 5 times<br>a winter than in summer (Gazeau et al., this issue 163 the start of the experiment were replaced by slow-growing ones during the experiment as a 164 consequence of nutrient limitation (Maugendre et al., this issue-b). Nitrogen fixation appeared 165 to be an active metabolic process in summer (Rees et al., this issue) but no activity of 166 nitrifiers could be detected in winter (Rees, unpublished data). During both experiments, 167 export of carbon to the sediment traps was highest at the start of the experiments, and 5 times 168 larger in winter than in summer (Gazeau et al., this issue-b). 169 The main results with respect to the observed effects of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  enrichment are shown in 170 Table 3. The vast majority of parameters and processes which were investigated suggest an 171 overall resilience of the plankton community structure and function in both locations and 172 season. Gazeau et al. (this issue-b) showed that although few phytoplankton groups were 173 negatively or positively impacted by  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  enrichment in summer, their response remained 174 small with no consequence on total chlorophyll *a* concentrations, transparent exopolymeric 175 particle formation (data only available in the Bay of Villefranche; Bourdin et al., this issue) 176 and organic matter export (Gazeau et al., this issue-b). Similarly, scanning electron 177 microscopy reported by Oviedo et al. (this issue) did not highlight any change in the 178 abundance of coccolithophores and siliceous phytoplankton, and no change in size structure 179 which could have had an impact on sedimentation rates. As a result of such limited 180 modifications in the phytoplankton community structure, gross and net primary production 181 rates exhibited no apparent change in response to elevated  $pCO<sub>2</sub>$  (Maugendre et al., this issue-182 a; Maugendre et al. this issue-b). Bacterial production rates were negatively affected in 183 summer and several bacterial enzymatic activities responded to  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  enrichment, either 184 negatively or positively (Celussi et al., this issue). However, no consequences were observed 185 on community mineralisation rates (Maugendre et al., this issue-a). In winter (no data in 186 summer), viral abundances and replication cycles appeared uncorrelated to the imposed  $pCO<sub>2</sub>$ 187 conditions. Although there was no clear association between specific abundances of nitrifiers



nic communities in these different environmental settings. The second potential<br>tion of the discrepancies is related to the duration of the experiments. The two large in<br>socosm experiments performed in the Baltic Sea (Paul 213 experiment. Likewise, the concentration of chlorophyll during our summer experiment was 214 three times lower than the one observed by Sala et al. (2016) in summer. The much lower 215 nutrient availability during our experiments likely explains the contrasting responses of 216 planktonic communities in these different environmental settings. The second potential 217 explanation of the discrepancies is related to the duration of the experiments. The two large *in*  218 *situ* mesocosm experiments performed in the Baltic Sea (Paul et al., 2015; Bach et al., 2016) 219 were performed over significantly longer time scales ( $> 43$  d). Impacts of elevated CO<sub>2</sub> were 220 visible during the last phase when the plankton communities were relying on remineralised 221 nutrients. Our experiments did not exceed ~20 d (12 days for the winter experiment) and it is 222 likely that the build-up of remineralised nutrients did not reach concentrations large enough to 223 significantly relieve nutrient limitation.

#### 224 **4. Conclusion and perspectives**

reasonal hydrological regime. Nutrients are severely depleted in the surface layer<br>summer oligotrophic conditions characterized by strong thermal stratification. During<br>nixing events (January–February), nutrients are re-in 225 The Mediterranean Sea is a typical low-nutrient low-chlorophyll area which exhibits 226 large changes in nutrient concentrations in the illuminated surface waters that depend strongly 227 on the seasonal hydrological regime. Nutrients are severely depleted in the surface layer 228 during summer oligotrophic conditions characterized by strong thermal stratification. During 229 winter mixing events (January–February), nutrients are re-injected to the surface layer, 230 providing favourable conditions for a bloom initiation. Superimposed to these well-known 231 seasonal features is an important inter-annual variability (Marty et al., 2002; de Fommervault 232 et al., 2015). Short events driven by the atmosphere such as strong short wind events (i.e. 233 Andersen and Prieur, 2000) and sporadic atmospheric inputs (i.e. Pulido-Villena et al., 2010) 234 can lead to transient increase in nutrient concentrations impacting nutrient stocks and thus 235 likely biota and biogeochemical fluxes. Indeed, while a wind event can inject nutrients from 236 below by rapidly deepening the mixed layer depth (Andersen and Prieur, 2000), atmospheric 237 inputs such as Saharan dust events, biomass burning or intense rain events can bring new 238 nutrients to the surface of the water-column on short-time scales (The Mermex group, 2011, 239 and references therein). In some cases, both nutrients from below and above can also be 240 responsible of profound transient changes in nutrient dynamics and impact biota (Guieu et al., 241 2010). Nutrient availability is therefore a main control of ecosystem condition in the 242 Mediterranean Sea. The perturbation experiments reported in the present special issue show 243 no or low impact of ocean acidification on key biogeochemical processes, both in summer 244 and winter whereas the natural assemblage was highly dependent on nutrient availability. Our 245 summer *in situ* ocean acidification mesocosm experiment was representative of summer 246 conditions in the Northwestern Mediterranean Sea. The results appear solid regarding the 247 impact of ocean acidification on short time scale on the biogeochemistry of such oligotrophic 248 system. Caution should be exercised to interpret the results of the winter experiment because

mg of the experiment (including variable and low light availability) prevented the<br>tion of blooming conditions in the bags. Yet, the time of the year to perform this<br>tent was carefully chosen according to the 18-year time 249 the expected bloom conditions were not met, and important changes in nutrient availability 250 were observed during the acidification step leading to conditions inside the mesocosms that 251 were not representative of ambient conditions. Moreover, poor weather conditions at the 252 beginning of the experiment (including variable and low light availability) prevented the 253 stabilisation of blooming conditions in the bags. Yet, the time of the year to perform this 254 experiment was carefully chosen according to the 18-year time series both at Point B and 255 DYFAMED (Fig. 4). Unfortunately, this experiment is a good illustration that biological 256 activity in the Mediterranean Sea exhibits a large interannual variability and specific short-257 term events, such as blooms, are difficult to capture. 258 The mesocosm approach was a good tool in the case of the summer experiment. Yet, 259 considering the tenuous changes – or no change – observed at elevated  $pCO_2$ , a different 260 strategy would have helped refining our results. Rather than using a  $pCO<sub>2</sub>$  gradient over six 261 mesocosms, a triplicate treatment strategy taking into account two ocean acidification 262 scenarios could have been more appropriate to better quantify possible impacts. Based on 263 these observations, it appears that a large mesocosm pelagic approach may not be the ideal 264 strategy in the Mediterranean Sea – or any other truly oligotrophic system - since the impacts 265 expected will likely be low or non-existent irrespective of ambient conditions when the 266 mesocosms were filled. A land-based experimental device providing well controlled 267 environmental conditions (including light and temperature) would be more appropriate. 268 Indeed, as for the global ocean, the Mediterranean Sea has experienced a positive trend in 269 both sea surface and deep-water temperature (The Mermex group, 2011) and yet specific 270 studies assessing the combined effects of ocean warming and acidification on planktonic and 271 benthic primary production are scarce. Moreover, as mentioned above, atmospheric 272 deposition is an important source of new nutrients to the Mediterranean Sea which should also 273 be considered as an additional driver. Changes in seawater pH and temperature may affect the

274 bioavailability of some nutrients by altering their speciation as well as the adsorption/release

275 from/to particles.

- 276 A follow up of this project could thus be to work in very well controlled conditions of
- 277 *p*CO2, light, temperature and atmospheric deposition in large clean indoor containers (a small
- 278 version of the mesocosms currently under development at the Laboratoire d'Océanographie
- 279 de Villefranche) to investigate the impacts of atmospheric deposition under present and future
- $280$  *p*CO<sub>2</sub> and temperature conditions.

ight, temperature and atmospheric deposition in large clean indoor containers (a small<br>of the mesocosms currently under development at the Laboratoire d'Océanographie<br>franche) to investigate the impacts of atmospheric depo

#### 281 **5. Acknowledgements**

282 This work was funded by the EC FP7 project 'Mediterranean Sea Acidification in a changing

283 climate' (MedSeA; grant agreement 265103), the 'European Free Ocean Carbon Enrichment'

(eFOCE; BNP-Paribas Foundation), the MISTRALS-MERMEX program (Institut des de l'Univers, CNRS-INSU), the Corsican local authorities and the Rhone-<br>ranean and Corsica Water Agency (http://www.eaurmc.fr). It is a contributio 284 project (eFOCE; BNP-Paribas Foundation), the MISTRALS-MERMEX program (Institut des

285 Sciences de l'Univers, CNRS-INSU), the Corsican local authorities and the Rhone-

286 Mediterranean and Corsica Water Agency (http://www.eaurmc.fr). It is a contribution to the

287 Surface Ocean-Lower Atmosphere Study (SOLAS) and Integrated Marine Biogeochemistry

288 and Ecosystem Research (IMBER) projects. The STARESO marine station is gratefully

289 acknowledged for its superb assistance and boat support carried out within the framework of

290 the STARECAPMED project funded by the Rhone-Mediterranean and Corsica Water

291 Agency. Staff of the Observatoire Océanologique de Villefranche is gratefully acknowledged

292 for its assistance and boat support. Colleagues of the Laboratoire d'Océanographie de

293 Villefranche provided laboratory space. Thanks are due to J. Czerny, K. Schulz and U.

294 Riebesell for invaluable help regarding the experimental setup, B. Hesse, D. Luquet, D.

295 Robin, P. Mahacek and E. Cox are acknowledged for assistance with diving operations. L.

296 Guidi is acknowledged for his help with figure drawing. L. Coppola and L. Mousseau are

297 acknowledged for providing respectively DYFAMED (doi: 10.17882/43749) and Point B data

298 (SOMLIT: Service d'Observation en Milieu LITtoral). Finally, thanks are due to the MedSeA

299 mesocosms team for help during the experiments.

#### 300 **6. References**

- 301 Andersen, V., Prieur, L., 2000. One-month study in the open NW Mediterranean Sea 302 (DYNAPROC experiment, May 1995): overview of the hydrobiogeochemical structures 303 and effects of wind events. Deep-Sea Research Part I-Oceanographic Research Papers 304 47, 397-422.
- 305 Andersson, A.J., Mackenzie, F.T., Gattuso, J.-P., 2011. Effects of ocean acidification on 306 benthic processes, organisms, and ecosystems, in: Gattuso, J.-P., Hansson, L. (Eds.), 307 Ocean acidification. Oxford University Press, Oxford, pp. 122-153.
- 308 Bach, L.T., Taucher, J., Boxhammer, T., Ludwig, A., Achterberg, E.P., Algueró-Muñiz, M.,
- rd effects of wind events. Deep-Sea Research Part I-Oceanographic Research Pape<br>7, 397-422.<br>7, 397-422.<br>800, A.J., Mackenzie, F.T., Gattuso, J.-P., 2011. Effects of ocean acidification of<br>anthic processes, organisms, and e 309 Anderson, L.G., Bellworthy, J., Büdenbender, J., Czerny, J., Ericson, Y., Esposito, M., 310 Fischer, M., Haunost, M., Hellemann, D., Horn, H.G., Hornick, T., Meyer, J., Sswat, 311 M., Zark, M., Riebesell, U., The Kristineberg, K.C., 2016. Influence of Ocean 312 Acidification on a Natural Winter-to-Summer Plankton Succession: First Insights from 313 a Long-Term Mesocosm Study Draw Attention to Periods of Low Nutrient
- 314 Concentrations. Plos One 11, e0159068.
- 315 Ciais, P., Sabine, C., Bala, G., Bopp, L., Brovkin, V., Canadell, J., Chhabra, A., DeFries, R.,

316 Galloway, J., Heimann, M., Jones, C., Le Quéré, C., Myneni, R.B., Piao, S., Thornton,

- 317 P., 2013. Carbon and Other Biogeochemical Cycles, in: Stocker, T.F., Qin, D., Plattner,
- 318 G.-K., Tignor, M., Allen, S.K., Boschung, J., Nauels, A., Xia, Y., Bex, V., Midgley,
- 319 P.M. (Eds.), Climate Change 2013: The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of 320 Working Group I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on
- 321 Climate Change, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, United Kingdom and New 322 York, NY, USA.

- 323 Claustre, H., Kerherve, P., Marty, J.C., Prieur, L., Videau, C., Hecq, J.H., 1994. 324 Phytoplankton dynamics associated with a geostrophic front - ecological and 325 biogeochemical implications. Journal of Marine Research 52, 711-742.
- umervault, O.P., Migon, C., D'Ortenzio, F., d'Alcala, M.R., Coppola, L., 2015<br>
emporal variability of nutrient concentrations in the Northwestern Mediterranean Se<br>
DYFAMED time-series station). Deep-Sea Research Part I-Occ 326 de Fommervault, O.P., Migon, C., D'Ortenzio, F., d'Alcala, M.R., Coppola, L., 2015. 327 Temporal variability of nutrient concentrations in the Northwestern Mediterranean Sea 328 (DYFAMED time-series station). Deep-Sea Research Part I-Oceanographic Research
- 329 Papers 100, 1-12.
- 330 De La Rocha, C.L., Passow, U., 2007. Factors influencing the sinking of POC and the
- 331 efficiency of the biological carbon pump. Deep-Sea Research Part Ii-Topical Studies in 332 Oceanography 54, 639-658.
- 333 Falkowski, P.G., Barber, R.T., Smetacek, V., 1998. Biogeochemical controls and feedbacks 334 on ocean primary production. Science 281, 200-206.
- 335 Field, C.B., Behrenfeld, M.J., Randerson, J.T., Falkowski, P., 1998. Primary production of the 336 biosphere: integrating terrestrial and oceanic components. Science 281, 237-240.
- 337 Gattuso, J.-P., Hansson, L., 2011. Ocean acidification: background and history, in: Gattuso,
- 338 J.-P., Hansson, L. (Eds.), Ocean acidification. Oxford University Press, Oxford, pp. 1- 339 20.
- 340 Gattuso, J.P., Magnan, A., Bille, R., Cheung, W.W.L., Howes, E.L., Joos, F., Allemand, D.,
- 341 Bopp, L., Cooley, S.R., Eakin, C.M., Hoegh-Guldberg, O., Kelly, R.P., Poertner, H.O.,
- 342 Rogers, A.D., Baxter, J.M., Laffoley, D., Osborn, D., Rankovic, A., Rochette, J.,
- 343 Sumaila, U.R., Treyer, S., Turley, C., 2015. Contrasting futures for ocean and society 344 from different anthropogenic  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  emissions scenarios. Science 349, 45-+.
- 345 Goyet, C., Hassoun, A.E.R., Gemayel, E., Touratier, F., Saab, M.A.A., Guglielmi, V., 2016.
- 346 Thermodynamic forecasts of the Mediterranean Sea acidification. Mediterranean 347 Marine Science 17, 508-518.

- 348 Guieu, C., Dulac, F., Desboeufs, K., Wagener, T., Pulido-Villena, E., Grisoni, J.M., Louis, F.,
- 349 Ridame, C., Blain, S., Brunet, C., Nguyen, E.B., Tran, S., Labiadh, M., Dominici, J.M.,
- 350 2010. Large clean mesocosms and simulated dust deposition: a new methodology to 351 investigate responses of marine oligotrophic ecosystems to atmospheric inputs. 352 Biogeosciences 7, 2765-2784.
- 353 Hassoun, A.E., Gemayel, E., Krasakopoulou, E., Goyet, C., Saab, M.A.A., Guglielmi, V.,
- 354 Touratier, F., Falco, C., 2015. Acidification of the Mediterranean Sea from 355 anthropogenic carbon penetration. Deep-Sea Research Part I-Oceanographic Research 356 Papers 102, 1-15.
- 357 Irwin, A.J., Oliver, M.J., 2009. Are ocean deserts getting larger? Geophysical Research 358 Letters 36.
- 359 Longhurst, A., Sathyendranath, S., Platt, T., Caverhill, C., 1995. An estimate of global 360 primary production in the ocean from satellite radiometer data. Journal of Plankton 361 Research 17, 1245-1271.
- ion encode and minimic of marine of the encode and amospheric input<br>iogeosciences 7, 2765-2784.<br>
In, A.E., Genaryel, E., Krasakopoulou, E., Goyet, C., Saab, M.A.A., Guglielmi, V<br>
ouratier, F., Falco, C., 2015. Acidificatio 362 Marty, J.C., Chiaverini, J., Pizay, M.D., Avril, B., 2002. Seasonal and interannual dynamics 363 of nutrients and phytoplankton pigments in the western Mediterranean Sea at the 364 DYFAMED time-series station (1991-1999). Deep-Sea Research Part Ii-Topical Studies 365 in Oceanography 49, 1965-1985.
- 366 Mayot, N., D'Ortenzio, F., Ribera d'Alcalà, M., Lavigne, H., Claustre, H., 2016. Interannual 367 variability of the Mediterranean trophic regimes from ocean color satellites. 368 Biogeosciences 13, 1901-1917.
- 369 Paul, A.J., Bach, L.T., Schulz, K.G., Boxhammer, T., Czerny, J., Achterberg, E.P., 370 Hellemann, D., Trense, Y., Nausch, M., Sswat, M., Riebesell, U., 2015. Effect of 371 elevated CO2 on organic matter pools and fluxes in a summer Baltic Sea plankton 372 community. Biogeosciences 12, 6181-6203.

- 373 Polovina, J.J., Howell, E.A., Abecassis, M., 2008. Ocean's least productive waters are 374 expanding. Geophysical Research Letters 35.
- 375 Pulido-Villena, E., Rerolle, V., Guieu, C., 2010. Transient fertilizing effect of dust in P-376 deficient LNLC surface ocean. Geophysical Research Letters 37.
- 377 Riebesell, U., Bellerby, R.G.J., Grossart, H.P., Thingstad, F., 2008. Mesocosm CO<sup>2</sup> 378 perturbation studies: from organism to community level. Biogeosciences 5, 1157-1164.
- 379 Riebesell, U., Czerny, J., von Bröckel, K., Boxhammer, T., Büdenbender, J., Deckelnick, M.,
- 380 Fischer, M., Hoffmann, D., Krug, S.A., Lentz, U., Ludwig, A., Muche, R., Schulz,
- 381 K.G., 2013. Technical Note: A mobile sea-going mesocosm system new opportunities 382 for ocean change research. Biogeosciences 10, 1835-1847.
- 383 Riebesell, U., Gattuso, J.-P., 2015. Lessons learned from ocean acidification research. Nature 384 Climate Change 5, 12-14.
- : Ficient LNLC surface ocean. Geophysical Research Letters 37.<br>
III, U., Bellerby, R.G.J., Grossart, H.P., Thingstad, F., 2008. Mesocosm CC<br>
rturbution studies: from organism to community level. Biogeosciences 5, 1157-1164 385 Riebesell, U., Tortell, P.D., 2011. Effects of ocean acidification on pelagic organisms and 386 ecosystems, in: Gattuso, J.-P., Hansson, L. (Eds.), Ocean acidification. Oxford 387 University Press, Oxford, pp. 99-121.
- 388 Sala, M.M., Aparicio, F.L., Balagué, V., Boras, J.A., Borrull, E., Cardelús, C., Cros, L.,
- 389 Gomes, A., López-Sanz, A., Malits, A., Martínez, R.A., Mestre, M., Movilla, J.,
- 390 Sarmento, H., Vázquez-Domínguez, E., Vaqué, D., Pinhassi, J., Calbet, A., Calvo, E.,
- 391 Gasol, J.M., Pelejero, C., Marrasé, C., 2016. Contrasting effects of ocean acidification
- 392 on the microbial food web under different trophic conditions. ICES Journal of Marine 393 Science 73, 670-679.
- 394 The Mermex group, 2011. Marine ecosystems' responses to climatic and anthropogenic 395 forcings in the Mediterranean. Progress in Oceanography 91, 97-166.
- 396 Waters, C.N., Zalasiewicz, J., Summerhayes, C., Barnosky, A.D., Poirier, C., Gałuszka, A.,
- 397 Cearreta, A., Edgeworth, M., Ellis, E.C., Ellis, M., Jeandel, C., Leinfelder, R., McNeill,

- 398 J.R., Richter, D.d., Steffen, W., Syvitski, J., Vidas, D., Wagreich, M., Williams, M.,
- 399 Zhisheng, A., Grinevald, J., Odada, E., Oreskes, N., Wolfe, A.P., 2016. The
- 400 Anthropocene is functionally and stratigraphically distinct from the Holocene. Science
- MANUSCRIPT 401 351.
- 402

#### 403 **Figure legends**

- 404 Figure 1. A: world map showing the localisation of ocean acidification perturbation
- 405 experiments conducted on natural planktonic communities (see Table 1 and supplementary
- 406 material for the full list). Experiments considering only the effects of ocean acidification are
- 407 represented by a blue circle while experiments considering another stress (either ocean
- 408 warming, nutrient concentrations or lights levels) as additional factors are represented as a
- If for the full list). Experiments considering only the effects of ocean acidification are<br>nted by a blue circle while experiments considering another stress (either ocean<br>g, nutrient concentrations or lights levels) as a 409 pink triangle. B: cumulated number of studies focused on the effects of ocean acidification
- 410 (and sometimes another stress: ocean warming, nutrient or lights levels) on natural planktonic
- 411 communities. The years reported correspond to the date of the experiments.
- 412 Figure 2. Map showing the two study sites in France, the Bay of Calvi in Corsica and the Bay
- 413 of Villefranche on the French Riviera. The station DYFAMED (doi: 10.17882/43749) where
- 414 long-term data series are available is also show (see Fig. 4).
- 415 Figure 3. A: schematic view of the mesocosm used during these experiments. B: aerial view
- 416 of the grouping of mesocosms showing the location of the ambient (OUT) sampling. C:
- 417 measured and targeted  $pCO_2$  (in µatm) during the experiments in summer 2012 in the Bay of
- 418 Calvi and in winter 2013 in the Bay of Villefranche.
- Figure 4. A: annual distribution of chlorophyll *a* concentrations (in  $\mu$ g L<sup>-1</sup>) at the point B
- 420 station (BV: Bay of Villefranche; 43°41'N 7°19'E; SOMLIT; http://somlit.epoc.u-
- 421 bordeaux1.fr/), at the DYFAMED station (Dyf; see Fig. 2;  $43^{\circ}25'N 7^{\circ}52'E$ ;
- 422 doi: 10.17882/43749) and in the Bay of Calvi (BC; 42°35′N 08°44′E; Goffart et al., 2015).
- 423 The periods at which both experiments have been conducted are represented as white bars. B:
- 424 box-and-whisker plots of annual evolution (1997-2014) of nutrient (nitrate:  $NO_3$ , phosphate:
- 425  $PO_4^{3}$  and silicate: Si(OH), all in  $\mu$ mol L<sup>-1</sup>) in the Bay of Villefranche (BV; point B station;
- 426 43°41'N 7°19'E; SOMLIT; http://somlit.epoc.u-bordeaux1.fr/) and at the DYFAMED

- 427 station (Dyf; see Fig. 2; 43°25'N 7°52'E; doi: 10.17882/43749). Concentrations observed *in*
- 428 *situ* (OUT; empty red circles) and in the mesocosms (full red circles; average ± standard
- 429 deviations) are also shown.

MANUSCRIPT





















449 Table 3. Summary of main results and highlights obtained during the two experiments in summer 2012 in the Bay of Calvi and in winter 2013 in

450 the Bay of Villefranche. Green, red and grey boxes refer to, respectively, positive, negative and not detectable effects of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  enrichment.

451 Hatched boxes indicate that no data are available.







![](_page_33_Picture_244.jpeg)

![](_page_33_Picture_245.jpeg)

![](_page_34_Picture_235.jpeg)

![](_page_35_Picture_237.jpeg)

![](_page_36_Picture_224.jpeg)

![](_page_37_Picture_203.jpeg)

![](_page_38_Picture_208.jpeg)

![](_page_39_Picture_202.jpeg)

![](_page_40_Picture_204.jpeg)

![](_page_41_Picture_221.jpeg)

![](_page_42_Picture_217.jpeg)

![](_page_43_Picture_155.jpeg)

![](_page_44_Figure_1.jpeg)

![](_page_45_Figure_1.jpeg)

![](_page_46_Figure_1.jpeg)

MANUSCRIPT ACCEPTED

![](_page_47_Figure_1.jpeg)