

# Time to Resolution of Respiratory and Systemic Coronavirus Disease 2019 Symptoms in Community Setting

Aurélien Dinh, Luc Jaulmes, Agnès Dechartres, Clara Duran, Hélène Mascitti, Xavier Lescure, Youri Yordanov, Patrick Jourdain

## ► To cite this version:

Aurélien Dinh, Luc Jaulmes, Agnès Dechartres, Clara Duran, Hélène Mascitti, et al.. Time to Resolution of Respiratory and Systemic Coronavirus Disease 2019 Symptoms in Community Setting. Clinical Microbiology and Infection, 2021, 27 (12), pp.1862.e1-1862.e4. 10.1016/j.cmi.2021.08.021 . hal-03894263

## HAL Id: hal-03894263 https://hal.sorbonne-universite.fr/hal-03894263

Submitted on 5 Jan 2024  $\,$ 

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution - NonCommercial 4.0 International License

Version of Record: https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1198743X2100481X Manuscript\_ca2d558bc14751c9d40102f0ff525886

1	Time to resolution of respiratory and systemic COVID-19 symptoms in community setting
2	Aurélien Dinh <sup>1,2</sup> *, Luc Jaulmes <sup>3</sup> , Agnès Dechartres <sup>4</sup> , Clara Duran <sup>1</sup> , Hélène Mascitti <sup>1</sup> , Xavier
3	Lescure <sup>2,5</sup> , Youri Yordanov <sup>6</sup> , Patrick Jourdain <sup>2,7</sup> on behalf of the AP-HP/Universities/INSERM
4	COVID-19 research collaboration
5	
6	<sup>1</sup> Infectious Disease department, University Hospital Raymond-Poincaré, Assistance
7	Publique-Hôpitaux de Paris, Paris Saclay University, Garches, France
8	<sup>2</sup> Covidom regional telemedicine platform, Assistance Publique-Hôpitaux de Paris, Paris,
9	France
10	<sup>3</sup> Clinical research and epidemiology department, University Hospital Pitié-Salpêtrière,
11	Assistance Publique-Hôpitaux de Paris, University of Paris, Paris, France
12	<sup>4</sup> Sorbonne Université, INSERM, Institut Pierre Louis d'Epidémiologie et de Santé Publique,
13	AP-HP. Sorbonne Université, Hôpital Pitié Salpêtrière, Département de Santé Publique,
14	F75013, Paris, France
15	<sup>5</sup> Infectious Disease department, University Hospital Bichat, Assistance Publique-Hôpitaux de
16	Paris, University of Paris, Paris, France
17	<sup>6</sup> Emergency department, University Hospital Saint Antoine, Assistance Publique-Hôpitaux de
18	Paris, Paris, France
19	<sup>7</sup> Cardiology department, University Hospital of Bicêtre, Assistance Publique-Hôpitaux de
20	Paris, Kremlin Bicêtre, France

## 22 \* Corresponding author

- 23 Aurélien Dinh
- 24 Infectious disease unit
- 25 Raymond-Poincaré University Hospital
- 26 AP-HP Paris Saclay University
- 27 104 Bd Raymond Poincaré, 92380 Garches
- 28 Tel: +33147104432 / Fax: +33147107790
- 29 Mail: aurelien.dinh@aphp.fr

#### 30 Abstract (242/250)

#### 31 Objectives

32 During the Coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19), symptom course among outpatients is not

33 well known. Our aim was to assess the time to resolution of respiratory and systemic

34 symptoms and their associated factors.

#### 35 Methods

36 Cohort study including adult outpatients, managed with Covidom, a telesurveillance

37 solution, with RT-PCR confirmed diagnosis, from March 9<sup>th</sup> 2020 until February 23<sup>rd</sup> 2021.

38 Follow-up was 30 days after symptom onset.

#### 39 Results

40 Among the 9,667 patients included, mean age was 43.2±14.0 years, and 67.5% were female

41 (n=6,522). Median body mass index (BMI) (IQR) was 25.0 kg/m<sup>2</sup> (22.1-28.8). Main

- 42 comorbidities were: hypertension (12.9%; n=1247), asthma (11.0%; n=1063), and diabetes
- 43 mellitus (5.5%; n=527). The most frequent symptom during follow-up was dyspnea (65.1%;
- 44 n=6,296), followed by tachypnea (49.9%; n=4,821), shivers (45.6%; n=4,410), and fever
- 45 (36.7%; n=3,550). Median time to resolution of systemic and respiratory symptoms were 3

46 days (95% CI: 2–4) and 7 days (95% CI: 6–8), respectively. Ultimately, 17.2% (95% CI:

- 47 15.7%–18.8%) still presented respiratory symptoms at day 30. Longer time to respiratory
- 48 symptom resolution was associated with older age, increased BMI, chronic obstructive
- 49 pulmonary disease (COPD), coronary artery disease, asthma, and heart failure. Regarding
- 50 systemic symptoms, coronary artery disease, asthma, age above 40 years, and elevated BMI
- 51 were associated with longer time to resolution.

## 52 **Conclusions**

- 53 Time to symptom resolution among outpatients with COVID-19 seemed shorter for systemic
- 54 than respiratory symptoms. Prolonged respiratory symptoms were common at day 30. Risk
- 55 factors associated with later resolution included age, cardiovascular and pulmonary

56 diseases.

- 57
- 58 Key words: COVID-19; symptom duration; dyspnea; sequalae; community setting;
- 59 telemedicine
- 60

## 61 Introduction

62	The clinical manifestations in COVID-19 patients range from asymptomatic to severe forms
63	requiring critical care, and the duration of symptoms can vary widely [1,2]. Most studies
64	described the clinical course of hospitalized severe cases [3–5]. However, most patients
65	present with milder forms of COVID-19 [6], and are therefore managed as outpatients. Data
66	on this population is scarce, but describing the symptom course of outpatients with COVID-
67	19 and factors associated with symptom duration may help provide adequate follow-up
68	[2,7–9].
69	Our study aimed to evaluate the time to resolution of COVID-19 respiratory and systemic
70	symptoms, and factors associated with a longer duration in a large cohort of outpatients.
71	
72	Material and methods
73	This study included adult (≥ 18 years) patients, initially managed as outpatients, from March
74	9 <sup>th</sup> 2020 to February 23 <sup>rd</sup> 2021 by Covidom, a telesurveillance solution for home monitoring
75	of patients with COVID-19 in the greater Paris area [10]. Covidom outpatients were
76	registered by a physician after consulting for COVID-related symptoms and agreeing to the
77	monitoring. We included patients with a RT-PCR confirmed diagnosis, having answered at
78	least one monitoring questionnaire, and who provided medical background at inclusion.
79	Available data for each patient included age, gender, date of first symptoms, weight, height,
80	and comorbidities.
81	When included in Covidom, the patients completed, on a daily basis, one or two self-
82	administered questionnaires on symptoms until 30 days after symptoms onset. Self-reported
83	data were: respiratory rate (tachypnea defined as >20 breaths per minute), heart rate

84 (tachycardia defined as >100 beats per minute), temperature (fever and hypothermia 85 defined by temperature >38.5°C and <35.5°C, respectively), dyspnea (on a 1-to-5 modified 86 Borg scale [11], slight dyspnea defined by a rating  $\geq 2$ , and moderate dyspnea  $\geq 3$ ), oxygen 87 saturation (desaturation defined by <95%), dizziness, and shivers. 88 Two main groups of symptoms were defined: 89 Systemic symptoms: fever or hypothermia, dizziness, tachycardia, shivers. -90 -Respiratory symptoms: dyspnea, tachypnea, low oxygen saturation. 91 Kaplan-Meier estimators were used to evaluate time to resolution of symptoms. Patients 92 were considered at risk from the date of first symptom onset (declared at inclusion) until the 93 last occurrence of each symptom in daily questionnaires. Regarding symptom groups, 94 patients were considered at risk until the last day of any symptom occurrence of the group. 95 Patients were censored at the end of their follow-up (30 days or earlier in case of premature 96 ending). Factors independently associated with longer time to resolution of systemic and 97 respiratory symptoms were evaluated separately on complete cases using multivariate Cox 98 models and inversed hazard ratios as the event of interest was initially resolution of 99 symptoms. Alpha risk was set at 5%. 100 Patients provided electronic consent for the Covidom telesurveillance program and were 101 informed of the use of their anonymized data for research. This study was approved by the 102 scientific and ethical committee of APHP (IRB00011591). 103 104 Results 105 Among the 62,993 patients included in the Covidom cohort as outpatients, 15,086 (23.9%)

106 had a COVID-19 RT-PCR confirmed diagnosis, 14,965 (23.8%) were adult patients, 11,984

107 (19.0%) answered at least one monitoring questionnaire, and 9,667 (15.3%) provided

108 medical background at inclusion and thus were included in this study (patients

109 characteristics presented in Table S1 in Supplementary appendix).

110 Mean age was 43.2 years old (SD 14.0) and 67.5% were female (n=6,522). Median body mass

index (BMI) (IQR) was 25.0 kg/m<sup>2</sup> (22.1-28.8). Main comorbidities were hypertension (12.9%;

n=1247), asthma (11.0%; n=1,063), and diabetes mellitus (5.5%; n=527). Other comorbidities

were reported by less than 1.5% of patients. Weight (and BMI) was missing for 121 patients,

114 and gender for 18 patients.

115 The last answer to a daily questionnaire occurred at a median time of 28 days after symptom

onset (IQR 17–30 days), with a median Covidom monitoring duration of 19 days (IQR 11–24

117 days). There were 65.1% of patients (n=7,805) missing at least one daily monitoring

118 questionnaire, and the median number of skipped questionnaires per patient was 2 (IQR

119 0–5).

120 The most common symptom was dyspnea in 65.1% of patients (n=6,296), with 2,802

121 patients (29.0%) rating their dyspnea as moderate or higher. Tachypnea, shivers, and fever

were reported by 49.9% (n=4,821), 45.6% (n=4,410), and 36.7% (n=3,550) of patients,

respectively. A total of 2,590 (26.8%) patients reported tachycardia, 1,197 (12.4%) reported

dizziness, and 582 (25.1%) of 2,319 patients with an oximeter reported desaturation at leastonce.

Considering time to symptom resolution (Figure 1), the longest symptoms were desaturation
with a median (95% Confidence Interval (CI)) of 10 days (8–12), and slight dyspnea with 9
days (7–10). Median time to resolution of moderate dyspnea was 4 days (2–5). Symptoms
with shorter time to resolution included shivers, tachypnea and tachycardia, with median

130	durations (95% CI) respectively of 1 day $(1-2)$ , 2 days $(1-2)$ and 2 days $(1-2)$ . The probability
131	of slight dyspnea lasting until 30 days after first symptoms onset was 18.3% (95% CI
132	16.6%–20.0%), while the systemic symptom with highest probability at day 30 was dizziness
133	with 1.1% (0.5%–2.2%).
134	Age above 30 years (hazard ratios (HR) 1.27 [95%Cl 1.16–1.38]), 40 years (1.50 [1.37–1.65]),
135	50 years (1.68 [1.53–1.85]), and 60 years (1.64[1.45–1.84]), as well as increased BMI (both
136	obesity and overweight, 1.13 [1.15–1.21] and 1.18 [1.09–1.28], respectively), chronic
137	obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD) (2.00 [1.41–2.83]), coronary artery disease (1.55
138	[1.14–2.11]), asthma (1.43 [1.30–1.58]), heart failure (1.42 [1.08–1.86]), and hypertension
139	(1.12 [1.01–1.23]) were associated with longer time to resolution of respiratory symptoms
140	(Figure 2). No variable appeared associated with a shorter time to resolution.
141	For systemic symptoms, coronary artery disease (1.53 [1.18–1.98]), as well as age above 40
142	years (1.12 [1.02–1.22], 1.16 [1.06–1.26] and 1.20 [1.08–1.34] respectively for ages >40, >50
143	and >60) and increased BMI (1.09 [1.03–1.16] for BMI >25kg/m², 1.10 [1.03–1.18] for BMI
144	>30kg/m <sup>2</sup> ) were associated with longer time to resolution (Figure 2). Male sex was
145	associated with shorter time to resolution (0.92 [0.87–0.97]). Complete analysis results are
146	presented in Table S2 in Supplementary appendix.

Lastly, the number and proportion of patients per monitoring question, answer, and day aredescribed in Figure S1 in Supplementary appendix.

149

- 150 Discussion
- 151 Our study provides important inputs regarding time to resolution of respiratory and systemic
- symptoms over one month in ambulatory patients, which can help direct care [5,12–14].

153 Median time to resolution of symptoms was up to 10 days with wide variability, and 18.3% 154 of slight dizziness symptoms still present at end of follow-up. Systemic symptoms were 155 slightly less frequent than respiratory symptoms, and had shorter time to resolution. Factors 156 associated with prolonged symptoms included age over 30, elevated BMI, and cardiovascular 157 and pulmonary diseases. 158 The strength of our study includes the size of the cohort and the standardized questionnaire 159 during the entire 30-day follow-up. Several studies showed, among hospitalized patients, 160 that fever, cough, dyspnea, and gastrointestinal symptoms were the main clinical 161 manifestations of COVID-19 [15]. In our cohort that included only non-hospitalized patients, 162 those symptoms had a lower prevalence. 163 Our results corroborate that COVID-19 may cause prolonged symptoms, even among 164 outpatients with mild disease [2], or in patients with or without few comorbidities. 165 Limits 166 Our study relies on patients' self-reporting, resulting in possible recall bias. Furthermore, we 167 focused on general and respiratory symptoms and did not evaluate the duration of other 168 symptoms like smell and taste alteration. Secondarily, non-respondents might have differed 169 from respondents regarding their clinical course. Finally, our models do not take into 170 account each symptom's onset delay, only the date until which each symptom lasts, starting 171 from the onset of the first symptom. This describes the course of symptoms relative to the 172 illness globally, but different factors may affect symptom onset delay and symptom 173 duration.

174

175 Conclusion

176	Time to symptom resolution in outpatients with COVID-19 varies widely with shorter
177	systemic symptoms and longer respiratory symptoms. Prolonged respiratory symptoms,
178	especially dyspnea, were common at day 30. Factors associated with later resolution were
179	age over 30, elevated BMI, cardiovascular and pulmonary diseases.
180	
181	Transparency declaration
182	The authors declare that they have no conflicts of interest. All authors have full control of all
183	primary data and they agree to allow review of their data upon request.
184	
185	Funding
186	This study received a funding by the Programme Hospitalier de Recherche Clinique 2020 of
187	the French Ministry of Health, by a research fund by APHP-Fondation de France. The
188	Covidom platform received a funding from EIT Health specific Covid-19 fund.
189	
190	Authors' contributions
191	ADi, LJ, ADe, XL, and YY conceptualized the study. Adi, LJ, ADe, CD, HM, and YY collected,
192	analysed and interpreted the data. LH conducted the statistical analysis. Adi, LJ, Ade, CD, and
193	YY wrote the first draft of the manuscript. All authors revised the manuscript and approved
194	the final version. ADi had full access to all of the data in the study and takes responsibility for
195	the integrity of the data and the accuracy of the data analysis.
196	
197	References
198	[1] Guan W, Ni Z, Hu Y, Liang W, Ou C, He J, et al. Clinical Characteristics of Coronavirus

- 199 Disease 2019 in China. N Engl J Med 2020;382:1708–20.
- 200 https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJMoa2002032.
- 201 [2] Tenforde MW, Kim SS, Lindsell CJ, Billig Rose E, Shapiro NI, Files DC, et al. Symptom
- 202 Duration and Risk Factors for Delayed Return to Usual Health Among Outpatients with
- 203 COVID-19 in a Multistate Health Care Systems Network United States, March–June
- 204 2020. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep 2020;69:993–8.
- 205 https://doi.org/10.15585/mmwr.mm6930e1.
- 206 [3] Docherty AB, Harrison EM, Green CA, Hardwick HE, Pius R, Norman L, et al. Features
- 207 of 20 133 UK patients in hospital with covid-19 using the ISARIC WHO Clinical
- 208 Characterisation Protocol: prospective observational cohort study. BMJ 2020:m1985.
- 209 https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.m1985.
- 210 [4] Zhou F, Yu T, Du R, Fan G, Liu Y, Liu Z, et al. Clinical course and risk factors for
- 211 mortality of adult inpatients with COVID-19 in Wuhan, China: a retrospective cohort
- 212 study. Lancet (London, England) 2020;395:1054–62. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-
- 213 6736(20)30566-3.
- [5] Mizrahi B, Shilo S, Rossman H, Kalkstein N, Marcus K, Barer Y, et al. Longitudinal
- symptom dynamics of COVID-19 infection. Nat Commun 2020;11:6208.
- 216 https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-020-20053-y.
- 217 [6] Stokes EK, Zambrano LD, Anderson KN, Marder EP, Raz KM, El Burai Felix S, et al.
- 218 Coronavirus Disease 2019 Case Surveillance United States, January 22–May 30,
- 219 2020. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep 2020;69:759–65.
- 220 https://doi.org/10.15585/mmwr.mm6924e2.
- 221 [7] Pullen MF, Skipper CP, Hullsiek KH, Bangdiwala AS, Pastick KA, Okafor EC, et al.

- 222 Symptoms of COVID-19 Outpatients in the United States. Open Forum Infect Dis
- 223 2020;7. https://doi.org/10.1093/ofid/ofaa271.
- [8] Lapostolle F, Schneider E, Vianu I, Dollet G, Roche B, Berdah J, et al. Clinical features of
- 225 1487 COVID-19 patients with outpatient management in the Greater Paris: the COVID-
- 226 call study. Intern Emerg Med 2020;15:813–7. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11739-020-
- 227 02379-z.
- 228 [9] Kim G-U, Kim M-J, Ra SH, Lee J, Bae S, Jung J, et al. Clinical characteristics of
- asymptomatic and symptomatic patients with mild COVID-19. Clin Microbiol Infect
- 230 2020;26:948.e1-948.e3. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cmi.2020.04.040.
- [10] Yordanov Y, Dechartres A, Lescure X, Apra C, Villie P, Marchand-Arvier J, et al.
- Covidom, a Telesurveillance Solution for Home Monitoring Patients With COVID-19. J
   Med Internet Res 2020;22. https://doi.org/10.2196/20748.
- 234 [11] Muza SR, Silverman MT, Gilmore GC, Hellerstein HK, Kelsen SG. Comparison of Scales
- 235 Used to Quantitate the Sense of Effort to Breathe in Patients with Chronic Obstructive
- 236 Pulmonary Disease. Am Rev Respir Dis 1990;141:909–13.
- 237 https://doi.org/10.1164/ajrccm/141.4\_Pt\_1.909.
- 238 [12] The Lancet. Facing up to long COVID. Lancet 2020;396:1861.
- 239 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(20)32662-3.
- 240 [13] Davido B, Seang S, Tubiana R, de Truchis P. Post–COVID-19 chronic symptoms: a
- 241 postinfectious entity? Clin Microbiol Infect 2020;26:1448–9.
- 242 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cmi.2020.07.028.
- 243 [14] Nehme M, Braillard O, Alcoba G, Aebischer Perone S, Courvoisier D, Chappuis F, et al.
- 244 COVID-19 Symptoms: Longitudinal Evolution and Persistence in Outpatient Settings.

- 245 Ann Intern Med 2021;174:723–5. https://doi.org/10.7326/M20-5926.
- 246 [15] Jiang F, Deng L, Zhang L, Cai Y, Cheung CW, Xia Z. Review of the Clinical Characteristics
- of Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19). J Gen Intern Med 2020;35:1545–9.
- 248 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11606-020-05762-w.
- 249

### 250 Figure legends

**Figure 1:** Time to resolution of respiratory and systemic symptoms (in days) modeled using Kaplan-Meier estimators

251 **Figure 2:** Risk factors associated with longer time to resolution of clinical symptoms

253	AP-HP / Universities / Inserm COVID-19 research collaboration members	
255	AP-HP / Universities / Inserin COVID-19 research conadoration members	

254	<u>Writing committee:</u> Aurélien Dinh <sup>1,2</sup> , Luc Jaulmes <sup>3</sup> , Agnès Dechartres <sup>4</sup> , Clara Duran <sup>1</sup> ,
255	Hélène Mascitti <sup>1</sup> , Xavier Lescure <sup>2,5</sup> , Youri Yordanov <sup>6</sup> , Patrick Jourdain <sup>2,7</sup>
256	<sup>1</sup> Infectious Disease department, University Hospital Raymond-Poincaré, Assistance Publique-Hôpitaux de Paris, Paris Saclay
257	University, Garches, France
258	<sup>2</sup> Covidom regional telemedicine platform, Assistance Publique-Hôpitaux de Paris, Paris, France
259	<sup>3</sup> Clinical research and epidemiology department, University Hospital Pitié-Salpétrière, Assistance Publique-Hôpitaux de
260	Paris, University of Paris, Paris, France
261	<sup>4</sup> Sorbonne Université, INSERM, Institut Pierre Louis d'Epidémiologie et de Santé Publique, AP-HP. Sorbonne Université,
262	Hôpital Pitié Salpêtrière, Département de Santé Publique, F75013, Paris, France
263	<sup>5</sup> Infectious Disease department, University Hospital Bichat, Assistance Publique-Hôpitaux de Paris, University of Paris, Paris,
264	France
265	<sup>6</sup> Emergency department, University Hospital Saint Antoine, Assistance Publique-Hôpitaux de Paris, Paris, France
266	<sup>7</sup> Cardiology department, University Hospital of Bicêtre, Assistance Publique-Hôpitaux de Paris, Kremlin Bicêtre, France
267	
268	Data-sciences committee: APRA Caroline (AC), JAULMES Luc (JL), MENSCH Arthur (MA)
269	AC is affiliated with the Sorbonne Université, AP-HP, Hôpital Pitié Salpêtrière, Service de Neurochirurgie, Paris, France
270	JL is affiliated with Centre de Pharmaco-épidémiologie (Cephepi), Pitié Salpêtrière Hospital, Paris, France
271	MA is affiliated with Ecole Normale Supérieure, PSL University, CNRS, Départment de Mathématiques et Applications,
272	75005 Paris, France
273	
274	Scientific committee: AIME-EUSEBI Amélie, APRA Caroline, BLEIBTREU Alexandre, DEBUC Erwan,
275	DECHARTRES Agnes, DECONINCK Laurène, DINH Aurélien, JOURDAIN Patrick, KATLAMA Christine,
276	LEBEL Josselin, LESCURE François-Xavier, YORDANOV Youri
277	
278	Covidom regional center steering commitee: ARTIGOU Yves, BANZET Amélie, BOUCHERON Elodie,
279	BOUDIER Christiane, BUZENAC Edouard, CHAPRON Marie-Claire, CHEKAOUI Dalhia, DE BASTARD
280	Laurent, DEBUC Erwan, DINH Aurélien, GRENIER Alexandre, HAAS Pierre-Etienne, HODY Julien,
281	JARRAYA Michèle, JOURDAIN Patrick, LACAILLE Louis, LE GUERN Aurélie, LECLERT Jeremy, MALE
282	Fanny, MARCHAND-ARVIER Jerôme, MARTIN-BLONDET Emmanuel, NASSOUR Apolinne, OURAHOU
283	Oussama, PENN Thomas, RIBARDIERE Ambre, ROBIN Nicolas, ROUGE Camille, SCHMIDT Nicolas,
284	VILLIE Pascaline

#### Kaplan-Meier modelisation of time to symptom resolution



