

RH: Triassic temnospondyls from Tanzania and Zambia

Jean-Sébastien Steyer, Brandon R Peecook, Thomas Arbez, Sterling J Nesbitt, Steve Tolan, Michelle R Stocker, Roger M H Smith, Kenneth D Angielczyk, Christian A Sidor

► To cite this version:

Jean-Sébastien Steyer, Brandon R Peecook, Thomas Arbez, Sterling J Nesbitt, Steve Tolan, et al.. RH: Triassic temnospondyls from Tanzania and Zambia. Geodiversitas, 2021, 43 (12), 10.5252/geodiversitas2021v43a12. hal-03287993

HAL Id: hal-03287993 https://hal.sorbonne-universite.fr/hal-03287993v1

Submitted on 16 Jul 2021

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

New data on the Triassic temnospondyls from the Karoo rift basins of Tanzania and Zambia

Nouvelles données sur les temnospondyles triasiques des bassins du rift tanzanien et zambien

RH: Triassic temnospondyls from Tanzania and Zambia

J.-Sébastien STEYER^{1*}, Brandon R. PEECOOK², Thomas ARBEZ¹, Sterling J. NESBITT³, Steve TOLAN⁴, Michelle R. STOCKER³, Roger M. H. SMITH⁵, Kenneth D. ANGIELCZYK², Christian A. SIDOR⁶

¹Centre de Recherches en Paléontologie de Paris (CR2P), UMR 7207, CNRS-MNHN-SU, Muséum national d'Histoire naturelle CP38, 8 rue Buffon, 75005 Paris, France, jeansebastien.steyer@mnhn.fr, thomas.arbez@edu.mnhn.fr;

²Integrative Research Center, Field Museum of Natural History, 1400 South Lake Shore

Drive, Chicago, Illinois 60605, USA, peecbran@isu.edu, kangielczyk@fieldmuseum.org;

³Department of Geosciences, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, Blacksburg,

Virginia 24061, USA, sjn2104@vt.edu and stockerm@vt.edu;

⁴Chipembele Wildlife Education Centre, Mfuwe, Zambia, <u>info@chipembele.org;</u>

⁵Department of Geosciences, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg and Iziko South African Museum, Cape Town, South Africa, roger.smith4@wits.ac.za;

⁶Department of Biology and Burke Museum, University of Washington, Seattle, Washington, 98195, USA, <u>casidor@uw.edu</u>

* Corresponding author, J.-Sébastien Steyer

Abstract

Temnospondyl specimens collected recently in the Middle-?Late Triassic of the Ruhuhu (Tanzania) and Luangwa (Zambia) rift basins are described and figured. They are attributed to cf. *Cherninia megarhina* (Chernin & Cosgriff, 1975), Mastodonsauroidea indet., Stereospondyli indet., and cf. Stereospondyli., and they comprise intercentra of small adult individual(s) which may belong to a new taxon. Although fragmentary, this new material allows taxonomic updates to the Triassic temnospondyl assemblages of Tanzania and Zambia and documents an interesting phylogenetic and ecological diversity. For example, among the Triassic mastodonsauroids of Zambia, *Cherninia megarhina* coexisted with *Stanocephalosaurus pronus* (Howie, 1970) in nonmarine environments. Similar to that of the South African Karoo Basin, these temnospondyl assemblages also illustrate the rapid recovery of the group after the Permian-Triassic mass extinction and contribute to a better understanding of the impact of this extinction on the tetrapod faunas of southern Pangea. **Keywords**—Amphibia, Karoo System, Permo-Triassic extinction, extinction recovery

Résumé

Des restes de temnospondyles découverts récemment dans le Trias Moyen- ?Supérieur des bassins de Ruhuhu (Tanzanie) et Luangwa (Zambie) sont décrits et figurés ici. Ils sont attribués à cf. *Cherninia megarhina* (Chernin & Cosgriff, 1975), Stereospondyli indet., et cf. Stereospondyli, et regroupent notamment de petits intercentres d'individu(s) adulte(s) qui pourraient correspondre à un nouveau taxon. Ces découvertes, bien que fragmentaires, permettent de mettre à jour les assemblages des temnospondyles de Tanzanie et Zambie et montrent une intéressante diversité aussi bien phylogénétique qu'écologique : par exemple, concernant les mastodonsauroïdes du Trias de Zambie, *Cherninia megarhina* a co-existé avec *Stanocephalosaurus pronus* (Howie, 1970) dans les environnements non-marins. Comparable à celui du Bassin du Karoo d'Afrique du Sud, ces assemblages illustrent la reconquête du groupe après l'extinction en masse du Permien-Trias et permettent une meilleure compréhension de l'impact de cette crise sur les faunes de tétrapodes du sud de la Pangée. **Mots-clefs**—Amphibia, Système Karoo, extinction permo-triasique, reconquête post-crise

Introduction

The Karoo System consists of several Carboniferous-Triassic basins in southern and eastern Africa (Catuneanu et al. 2005), including the main Karoo foreland basin of South Africa, and the Ruhuhu and Luangwa rift basins of Tanzania and Zambia respectively (Fig. 1). The South African Karoo Basin has been the subject of intensive research for over 150 years (see historical reviews in Kitching 1977; Day 2013), and it now occupies a foundational position in our understanding of Permo-Triassic terrestrial paleontology and biostratigraphy. However, work on the Ruhuhu and Luangwa basins has been much more sporadic. Beginning in 2007, our research group has worked to expand the available data from Tanzania and Zambia with the goal of gaining an improved understanding of the impact of the Permo-Triassic mass extinction on tetrapod communities across southern Pangea (Sidor & Nesbitt 2018). During the course of our ongoing fieldwork in the east African rift basins we have discovered numerous Triassic tetrapods that provide key insights into the evolutionary history of specific clades (e.g., Nesbitt et al. 2010, 2017) as well as new information on how terrestrial ecosystems recovered from the Permo-Triassic extinction in this region (Sidor et al. 2013; Roopnarine et al. 2018). Among our newly-collected material are the remains of temnospondyl amphibians.

Historically, Molyneux (1908) described the first temnospondyl specimens from the region that now includes Tanzania and Zambia. Subsequent fieldwork in the 1930s, 1960s, and 1970s by various geologists and paleontologists resulted in the collection of additional material (e.g., Haughton 1932; Nowack 1937; Drysdall & Kitching 1963; Attridge et al. 1964; Kemp 1975). Three temnospondyl taxa have been described from the Triassic Lifua Member of the Manda Beds (Ruhuhu Basin) and the upper portion of the Ntawere Formation (Luangwa Basin) (Fig. 1): the mastodonsauroids *Cherninia megarhina* (Chernin & Cosgriff, 1975) Damiani, 2001a and *Stanocephalosaurus pronus* (Howie, 1970), and the brachyopid

Batrachosuchus concordi Chernin, 1977. These Tanzanian and Zambian formations have been biostratigraphically correlated with the *Cynognathus* Assemblage Zone of the South African Karoo Basin, and may be of Anisian–Carnian age (Battail 1993; Hancox 2000; Kammerer et al. 2019; Nelsen et al. 2001; Peecook et al. 2018; Smith et al. 2018).

Here we describe, figure, and compare our newly-collected temnospondyl material from the Triassic of the Luangwa and Ruhuhu basins. We also update the composition of Triassic temnospondyl assemblages from Tanzania and Zambia, and compare them with that of the South African Karoo Basin in the context of the recovery from the Permo-Triassic mass extinction.

Institutional Abbreviations—BP, Evolutionary Studies Institute (formerly Bernard Price Institute for Palaeontological Research), Johannesburg, South Africa; NHCC, National Heritage Conservation Commission, Lusaka, Zambia; NHMUK, Natural History Museum, London; NMT, National Museum of Tanzania, Dar es Salam, Tanzania.

SYSTEMATIC PALEONTOLOGY

TEMNOSPONDYLI Zittel, 1888

STEREOSPONDYLOMORPHA (Zittel, 1887) Yates & Warren, 2000

CF. STEREOSPONDYLI

(Figs. 2–3)

Tanzanian Referred Material—NMT RB464–468 (Fig. 2), five small thoracic intercentra (anteroposterior length of 3.6-5.7 mm) from Locality Z90, mid- to upper Lifua Member, Manda Beds, Middle-?Late Triassic (e.g., Nelsen et al. 2001; Smith et al. 2018) of the Ruhuhu Basin.

Zambian Referred Material—NHCC LB 647, 679–687 (Fig. 3 and Peecook et al. 2018: fig. 4D-E), 10 small atlantal intercentra (L = 4.2 to 8.5 mm); NHCC LB688–689, two corresponding axes; and NHCC LB690–728, 39 small thoracic intercentra; all from Locality L82, upper horizon of the Ntawere Formation, Middle-?Late Triassic (e.g., Battail 1993; Hancox 2000; Peecook et al. 2018) of the upper Luangwa Basin (sensu Barbolini et al. 2016).

Description (see also Peecook et al. 2018)—All these vertebral elements are fully ossified.

The thoracic intercentra are well preserved, except NMT RB467, which looks anteriorly slightly compressed (Fig. 2). These intercentra are subcylindrical and closed dorsally into a stereospondylous condition. They are subcircular in anterior and posterior views, and subrectangular in lateral view (with a height/length ratio of around 1). Their external surfaces show small ridges and grooves. Anteriorly and posteriorly, notochordal pits are visible, but they do not pass through the whole vertebral bodies. Dorsally, facets for the attachment of the neural arch are also preserved.

The atlantal intercentra (Fig. 3 and Peecook et al. 2018: fig. 4) are relatively wide (l = 6.3 to 11.1 mm) and flat (h = 5 mm max). Their anterior side is biconcave to articulate with the exoccipital condyles, whereas their posterior side is concave. Their dorsal side presents a longitudinal groove for the neural canal.

Both the Tanzanian and Zambian intercentra were found associated with abundant silesaurid (~ thousands of elements in Tanzania) and rare cynodont remains.

Identification—Based on their strong degree of ossification the Tanzanian and Zambian intercentra belong to adult individuals (e.g., Steyer 2000). Their identification beyond Temnospondyli, possibly Stereospondyli, is difficult given that they were found as isolated elements and not associated with more diagnostic material (e.g., skull elements). Moreover, concerning the atlantes, these elements are rare in the temnospondyl fossil record

and therefore difficult to assign. The stereospondylous condition of all these intercentra is also found among disparate clades of temnospondyls, including the tupilakosaurids (e.g., *Thabanchuia* Warren, 1998), metoposaurids, plagiosaurids, and mastodonsaurids (e.g., Yates & Warren 2000). The Tanzanian and Zambian intercentra are anteroposteriorly elongate, as is the case in metoposaurid stereospondyls (e.g., Hunt 1993; Gee & Parker 2018; Buffa et al. 2019; Fortuny et al. 2019). However, this is only one character state, and the shape and proportions of the intercentra vary along a single vertebral column within temnospondyls. Therefore, we conservatively assign the specimens to "cf. Stereospondyli". Interestingly, these intercentra belong to small but adult individual(s) and clearly differ from the large, dorsally open intercentra of other temnospondyls from the same rock units (see below). They may correspond to a new small-bodied taxon but we prefer to leave this issue undecided, pending the discovery of additional material.

STEREOSPONDYLI Zittel, 1888

(Fig. 4)

Zambian Referred Material—NHCC LB678 (Fig. 4 and Peecook et al. 2018: fig. 4A-C), a partial right mandible of a small-sized, but adult, individual based on the welldeveloped ornamentation visible on its labial side (e.g., Steyer 2000) (Fig. 4A). The specimen was found by one of us (SJN) in 2014 together with small cylindrical vertebrae similar to NHCC LB690–728.

Locality and Horizon—Locality L290 near the village of Sitwe, upper horizon of the Ntawere Formation, Middle-?Late Triassic (e.g., Battail 1993; Hancox 2000; Peecook et al. 2018) of the upper Luangwa Basin (sensu Barbolini et al. 2016).

Description (see also Peecook et al. 2018)—This small mandibular portion (29 mm in length) preserves three partial bones; a dentary labially and dorsally (d, Figs. 4A–B), and two

coronoids lingually and dorsally (cor1 and cor2, Figs. 4B–C). The partial dentary is wellornamented, and its ornamentation pattern consists of interconnected pits of various sizes. It bears at least 12 marginal tooth sockets, which are slightly laterally compressed (a stereospondyl synapomorphy; e.g., Yates & Warren 2000). The socket Nr. 8 still preserves a partial tooth with its medullar cavity. The two partial coronoids are covered by dense and well-separated denticle patches (~ 3 teeth per mm²). These denticles are conical, short (<1 mm), and taper to a sharp point. These denticle patches are separated by a depression in the posterior region of the specimen that is visible lingually. The anterior patch is complete and covers most of the length of the specimen. It is supported by the better-preserved coronoid (cor1, Figs. 4B–C). The other denticle patch and its corresponding coronoid (cor2, Figs. 4B– C) are partially preserved and only visible in the posterior extremity of the specimen. Due to the fragmentary nature of the specimen, it is not clear if these elements represent pre-, interor post-coronoids.

Identification—We identify this specimen as a stereospondyl based on the laterally compressed tooth sockets as well as the stereospondyl synapomorphy of a dentary that does not contribute substantially to the lingual side of the mandible (the dentary is clearly visible in lingual view in basal temnospondyls; e.g., Schoch & Milner 2000). It is difficult to assign a more precise identification because three stereospondyl clades have very dense denticle patches on at least two of their coronoids: the Rhinesuchidae, the Lydekkerinidae, and the Rhytidosteidae (e.g., *Mahavisaurus dentatus*, Maganuco et al. 2014: figs. 8–9). Pending more discoveries, we therefore prefer to assign this fragmentary specimen to Stereospondyli.

MASTODONTOSAUROIDEA Lydekker, 1885 (sensu Damiani, 2001b)

(Figs. 5-6)

Zambian Referred Material—Large postcranial elements studied in 2015 by one of us (BRP) in the historical collections of the NHMUK, and labeled as 'cf. *Parotosuchus*' (Fig. 5): NHMUK R10271, a huge partial interclavicle of nearly ½ meter breadth (Fig. 5A); NHMUK R10272-R10273, two very large intercentra of 130 x 80 x 40 mm (Fig. 5B-C); NHMUK R10274, a partial right scapulocoracoid (Fig. 5D); and NHMUK R10275, a right complete ilium (Fig. 5E).

Locality and Horizon—These specimens were collected in 1963 by Alan Charig and colleagues (Attridge et al. 1964) at Locality 15 of Drysdall & Kitching (1963), about 6 km west of the village of Sitwe, upper horizon of the Ntawere Formation, Middle-?Late Triassic (Peecook et al. 2018) of the upper Luangwa Basin (sensu Barbolini et al. 2016).

Description—All the elements are fully ossified, robust and very large: they therefore belong to adult individual(s). The partial interclavicle NHMUK R10271 (Fig. 5A) bears radiating ridges and deep grooves on its ventral side. Most of the ridges are eroded, which suggests that this bone has been strongly weathered. Unfortunately, the margins of this interclavicle are not preserved, preventing a more precise assignment. The intercentra NHMUK R10272-R10273 (Fig. 5B-C) are crescentic, but with relatively low and short lateral flanks. The limited lateral flanks suggest a relatively reduced notochordal canal. The bone surfaces are relatively rugose, probably for contact with the cartilaginous intervertebral disks. The parapophyses are not well developed. The partial right scapulocoracoid NHMUK R10274 (Fig. 5D) is also massive and robust. Although only its central part is preserved, the typical fan shape is recognizable, with the supraglenoid fossa visible in lateral view. The supraglenoid fossa is oval in shape and very large compared with the width of the mid-shaft. It turns inside into the supraglenoid foramen. Lateral to the supraglenoid fossa, a small expansion of the bone could correspond to the scapular tubercle but its preservation is not sufficient to confirm this identification. The complete right ilium NHMUK R10275 (Fig. 5E)

is well preserved. In lateral view, its dorsal iliac process is high and slightly widens dorsally. The supracetabular buttress is well pronounced ventrolaterally, even though its surface is relatively weathered.

Identification—These elements were labeled as 'cf. *Parotosuchus*' in the NHMUK historical collections, probably because they are very large and robust, and only *Parotosuchus* (Damiani, 2001b) was known as a unique giant Triassic temnospondyl in the 1960s, when they were discovered. However, none *Parotosuchus* diagnostic character has been observed on this postcranial material: we therefore prefer to broaden its assignment to Mastodonsauroidea.

Tanzanian Referred Material—NMT RB537 (Fig. 6), a very large and robust intercentrum (132 x 88 x 43 mm) found isolated by one of us (SJN) in 2007 at the locality Z30, near the village of Gingama, in the grey siltstones of the Lifua Member, Manda Beds, Middle-?Late Triassic (e.g., Nelsen et al. 2001; Smith et al. 2018) of the Ruhuhu Basin.

Description—NMT RB537 (Fig. 6A, B) is crescentic, with a reduced anteroposterior length (43 mm) compared to its height (88 mm). Its parapophyses are located posteriorly suggesting an attribution to a stereospondyl (e.g., Warren & Snell 1991; Witzmann & Schoch 2006). Compared with other stereospondyl taxa, this intercentrum is very robust, with large elevated flanks drawing dorsally the base of the central tube for the notochordal canal. This character is typical of the neorachitomous pattern (e.g., Watson 1919). The parapophyses are well separated from the rest of the vertebral element. Together with the strong degree of ossification of the intercentrum, this suggests that this element belongs to an adult individual (e.g., Steyer 2000). Its ventral, anterior, and posterior surfaces are very rugose. The latter two surfaces show a subcircular rugose zone for the contact with the cartilaginous intervertebral disks. The subcircular ventral side of the intercentrum, as well as the dorsal position and

subtriangular shape of its parapophyses, suggests that this element was originally positioned between the middle and the posterior end of the presacral column. More precisely, the height of the parapophyses relative to the height of the intercentrum in lateral view suggests a rather posterior presacral element, by comparison with the vertebral columns of *Paracyclotosaurus davidi* Watson, 1958 and *Mastodonsaurus giganteus* Jaeger, 1828 (respectively Watson 1958; Schoch 1999). The lateral expansions or "winglets" of the intercentrum suggest a relatively reduced notochordal canal. The ventral side of the intercentrum is wider than long. The parapophyses are entirely dorsally located on the corpus of the bone (not laterally and in between two intercentra).

One of us (TA) produced a µCT-scan of NMT RB537 at AST-RX (MNHN) (Fig. 6C). The radiographic image shows two inner zones: a large, dense and dark central zone transitioning relatively abruptly into a lighter peripheral zone. The abrupt transition between the two zones may correspond to a volume of decreasing or arrested growth (VAG, i.e., the 3D equivalent of an annulus or a line of arrested growth in 2D). The strong density of the central zone, if of biological origin, suggests osteosclerosis, a common phenomenon observed in giant temnospondyls (Schoch 2012). In this case, the central zone limited by the VAG corresponds to the juvenile shape of the intercentrum. If this strong density is of taphonomical origin, the central zone is therefore the medullar zone whose spongiose structure was infilled by dense minerals. In this interpretation, the peripheral zone is the cortical zone composed of endosteal bone. Reduced but localized black patches are also visible in the lateral regions of the intercentrum: they are interpreted as hypermineralized zones or inclusions.

Identification—The proportions of the bone and comparisons with other taxa in which intercentra are known (e.g., Howie 1970; Schoch 1999; Pawley 2006) suggest an individual of about 4 m in total body length. However, because of the lack of diagnostic characters visible on this intercentrum and the high variability of the shape of the intercentra

along a single vertebral column (e.g., Schoch, 1999), we prefer to broaden its assignment to Mastodonsauroidea.

MASTODONTOSAURIDAE Lydekker, 1885 (sensu Damiani, 2001b)

CF. CHERNINIA MEGARHINA (Chernin & Cosgriff, 1975) Damiani, 2001a

(Fig. 7)

Zambian Referred Material—NHCC LB676, a partial but elongate left dentary of an adult individual based on its well-developed ornamentation (e.g., Steyer 2000). It was found by one of us (ST) in 2007, associated with many specimens of the bivalve *Unio karooensis* Cox, 1932.

Locality and Horizon—Locality L66 near the village of Sitwe, upper horizon of the Ntawere Formation, Middle-?Late Triassic (e.g., Battail 1993; Hancox 2000; Peecook et al. 2018) of the upper Luangwa Basin (sensu Barbolini et al. 2016).

Description—This partial dentary corresponds to the anterior half of the element. Its face is weathered with many broken teeth alongside their sockets, but it is not deformed by compaction. Its bears at least 50 laterally compressed teeth or tooth sockets. In lingual view (Fig. 7A), the dentary is elongate (L = 380 mm) and naturally shallow (h = 61 mm max). In dorsal view (Fig. 7B), its anterior extremity is strongly curved and semi-circular, with a well-developed symphyseal region. The symphyseal region bears two large partial tusks and is expanded posteriorly, with an elongate symphyseal suture (59 mm).

Identification—Laterally compressed teeth are a stereospondyl synapomorphy (e.g., Yates & Warren 2000), whereas an elongate symphyseal suture is a common feature in Mastodonsauridae (e.g., Damiani 2001b). The semi-circular curvature of the dentary in dorsal view, together with its very large size, suggests a possible attribution of this specimen to

Cherninia megarhina. This taxon is characterized by a very large skull and a semi-circular snout (Chernin 1974; Damiani 2001a), and the proportions and shape match those of NHCC LB676. Moreover, the type material of *C. megarhina* (BP/1/4223, a partial skull) was collected in the same region from time-equivalent strata (the type locality is "Locality 15" of Drysdall & Kitching 1963, also near the village of Sitwe). However, because the mandible of *C. megarhina* described by Chernin (1978) does not belong to the type material, we cautiously assign NHCC LB676 to "cf. *Cherninia megarhina*".

DISCUSSION

In addition to the newly referred material described above, the following temnospondyl taxa are known from the Triassic of Tanzania and Zambia. First, *Stanocephalosaurus pronus* is represented by several partial skulls from the Middle-?Late Triassic of both Tanzania (Lifua Member, Manda Beds, Ruhuhu Basin; Howie 1970) and Zambia (upper horizon of the Ntawere Formation; Chernin 1974). Second, the brachyopid *Batrachosuchus concordi* is represented by a partial skull (holotype BP/1/3728) from Locality 15 of Drysdall & Kitching 1963 (also the type locality of *Cherninia megarhina*, see above), near the village of Sitwe, upper horizon of the Ntawere Formation, Middle-?Late Triassic of the upper Luangwa Basin, Zambia (Chernin 1977).

The new material described here is fragmentary but the small unusual intercentra from the Tanzanian Z90 and Zambian L82 localities could belong to a new taxon or taxa (see above). This material allows the Triassic temnospondyl faunas of the Ruhuhu and Luangwa basins to be updated. Interestingly, *S. pronus* occurs in Zambia and Tanzania, whereas *C. megarhina* is only known in Zambia. Both *S. pronus* and *C. megarhina* therefore coexisted in

Zambia but are not sister taxa (although relatively close; e.g., Schoch 2008; Eltink et al. 2016), suggesting phylogenetic diversity in the temnospondyl assemblage. Ecologically, *S. pronus* may have shared the same aquatic paleoenvironment with *C. megarhina*, yet probably not the same ecological niche as deduced by the morphology of the two species.

During Cynognathus Assemblage zone times, the South African Karoo Basin hosted a diverse temnospondyl assemblage: Batrachosuchus, Vanastega Damiani & Kitching, 2003, Xenotosuchus (Broom, 1909), Paracyclotosaurus, and Microposaurus Haughton, 1925 from the ?Anisian (subzones B or C of the Cynognathus Assemblage Zone; Damiani & Rubidge 2003); and possibly Laidleria Kitching, 1957, Rhytidosteus Owen, 1884, Bathignathus (Haughton, 1925), Jammerbergia Damiani & Hancox, 2003, and Parotosuchus Broili & Schröder, 1937 from the ?Olenekian and/or ?Anisian (uncertain subzone of the Cynognathus Assemblage Zone; Damiani & Rubidge 2003). Consequently, *Batrachosuchus*, Paracyclotosaurus and their relatives occured across much of western Gondwana, and all these Karoo basins (South Africa, Tanzania and Zambia) hosted a mixture of endemic and cosmopolitan Triassic temnospondyls. A mixture of endemic and broadly distributed temnospondyls also characterizes the Cynognathus Assemblage Zone-equivalent rocks in Antarctica (Sidor et al. 2007; Sidor et al. 2008; Sidor et al. 2014). The reasons underlying the greater diversity of the South African assemblage are unclear. The difference may reflect the larger size and greater sampling intensity of the Karoo (e.g., see Roopnarine et al. 2018 for a discussion of sampling effects on Permian Luangwa and Ruhuhu Basin tetrapod assemblages). Likewise, recent radiometric dating of sediments that have been biostratigraphically correlated with the Cynognathus Assemblage Zone and new fossil discoveries have raised questions about the ages of these assemblages and whether they all were truly contemporary (e.g., Ottone et al. 2014; Liu et al. 2018; Marsicano et al. 2016; Peecook et al. 2018; Kammerer et al. 2019). Also recent radiometric dating of the Tashinga

Formation of Zimbabwe give a Late Triassic age for this Zimbabwean part of the Karoo Supergroup, in which interestingly temnospondyl and phytosaur remains have been found (Barrett et al., in press). This raises the possibility that the South African, Tanzanian, and Zambian temnospondyl assemblages differ because they are not of the same age. If the observed differences are real and not a result of one of these potential biases, they would be further evidence for regional differences in the process of recovery from the Permo-Triassic mass extinction in southern Gondwana (Sidor et al. 2013; Steyer et al. 2015; Roopnarine et al. 2018; Tarailo 2018).

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We thank C. Beightol (University of Washington and Burke Museum), W. Simpson (Field Museum of Natural History), R. Whatley (Columbia College Chicago), N. J. Tabor and T. S. Myers (Southern Methodist University, Dallas), L. Tsuji (University of Toronto), N. Barbolini (Evolutionary Studies Institute, Johannesburg), A. Tibaijuka and L. H. Nampunju (Antiquities Division, Ministry of Natural Resources and Tourism, Dar es Salaam), J. Museba and K. Mwamulowe (NHCC, Kasama and Lusaka, respectively, Zambia), A. Goulding (Wildlife and Environmental Conservation Society of Zambia) and J. Menke for field assistance; and L. Cazes (CR2P, Paris) for the photos. BRP thanks P. Barrett and L. Steel (NHMUK, London), Z. Erasmus and R. M. H. Smith (SAM, Cape Town), and T. Kemp (Oxford) for collection help and access. This work has been supported by the grants NGS 8571-08 (to JSS), NGS 8962-11, NSF EAR-1337569 (to CAS), NSF EAR-1337291 (to KDA and SJN), NSF Doctoral Dissertation Improvement Grant (to BRP), and CR2P/UMR 7207 regular credits (to JSS and TA). We thank J. Fortuny (ICP, Barcelona) and R. Werneburg (Schleusingen Museum) for their constructive reviews, and the editor E. Cotez (MNHN) for his remarks. The first author dedicates this work to Jean-Claude Rage who was his Master's degree and

LITERATURE CITED

- ATTRIDGE J., BALL H., CHARIG A. & COX C. B. 1964. The BMNH/University of London joint palaeontological expedition to Northern Rhodesia and Tanganyika 1963. *Nature* 201:445-449.
- BARBOLINI N., BAMFORD M. K. & TOLAN S. 2016. Permo-Triassic palynology and palaeobotany of Zambia; a review. *Palaeontologia Africana* 50:18-30.
- BARRETT P. M., SCISCIO L., VIGLIETTI P. A., BRODERICK T. J., SUAREZ C. A., SHARMAN G. R., JONES A. S., MUNYIKWA D., EDWARDS S. F., CHAPELLE K. E. J., DOLLMAN K. N., ZONDO M. & CHOINIERE J. N. In press (2020). — The age of the Tashinga Formation (Karoo Supergroup) in the Mid-Zambezi Basin, Zimbabwe and the first phytosaur from sub-Saharan Africa. *Gondwana Research*, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gr.2019.12.008
- BATTAIL B. 1993. On the biostratigraphy of Triassic therapsid-bearing formation. New Mexico Museum of Natural History & Science Bulletin 3:31-35.
- BROILI R. & SCHRÖDER J. 1937. Beobachtungen an Wirbeltieren der Karrooformation. XXV. Über Micropholis Huxley. XXVI. Über Lydekkerina Broom. Sitzungsberichte Der Bayerischen Akademie Der Wissenschaften, Mathematisch-Naturwissenschaftliche Abteilung:19-57.
- BROOM R. 1909. Notice of some new South African fossil amphibians and reptiles. *Annals* of the South African Museum 7:270-278.
- BUFFA V., JALIL N.-E. & STEYER J.-S. 2019. Redescription of *Arganasaurus* (*Metoposaurus*) azerouali (Dutuit) comb. nov. from the Upper Triassic of the Argana

Basin (Morocco) and the first phylogenetic analysis of the Metoposauridae (Amphibia, Temnospondyli). *Papers in Palaeontology* 2019:1-19.

- CATUNEANU O., WOPFNER H., ERIKSSON P. G., CAIRNCROSS B., RUBIDGE B. S., SMITH R. M. H. & HANCOX P. J. 2005. The Karoo basins of south-central Africa. *Journal of African Earth Sciences* 43:211-253.
- CHERNIN S. 1974. Capitosaurid amphibians from the Upper Luangwa Valley, Zambia. Palaeontologia Africana 17:29-55.
- CHERNIN S. 1978. Three capitosaurs from the Triassic of South Africa: Parotosuchus africanus (Broom 1909); Kestrosaurus dreyeri Haughton 1925, and Parotosuchus dirus sp. nov. Palaeontologia Africana 21:79-100.
- CHERNIN S. & COSGRIFF J. W. 1975. Further consideration of the capitosaurids from the Upper Luangwa Valley, Zambia. *Palaeontologia Africana* 18:143-148.
- COHEN K. M., FINNEY S. C., GIBBARD P. L. & FAN J.-X. 2013. The ICS International Chronostratigtraphic Chart. *Episodes* 36:199-204.
- Cox L. R. 1932. Lamellibranchia from the Karroo Beds of the Ruhuhu coalfields,
 Tanganyika Territory. *Quaterly Journal of the Geological Society of London* 88:623-633.
- DAMIANI R. J. 2001a. Cranial anatomy of the giant Middle Triassic Temnospondyl
 Cherninia megarhina and a review of feeding in Mastodonsaurids. *Palaeontologia Africana* 37:41-52.
- DAMIANI R. J. 2001b. A systematic revision and phylogenetic analysis of Triassic mastodonsauroids (Temnospondyli, Stereospondyli). Zoological Journal of the Linnean Society 133:379-499.

- DAMIANI R. J. & HANCOX P. J. 2003. New mastodonsauroid temnospondyls from the Cynognathus assemblage zone (upper Beaufort group; Karoo Basin) of South Africa. Journal of Vertebrate Paleontology 23:54-66.
- DAMIANI R. J. & KITCHING J. W. 2003. A new brachyopid temnospondyl from the Cynognathus assemblage zone, upper Beaufort group, South Africa. Journal of Vertebrate Paleontology 69:57-69.
- DAMIANI R. J. & RUBIDGE B. S. 2003. A review of the South African temnospondyl amphibian record. *Palaeontologia Africana* 39:21-36.
- DAY M. O. 2013. Charting the fossils of the Great Karoo: a history of tetrapod
 biostratigraphy in the Lower Beaufort Group, South Africa. *Palaeontologia Africana* 48:41-47.
- DRYSDALL A. R. & KITCHING J. W. 1963. A re-examination of the Karroo succession and fossil localities of part of the upper Luangwa Valley. *Memoirs of the Geological Survey Department of Northern Rhodesia, Lusaka* 1:1-62.
- ELTINK E., DA-ROSA A. A. S. & DIAS-DA-SILVA S. 2016. A capitosauroid from the Lower Triassic of South America (Sang do Cabral Supersequence: Paraná Basin), its phylogenetic relationships and biostratigraphic implications. *Historical Biology*, <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/08912963.2016.1255736</u>
- FORTUNY J., ARBEZ T., MUJAL E. & STEYER J.-S. 2019. Reappraisal of 'Metoposaurus hoffmani' Dutuit, 1978, and description of new temnospondyl specimens from the Middle-Late Triassic of Madagascar (Morondava Basin). Journal of Vertebrate Paleontology, https://doi.org/10.1080/02724634.2019.1576701
- GEE B. M., PARKER W. G. & MARSH A. D. 2018. Redescription of *Anaschisma* (Temnospondyli: Metoposauridae) from the Late Triassic of Wyoming and the

phylogeny of the Metoposauridae. *Journal of Systematic Paleontology*, doi: 10.1080/14772019.2019.1602855.

- HANCOX P. J. 2000. The continental Triassic of South Africa. Zentralblatt für Geologie und Paläontologie Teil 1 1998:1285–1324.
- HAUGHTON S. H. 1925. Investigations in south African fossil reptiles and amphibia:
 Descriptive catalogue of the amphibia of the Karroo system. *Annals of the South African Museum* 22:227-261.
- HAUGHTON S. H. 1932. On a collection of Karroo vertebrates from Tanganyika Territory. *Quarterly Journal of the Geological Society of London* 88:634-671.
- HUNT A. P. 1993. Revision of the Metoposauridae (Amphibia : Temnospondyli) and
 Description of a New Genus from Western North America, *in* MORALES M. (ed.),
 Aspects of Mesozoic Geology and Paleontology of the Colorado Plateau. *Museum of Northern Arizona Bulletin* 59: 67-97.
- HOWIE A. A. 1970. A new capitosaurid labyrinthodont from East Africa. *Palaeontology* 13:210-253.
- JAEGER G. F. 1828. Über die fossile (sic) Reptilien, welche in Württemberg aufgefunden worden sind. Metzler, Stuttgart, 48 p.
- KAMMERER C.F., VIGLIETTI P. A., HANCOX P. J., BUTLER R. J., & CHOINIERE J. N. 2019. A new kannemeyeriiform dicynodont (*Ufudocyclops mukanelai*, gen et sp. nov.) from
 Subzone C of the *Cynognathus* Assemblage Zone of South Africa, with implications for biostratigraphic correlation with other African Triassic faunas. *Journal of Vertebrate Paleontology* 39:2. https://doi: 10.1080/02724634.2019.1596921.
- KEMP T. S. 1975. Vertebrate localities in the Karroo System of the Luangwa Valley,Zambia. *Nature* 254:415-416.

- KITCHING J. W. 1957. A new small stereospondylous labyrinthodont from the Triassic beds of South Africa. *Annals and Magazine of Natural History* 4:475-476.
- KITCHING J. W. 1977. The distribution of the Karoo vertebrate fauna. *Bernard Price Institute for Palaeontological Research Memoir* 1:1-131.
- LIU J., RAMEZANI J., LI L., SHANG Q.-H., XU G.-H., WANG Y.-Y. & YANG J.-S. 2018. Highprecision temporal calibration of Middle Triassic vertebrate biostratigraphy: U-Pb zircon constraints for the *Sinokannemeyeria* Fauna and *Yongesuchus*. *Vertebrata PalAsiatica* 56:16-24.
- LYDEKKER R. 1885. The Reptilia and Amphibia of the Maleri and Denwa Groups. *Palaeontologia Indica* (Ser. IV. Indian pre–Tertiary Vertebrata) 1:30-38.
- MAGANUCO S., PASINI G. & AUDITORE M. 2014. A revision of the short-faced stereospondyls *Mahavisaurus dentatus* and *Lyrosaurus australis* from the Lower Triassic of Madagascar: cranial anatomy, ontogenetic remarks, palaeoecology and rhytidosteids phylogeny. *Memori della Società Italiana di Scienze Naturali e del Museo Civico di Storia Naturale di Milano* 39:1-64.
- MARSICANO C. A., IRMIS R. B., MANCUSO A. C., MUNDIL R. & CHEMALE F. 2016. The precise temporal calibration of dinosaur origins. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 113:509-513.
- MOLYNEUX A. J. C. 1908. Report on an expedition to locate coal areas in the Luano (Lusenfwa) Valley, N.W. Rhodesia. Unpublished report of the Zambesia Exploring Company Ltd., 99 p.
- NELSEN O., HAGEN E. & DYPVIK H. 2001. Sediment provenance and Karoo rift basin evolution in the Kilombero Rift Valley, Tanzania. South African Journal of Geology 104:137-150.

NESBITT S. J., SIDOR C. A., IRMIS R. B., ANGIELCZYK K. D., SMITH R. M. H. & TSUJI L. A. 2010. — Ecologically distinct dinosaurian sister group shows early diversification of Ornithodira. *Nature* 464:95-98.

NESBITT S. J., BUTLER R. A., EZCURRA M. D., BARRETT P. M., STOCKER M. R., ANGIELCZYK
K. D., SMITH R. M. H., SIDOR C. A., NIEDŹWIEDZKI G., SENNIKOV A. G. & CHARIG A. J.
2017. — The earliest bird-line archosaurs and the assembly of the dinosaur body plan. *Nature* 544:484-487.

NOWACK E. 1937. — Zur Kenntnis der Karruformation im Ruhuhu-Graben (D.O.A.). *Neues Jahrbuch für Mineralogie, Geologie, und Paläontologie Abteilung B* 78:380-412.

OCHEV V.G. 1966. — [Systematics and phylogeny of capitosauroid labyrinthodonts]. *Publication of the Saratov State University*, 184 p. [Russian]

OTTONE E. G., MONTI M., MARSICANO C. A., DE LA FUENTE M. S., M. NAIPAUER, R. ARMSTRONG
& MANCUSO A. C.. 2014. — A new Late Triassic age for the Puesto Viejo Group (San
Rafael depocenter, Argentina): SHRIMP U–Pb zircon dating and biostratigraphic
correlations across southern *Gondwana*. *Journal of South American Earth Sciences* 56:186-199.

- OWEN R. 1884. On a labyrinthodont amphibian (*Rhytidosteus capensis*) from the Trias of the Orange Free State, Cape of Good hope. *Quaterly Journal of the Geological Society* 40:333-338.
- PAWLEY K. 2006. The postcranial skeleton in temnospondyls (Tetrapoda: Temnospondyli).*Ph.D. dissertation*, La Trobe University, Victoria, 442 p.
- PEECOOK B. R., STEYER J. S., TABOR N. J. & SMITH R. M. H. 2018. Updated geology and vertebrate paleontology of the Triassic Ntawere Formation of northeastern Zambia, with special emphasis on the archosauromorphs, in SIDOR C. A. & NESBITT S. J. (eds.), Vertebrate and Climatic Evolution in the Triassic Rift basins of Tanzania and Zambia.

Society of Vertebrate Paleontology Memoir 17. *Journal of Vertebrate Paleontology* 37(6): 8-38.

- ROOPNARINE P. D., ANGIELCZYK K. D., OLROYD S. L., NESBITT S. J., BOTHA-BRINK J.,
 PEECOOK B. R., DAY M. O. & SMITH R. M. H. 2018. Comparative ecological dynamics of Permian-Triassic communities from the Karoo, Luangwa, and Ruhuhu Basins of southern Africa, in SIDOR C. A. & NESBITT S. J. (eds.), Vertebrate and Climatic Evolution in the Triassic Rift basins of Tanzania and Zambia. Society of Vertebrate Paleontology Memoir 17. *Journal of Vertebrate Paleontology* 37(6): 254-272.
- RUBIDGE B.S., ERWIN D. H., RAMEZANI J., BOWRING S. A. & DE KLERK W. J.. 2013. Highprecision temporal calibration of Late Permian vertebrate biostratigraphy: U-Pb zircon constraints from the Karoo Supergroup, South Africa. *Geology* 41:363-366.
- SCHOCH R. R. 1999. Comparative osteology of *Mastodonsaurus giganteus* (Jaeger, 1828)
 from the Middle Triassic (Lettenkeuper: Longobardian) of Germany (Baden-Württemberg, Bayern, Thüringen). *Stuttgarter Beiträge zur Naturkunde Serie B* 278:1-175.
- SCHOCH R. R. 2008. The Capitosauria (Amphibia): characters, phylogeny, and stratigraphy. *Palaeobiodiversity* 1:189-226.

SCHOCH R. R. & MILNER A. R. 2000. — Handbuch der Paläoherpetologie/Encyclopedia of Paleoherpetology. Teil/Part 3B. Stereospondyli. Friedrich Pfeil, München, 219 p.

SIDOR C. A., STEYER J. S. & DAMIANI R. 2007. — Parotosuchus (Temnospondyli: Mastodonsauridae) from the Triassic of Antarctica. Journal of Vertebrate Paleontology 27:232-235.

- SIDOR C. A., DAMIANI R. & HAMMER W. R. 2008. A new temnospondyl from Antarctica and a review of Fremouw Formation biostratigraphy. *Journal of Vertebrate Paleontology* 28:656-663.
- SIDOR, C. A., VILHENA D. A., ANGIELCZYK K. D., HUTTENLOCKER A. K., NESBITT S. J., PEECOOK B. R., STEYER J. S., SMITH R. M. H. & TSUJI L. A. 2013. — Provincialization of terrestrial faunas following the end-Permian mass extinction. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 110:8129-8133.
- SIDOR C. A., STEYER J. S. & HAMMER W. R. 2014. A new capitosauroid temnospondyl from the Middle Triassic upper Fremouw Formation of Antarctica. *Journal of Vertebrate Paleontology* 34:539-548.
- SIDOR C. A. & NESBITT S. J. 2018. Introduction to vertebrate and climatic evolution in the Triassic rift basins of Tanzania and Zambia, in SIDOR C. A. & NESBITT S. J. (eds),
 Vertebrate and Climatic Evolution in the Triassic Rift Basins of Tanzania and Zambia.
 Society of Vertebrate Paleontology Memoir 17. *Journal of Vertebrate Paleontology* 37(6): 1-7.
- SMITH R. M. H., SIDOR C. A., ANGIELCZYK K. D., NESBITT S. J. & TABOR N. J. 2018. —
 Taphonomy and paleoenvironments of Middle Triassic bone accumulations in the Lifua
 Member of the Manda Beds, Songea Group (Ruhuhu Basin), Tanzania, in SIDOR C. A.
 & NESBITT S. J. (eds.), Vertebrate and Climatic Evolution in the Triassic Rift Basins of
 Tanzania and Zambia. Society of Vertebrate Paleontology Memoir 17. *Journal of Vertebrate Paleontology* 37(6): 65-79.
- STEYER J.-S. 2000. Ontogeny and phylogeny in temnospondyls: a new method of analysis. *Zoological Journal of the Linnean Society* 130:449-467.
- STEYER J.-S., ANGIELCZYK K. D., SIDOR C. A., NESBITT S. J., SMITH R. M. H., PEECOOK B. R., BEIGHTOL C. V., TABOR N. J., TSUJI L. A. & TOLAN S. 2015. — The amphibians

awaken: New temnospondyls from Tanzania and Zambia illustrate changes in amphibian diversity before and after the mother of mass extinctions. *Journal of Vertebrate Paleontology* 2015A:218.

- TARAILO D. A. 2018. Taxonomic and ecomorphological diversity of temnospondyl amphibians across the Permian-Triassic boundary in the Karoo Basin (South Africa). *Journal of Morphology* 2018:1-9. https://doi.org/10.1002/jmor.20906
- WARREN A. A. 1998. Karoo tupilakosaurid: a relict from Gondwana. Transactions of the Royal Society of Edinburgh: Earth Sciences 89:145-160.
- WARREN A. A. & SNELL N. 1991. The postcranial skeleton of Mesozoic temnospondyl amphibians: a review. *Alcheringa* 15:43-64.
- WATSON D. M. S. 1919. The structure, evolution and origin of the Amphibia. The "orders" Rachitomi and Stereospondyli. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London Series B* 209:1-73.
- WATSON D. M. S. 1958. A new labyrinthodont (*Paracyclotosaurus*) from the Upper Triassic of New South Wales. *Bulletin of the British Museum of Natural History* 3:233-264.
- WITZMANN F. & SCHOCH R. R. 2006. The postcranium of *Archegosaurus decheni*, and a phylogenetic analysis of temnospondyl postcrania. *Paleontology* 49:1211-1235.
- YATES A. M. & WARREN A. A..2000. The phylogeny of the 'higher' temnospondyls (Vertebrata: Choanata) and its implications for the monophyly and origins of the Stereospondyli. Zoological Journal of the Linnean Society 128:77-121.
- ZITTEL K. VON. 1887–90. Handbuch der Paläontologie. Abteilung 1. Paläozoologie Band
 III. Vertebrata (Pisces, Amphibia, Reptilia, Aves). Oldenbourg, München, and Leipzig,
 890 p.
- Submitted 14th, October 2019; accepted Month DD, YYYY

FIGURES



FIGURE 1. Geography and stratigraphy of the Luangwa (Zambia) and Ruhuhu (Tanzania) basins in Africa, which yielded Triassic temnospondyl material (modified from Sidor and Nesbitt, 2018). The stratigraphical chart is based on Rubidge et al. (2013); the ages (in My) are from the 2019 International Chronostratigraphic Chart (see Cohen et al. 2013). The orange units containing temnospondyls are compared here. **Abbreviations**: Ans, Anisian; Fm, Formation; L, Lower; Mem, Member; M, Middle; Ole, Olenekian; Ss, Sandstones.



FIGURE 2. Five small intercentra (**A–C**, NMT RB464; **D–F**, NMT RB465; **G–I**, NMT RB466; **J-L**, NMT RB467; **M-O**, NMT RB468) of small cf. Stereospondyli from the Triassic (?Anisian) of Tanzania (Ruhuhu Basin) in anterior (**A**, **D**, **G**, **J**, **M**), lateral (**B**, **E**, **H**, **K**, **N**), and ventral (**C**, **F**, **I**, **L**, **O**) views. Scale bar equals 1 mm. [planned for column width]



FIGURE 3. 10 atlantes (NHCC LB 647, 679–687) of small adults of cf. Stereospondyli from the Triassic (?Anisian) of Zambia (Luangwa Basin) in dorsal (**A**) and anterior views (**B**, NHCC LB647 is figured to show the two articular facets with the occipital condyles). Scale bar equals 10 mm. Modified from Peecook et al. 2018. [planned for column width]



FIGURE 4. Partial mandible of Stereospondyli (NHCC LB678) from the Triassic (?Anisian) of Zambia (Luangwa Basin) in labial (A), dorsal (B) and lingual (C) views. Abbreviations:
cor1, coronoid 1; cor2, coronoid 2; d, dentary. Scale bar equals 10 mm. Modified from
Peecook et al. 2018. [planned for column width]



FIGURE 5. Postcranial specimens of Mastodonsauroidea collected in 1963 by A. Charig and colleagues in the Triassic (?Anisian) of Zambia (Luangwa Basin): **A**, partial interclavicle (NHMUK R10271) in ventral view; **B–C**, intercentra (NHMUK R10272-R10273) in anterior view; **D**, partial right scapulocoracoid (NHMUK R10274) in lateral view; **E**, right ilium (NHMUK R10275) in lateral view. **Abbreviations**: **fsgl**, supraglenoid fossa; **sab**, supracetabular buttress; **sct**, scapular tubercle. Scale bar equals 10 cm. [planned for column width]



FIGURE 6. Intercentrum of Mastodonsauroidea (NMT RB537) from the Triassic (?Anisian)
of Tanzania (Ruhuhu Basin) in posterior (A) and lateral (B) views, (C) μCT-scan radiography.
Abbreviations: par, parapophyses. Scale bar equals 5 cm. [planned for column width]



FIGURE 7. Partial left dentary of cf. *Cherninia megarhina* (Chernin & Cosgriff, 1975)
(NHCC LB676) from the Triassic (?Anisian) of Zambia (Luangwa Basin) in lingual (A) and dorsal (B) views. Abbreviations: d, dentary; sym, symphyseal suture. Scale bar equals 10 cm. [planned for column width]