

### The epitome of data paucity: Deep-sea habitats of the Southern Indian Ocean

Berta Ramiro-Sánchez, Alexis Martin, Boris Leroy

### ► To cite this version:

Berta Ramiro-Sánchez, Alexis Martin, Boris Leroy. The epitome of data paucity: Deepsea habitats of the Southern Indian Ocean. Biological Conservation, 2023, 283, pp.110096. 10.1016/j.biocon.2023.110096 . hal-04554845

### HAL Id: hal-04554845 https://hal.sorbonne-universite.fr/hal-04554845v1

Submitted on 22 Apr 2024

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

Copyright

1 The epitome of data paucity: deep-sea habitats of the Southern Indian Ocean

# 2 3 Berta Ramiro-Sánchez<sup>a</sup>, Alexis Martin<sup>a</sup>, Boris Leroy<sup>a</sup>

4 5 <sup>a</sup> Unité 8067 Biologie des Organismes et Ecosystèmes Aquatiques (BOREA), Muséum

6 national d'Histoire naturelle, Sorbonne Université, Université de Caen Normandie, CNRS,

7 IRD, Université des Antilles, Paris, France.

8

9 <u>Alexis.martin@mnhn.fr</u>

- 10 leroy.boris@gmail.com
- 11

### 12 Corresponding author:

- 13
- 14 Berta Ramiro-Sánchez
- 15 Email address: <u>b.ramirosanchez@gmail.com</u>
- 16 Telephone: +33 (0) 7 51 26 86 76
- 17 Present address:
- 18 Muséum National d'Histoire Naturelle
- 19 Lab. Biologie des Organismes et des Ecosystèmes Aquatiques, Dept. Adaptation du Vivant,
- 20 43 rue Cuvier CP 26 75005 Paris
- 21

### 22 Funding

- 23 BR-S post-doctoral work was funded by the Southern Indian Ocean Fisheries Agreement
- 24 (SIOFA) through a European Union grant (SIOFA-2020-2022 Support to SIOFA Scientific
- 25 Work on key stocks, ecosystems, and data; Grant ID: SI2.815850). BL and AM were funded
- 26 by their salaries as French public servants. No permit was required to achieve this work. The
- funders had no role in data collection and analysis, decision to publish, or preparation of themanuscript.
- 28 mar 29

### 30 **Conflict of interest**

- 31 The authors declare no conflict of interest.
- 32
- 33

### 34 Acknowledgements

- 35 We acknowledge the Ocean Biogeographic Information System (OBIS), the Global
- 36 Biodiversity Information Facility (GBIF), NOAA's Deep-sea Coral Portal, and museum
- 37 curators for providing species occurrence data. We sincerely thank SIOFA for providing
- 38 access to their observer data. We thank two anonymous reviewers for commenting on this
- 39 manuscript. This research was supported by the European Union (Reference Grant:
- 40 SI2.815850).
- 41
- 42
- 43

#### 44 Abstract

45

46 Vulnerable marine ecosystems (VMEs) are protected from bottom-fishing impacts in

47 international waters by UN resolutions through Regional Fishery Management Organizations.

48 VMEs include deep-sea benthic taxa whose life-history traits make them vulnerable to

49 disturbance. Conservation measures for VMEs require regulatory frameworks informed by

50 biodiversity maps. Here we evaluate biogeographic patterns of deep-sea benthic biodiversity

- of the Southern Indian Ocean to understand conservation avenues for the Southern Indian
   Ocean Fisheries Agreement (SIOFA) management organization. We synthesised knowledge
- 53 on the distribution of benthic deep-sea taxa and explored the quality and quantity of available
- 54 data. Next, we explored how taxa are structured into bioregions using biogeographical
- 55 networks. We found astounding Wallacean and Linnaean shortfalls within SIOFA's
- 56 management area, which is virtually devoid of distributional data. Across the entire area,
- results suggest that only 73% of the expected deep-sea taxa has been sampled, and most
- 58 sampled cells appeared to be inadequately sampled. Yet, our bioregionalization analysis
- 59 identified multiple bioregions, some only observed within SIOFA's area. The Wallacean and
- Linnean shortfalls are so important for VMEs that they severely impede to make adequate
   maps for conservation planning. Bioregionalization results suggest that SIOFA hosts a unique

62 faunal composition that must be safeguarded. Predictive approaches to compensate for these

63 shortfalls exist but will likely be insufficient and uncertain. Within SIOFA's area, there is no

64 satisfying solution to cope with the data shortfalls. Yet, biodiversity maps are a global

65 responsibility. This study makes a call to invest in biodiversity inventories in this world's

66 region to promote informed policy-making decisions.

## 6768 Keywords

Deep-sea habitats; Bioregionalization; Indian Ocean; Conservation; Fisheries; ABNJs
 70

71

### 72 Highlights

- Bioregionalization of the Southern Indian Ocean using bipartite networks
- Major Linnean and Wallacean shortfalls
  - Unknown extent of unique bioregions in offshore areas
  - Southern Indian Ocean systematically data-poor for benthic studies
- 77

75

- 78
- 79
- 80 81
- 82
- 83
- 84
- 85
- 86 87
- 87 88
- 89

#### 90 Introduction

91

92 The increasing appropriation of marine resources by human societies, termed "the blue 93 acceleration", is multiplying and intensifying pressures on the ocean (Jouffray et al., 2020). 94 This holds especially true for the deep sea where cumulative impacts from fishing, potentially 95 deep-sea mining, and climate change (Sweetman et al., 2017), will increase and new 96 dynamics and threats will emerge (Halpern et al., 2019; O'Hara et al., 2021). In the deep sea, 97 we find species such as cold-water corals and sponges with life-history traits (slow-growth, 98 late-maturing and long-lived) that make them highly vulnerable against disturbance. These 99 species, collectively known as indicator taxa of Vulnerable Marine Ecosystems (VMEs), 100 have ecological and functional importance by enhancing biodiversity and providing habitat to other rare, threatened, or endangered species (FAO, 2009). Such roles confer VME taxa with 101 102 conservation significance, and the United Nations require management measures that can 103 include closing areas to fishing (UNGA, 2007). As a result, there is an increasing need to 104 enforce conservation measures for deep-sea regions on a global scale, which in turn requires 105 understanding species distributions across temporal and spatial scales (Lourie & Vincent,

- 106 2004; Rice et al., 2011).
- 107

108 To support conservation and spatial management objectives for VMEs, it is fundamental to

109 define the boundaries, extent, and connections of deep-sea regions with ecological,

110 environmental, and biogeographic characteristics (Danovaro et al., 2009). However, this

111 fundamental definition of deep-sea regions is compromised by the critical under-sampling of

112 deep waters (Hughes et al., 2021; Menegotto & Rangel, 2018) that prevents resolving

- biogeographic patterns for deep-sea taxa, although there are efforts at regional (e.g., Summers
  & Watling, 2021) and global (e.g., Watling et al., 2013; Watling & Lapointe, 2022) scale for
- 115 certain groups. The vastness, remoteness, and required technological complexities render
- deep-sea scientific exploration patchy, punctual, and rather costly. At a spatial resolution of 5
- 117 km, Hughes et al. (2021) estimate the area of ocean sampled at 0.6% for all taxonomic groups
- between 1,000 and 1,800 m water depth and at less than 0.02 % for deeper waters. At depths
- between 1,000 and 1,800 m, certain groups like Cnidaria dominate the percentage of global
- 120 records. Further to this sampling imbalance across depths, sampling bias prevails in the
- 121 southern hemisphere (Menegotto & Rangel, 2018), underlining the inequity in scientific
- technological capacity needed for this realm. Accordingly, the deep sea is an environment that suffers systematically from taxonomic and geographical knowledge biases, also known
- 124 as the Linnean (Brown & Lomolino, 1998) and Wallacean (Lomolino, 2004) shortfalls,
- 125 respectively.
- 126

Linnean and Wallacean shortfalls for deep-sea vulnerable taxa are greatest in waters beyond national jurisdiction (hereafter, high seas), which cover 61% of ocean area and 73% of ocean volume (Costello et al., 2010). There, these taxa of groups of mainly suspension feeders, tend

130 to occur on locations where currents are accelerated by kilometre-scale topographic features,

such as the crest or rims of seamount summits and ridges (Rogers, 2018). However, although

Linnean (i.e., most species remain undescribed; Cardoso et al., 2011) and Wallacean (i.e.,

133 knowledge on species' distribution is inadequate; Cardoso et al., 2011) are the most

- 134 prominent knowledge gaps, in reality most deep-sea taxa endure other renowned shortfalls:
- 135 Darwinian (phylogenetic relationships), Hutchinsonian (environmental tolerance), Prestonian
- 136 (population in time and space), Raunkerian (species traits), and Eltonian (species
- 137 interactions) (see Hortal et al., 2015 for a review on biodiversity shortfalls). For example, for

138 deep-sea octocorals of the Order Alcyonacea (Phylum Cnidaria), which can create single or

- 139 multi-species aggregations known as coral gardens (Freiwald & Roberts, 2005; Rossi et al.,
- 2017), the phylogeny has just become resolved and well supported to proceed with taxonomic 140
- 141 revisions (McFadden et al., 2022). In addition, few studies have assessed the interaction 142 behind octocoral species co-occurrence (e.g., Rakka et al., 2021), and baseline studies
- 143 continue to shed light on life-history traits (e.g., Baillon et al., 2016; Rakka, Godinho, et al.,
- 144 2021) and environmental tolerances (e.g., Rakka, Godinho, et al., 2021; Scanes et al., 2018)
- 145 for a handful of species. Whilst we are steadily advancing our understanding of deep-sea
- 146 species, habitats, and more generally VMEs, knowledge shortfalls on the high seas may
- 147 hinder the application of conservation measures by managerial regulatory bodies, such as
- 148 regional fisheries management organizations (RFMOs).
- 149
- In the Indian Ocean, the Southern Indian Ocean Fisheries Agreement (SIOFA) is the entity in 150
- 151 charge of managing deep-sea fisheries on the high seas. As other RFMOs in other world's
- oceans, SIOFA must comply with international obligations towards the conservation of 152
- 153 VMEs against potential impacts from deep-sea bottom fishing. In this regard, since its
- relatively recent establishment in 2012, SIOFA has initiated management efforts to protect 154
- 155 VMEs by identifying a list of VME indicator taxa for Indian Ocean waters (CMM 2018/01).
- 156 In addition, SIOFA has designated five interim benthic protected areas where bottom-fishing
- trawling is not permitted (CMM 2019/01) and is currently undertaking work to establish new 157
- 158 interim protected areas. Situated over seamounts and ridges, the relevance of the existing
- 159 protected areas for preserving VMEs is however unknown because it has not been studied:
- 160 they were areas where only exploratory or no fishing had occurred. Considering that half of
- 161 the estimated number of seamounts of the Indian Ocean fall in the high seas and about a
- 162 quarter are deemed to be at fishable depths (i.e., with summit depths less than 1,500 m) 163
- (Yesson et al., 2011), further conservation measures will likely also focus on seamounts and ridges, where deep-sea fisheries develop around aggregations of resident fish (Clark et al., 164
- 2007; Kerry et al., 2022). To crown it all, the Southern Indian Ocean remains one of the least
- 165 explored oceans in the world (Ingole & Koslow, 2005; Rogers & Taylor, 2012; Saraswat et 166
- al., 2022; Wafar et al., 2011). 167
- 168

169 For SIOFA to develop a conservation plan, it requires to map biogeographical regions of

- VMEs in order to scientifically inform decision making. Biogeographical classifications, or 170
- 171 bioregionalizations (Woolley et al., 2020), are the building blocks for the planning and
- 172 implementation process of management measures and are highly connected to the
- 173 development of marine protected areas (Rice et al., 2011). This is because bioregionalizations
- 174 enable the identification of units that should be represented in a network, ensuring the
- 175 protection of biogeographically unique areas and the development of a network that considers
- 176 representativity, connectivity and replication of sites (Rice et al., 2011). Here, we compiled
- 177 all the available distribution data on VME indicator taxa to map such regions and report on 178 how problematic Linnean and Wallacean shortfalls are for VMEs on the high seas of the
- 179 Southern Indian Ocean. We develop a bioregionalization, explore these knowledge shortfalls,
- 180 and speculate on what are their impact and the possible avenues for VME conservation so
- 181 that SIOFA meets their international management obligations.
- 182 Materials and methods
- 183
- 184 Study area
- 185

186 The Southern Indian Ocean Fisheries Agreement (SIOFA) covers the high seas (i.e., waters

187 beyond national jurisdiction) of the Indian Ocean between the parallels 10° N and 45° S, and

188 the meridians  $30^{\circ}$  E to  $80^{\circ}$  E, with the area east of  $65^{\circ}$  E to the equator outside their

jurisdiction (Figure 1A). We extended the study area to encompass latitudes  $13^{\circ}$  N –  $65^{\circ}$  S

190 and longitudes  $20^{\circ} \text{ E} - 147^{\circ} \text{ E}$ .

191

192 The seabed of the Indian Ocean is geomorphologically complex. The Indian Ocean includes

numerous mid-ocean ridges (some not active sites of seafloor spreading such as the Ninety East Ridge, the Mascarene Ridge and the Chagos-Laccadive Ridge), seamounts, plateaus and

rises, abyssal plains and trenches. Most of the geomorphological features fall within areas

196 beyond national jurisdiction and are therefore within SIOFA's management area. Within

197 SIOFA, the seafloor bathymetry ranges from as shallow as 1 m at Saya de Malha Bank to 198 approximately 8,000 m in the abyssal plains, wherein the Southwest Indian Ocean Ridge and

Broken Ridge summit between 1,000 m and 2,000 m, and the Central Indian Ridge, Southeast

200 Indian Ridge and Ninety-East Ridge have generally deeper summits. With a mean peak

summit at 2,250 m, there are 1,746 estimated seamounts in SIOFA (Yesson et al., 2011).

202

# 203 Biological data204

205 The VME indicators list adopted by SIOFA (CMM 2018/01) at order, class, and phylum

206 levels, includes the following categories of deep-sea (generally > 200 m) benthic taxa:

207 Cnidaria (Gorgonacea, Anthoathecatae, Stylasteridae, Scleractinia, Antipatharia, Zoantharia,

208 Actiniaria, Alcyonacea, Pennatulacea), Porifera (Hexctanilleda, Demospongiae), Ascidiacea,

209 Bryozoans, Brachiopoda, Pterobranchia, Serpulidae, Xenophyophora, Bathylasmatidae,

210 Crinoidea (stalked species only), Euryalida, Cidaroida. We downloaded all occurrence

211 records under these categories from the public databases the Ocean Biodiversity Information 212 OPIS between OPIS be

System (OBIS, <u>https://obis</u>.org/) (accessed on 10/11/2020 and 02/04/2021), the Global

Biodiversity Information Facility (GBIF; <u>https://www</u>.gbif.org/) (accessed on 09/11/2020 and 14/04/2021) NOA A's Deep as Corple Data Portal (https://deepage.gov/)

- 14/04/2021), NOAA's Deep-sea Corals Data Portal (<u>https://deepseacoraldata.noaa.gov/</u>)
   (accessed on 16/11/2020 and 09/04/2021), and Smithsonian Natural History Museum
- (accessed on 10/11/2020 and 09/04/2021), and Siminsonian Natural History Museum
   (https://collections.nmnh.si.edu/) (accessed on 16/11/2020). We also obtained occurrence

records from SIOFA's observer programme, research campaigns led by the Muséum National

- d'Histoire Naturelle, and the published literature (Taylor & Rogers, 2017). We obtained
- records for the whole Southern Indian Ocean to account for ecological continuity, that is,
- 220 SIOFA's management area and all exclusive economic zones bordering it (latitudes 13° N –
- 221 65° S and longitudes  $20^{\circ} \text{ E} 147^{\circ} \text{ E}$ ).

222 We applied verification procedures for taxonomic consistency, error detection, as well as

evaluation of records in the environmental space. Specifically, we first checked species

names against the most updated authority, the World Register of Marine Species (WoRMS,

225 2021) for synonyms and fossil records. Secondly, we applied automatic error and outlier

detection using the function clean-coordinates from the R package CoordinateCleaner version

227 2.0-18 (Zizka et al., 2019). We tested for equal coordinates, coordinates over land using the

Natural Earth data ocean shapefile version 4.1.0 (<u>www.naturalearthdata</u>.com, accessed
 November 2020), and zero coordinates. Finally, we used the catalogue number and

230 geographical coordinates to filter out potential duplicates across GBIF and OBIS.

231 Our download strategy incorporated numerous shallow water species in the dataset,

232 particularly zooxanthellate corals (i.e., corals with photosynthetic algae) – however, only

233 deep-sea species fall under the definition of VME indicator taxa. Although very few

- 234 zooxanthellate corals occur below 50 m (Cairns, 2007), using the typical definition of deep
- sea as waters below 200 m would exclude deep-water species that expand into shallower
- depths. Consequently, we aimed to integrate the ecology of taxa and the general definition of
- deep sea by applying several filters to exclude zooxanthellate corals and other strictly
   shallow-water taxa. First, we individually assessed the depth distribution of each species, and
- we kept a species if 90% of its records were below 200 m water depth. To assess the depth
- range of records, we relied on their original recorded depth as indicated in the sample record.
- In the cases where this information was not available, we used the General Bathymetric Chart
- of the Oceans (GEBCO, 2021) to assign depths. Second, we further filtered species known to
- be shallow water as we worked through with peer-reviewed deep-sea taxa lists (Cairns, 2017;
- Kocsis et al., 2018). Our filtered dataset of deep-sea VME indicator taxa comprised 1,997
- species (of which 1,312 had an observation date).
- 246

### 247 Completeness of the inventory

248 We investigated the accuracy and uncertainty of our consolidated occurrence dataset by 249 calculating the completeness of our inventory based on a class of diversity measures known 250 as Hill numbers (Hill, 1973). Hill numbers are defined as the effective number of equally 251 abundant species and are parameterized by a diversity order "q". Hill numbers for order 252  $q \ge 0$  include the species diversity measures species richness, Shannon diversity, and 253 Simpson diversity as special cases of order q = 0, q = 1, and q = 2, respectively. For 254 incidence-based data, as here, this class of measures quantifies the effective number of 255 equally frequent species. For q = 0, this measure reduces to species richness, and the 256 measures of q = 1 and q = 2 can be interpreted respectively as the effective number of frequent and highly frequent species in an assemblage (Chao et al., 2014). As our objective is 257 258 to detect biogeographical regions, completeness at orders q = 1 and q = 2 are particularly 259 important. Biogeographical regions are based on the overlapping distribution of species, and 260 therefore it is a requirement for bioregionalization methods to detect the majority of frequent 261 and highly frequent species across a large number of sites throughout the study area.

262 We used the estimated sample completeness profile, which depicts completeness as a

- function of a diversity order q in a four-step integrated approach developed by Chao et al.
- 264 (2020) that links the concepts of sample completeness and diversity. In practice, a
- 265 completeness profile is plotted for all values of q from q=0 to q=2, beyond which the profile
- 266 generally stabilizes (Chao et al., 2020). A bootstrap method permits to obtain 95% confidence
- intervals. We computed the completeness estimators at q = 0, q = 1, and q = 2, as described in Chao et al. (2020) (iNEXT.4steps R package; Chao & Hu, 2023). We estimated the sample
- 269 completeness on a per-grid cell basis at resolutions ranging from 1° to 5°, because the quality
- of estimates of taxonomic richness is dependent on the spatial scale (extent and resolution) of
- the study (Soberón et al., 2007). We did not compute completeness indices for insufficiently
- sampled cells, which include cells that had less than 10 species, only singletons, or less than 3
- sampled sub-cells, but instead these were manually set to have zero completeness. Our
- evaluation of different resolutions revealed an equal completeness at orders q = 1, and q = 275 2. However, coarser resolutions also aggregated species from different regions within a grid
- 275 2. However, coarser resolutions also aggregated species from different regions within a grid 276 cell, ultimately blurring boundaries between regions (Lobo et al., 2018; Menegotto & Rangel,
- 277 2018; Mora et al., 2008). We decided to work at a resolution of 1°, which was a compromise
- between completeness and the identification of boundaries between bioregions. Further
- details on the computation of the sample completeness profiles can be found in the
- 280 Supplemental Material (section "1. Inventory completeness").

### 282 Bioregionalization

283

281

We delineated biogeographical regions for VME taxa using bipartite biogeographical 284 285 networks (Vilhena & Antonelli, 2015) with the hierarchical clustering algorithm Map Equation (Rosvall & Bergstrom, 2008). Bipartite biogeographical networks have been 286 287 recommended to map biogeographical regions (Bloomfield et al., 2018; Edler et al., 2017; 288 Rojas et al., 2017) and perform better in data-poor situations than similarity-based approaches 289 (see Leroy et al., 2019, Appendix S2). A bipartite network represents the distribution of 290 species across sites as a network of nodes, where each node is a species or a site. A network 291 comprises nodes that can be connected to each other by links (or edges). Here, nodes 292 represent grid cells and, separately, the species that occur in them, while edges link grid cell 293 and species nodes indicating whether a species is present in a grid cell. The network is 294 bipartite because each type of node, grid cell and species, cannot connect to another node of 295 the same type; that is, species nodes can only connect to grid cell nodes and grid cell nodes 296 can only connect to species nodes. Thus, a species can be found in several sites and a site can 297 host several species. In this study, we divided the Southern Indian Ocean into a 1° latitude-298 longitude grid, created a species/grid cell contingency table of presence-absence and 299 transformed it into a bipartite occurrence network (Vilhena & Antonelli, 2015).

300

301 In order to detect biogeographical regions, we applied a community-detection algorithm to 302 the network. Community-detection algorithms aim at grouping together nodes that have high 303 intra- group but low inter- group connectivity, which correspond to the definition of 304 biogeographical regions as regions of assemblages with distinct endemic taxa. This is 305 achieved based on flows of information (Rosvall & Bergstrom, 2008). As a community 306 detection algorithm, we chose "Map Equation" (Rosvall & Bergstrom, 2008), as it has been 307 recommended in previous biogeographical works (Bloomfield et al., 2018; Edler et al., 2017; 308 Rojas et al., 2017; Vilhena & Antonelli, 2015) and it features hierarchical clustering. We ran 309 Map Equation with 1,000 trials to find the optimal clustering and we ran it with hierarchical 310 clustering to test whether larger regions showed a nested hierarchy of subregions. We 311 explored bioregions that had strictly more than ten occurrences as our focus was to detect the 312 main biogeographical regions in SIOFA. We explored the biological significance of each 313 bioregion by calculating metrics to characterise the bioregions in terms of endemicity, the 314 affinity ( $A_i$ , i.e., range in their region / total range of the region; the higher the value, the more 315 widespread the species is in the region) and fidelity of a species to its bioregion ( $F_i$ , i.e., range 316 in their bioregion / total range across all regions; the higher the value, the more exclusive the 317 distribution range of the species is located in its associated region – a fidelity of 1 means that 318 the species is endemic to its region) (Leroy, 2021). Fidelity, in particular, is useful to detect 319 transition bioregions. Transition bioregions are located at the interface between multiple 320 bioregions and are thus classified as distinct bioregions by Map Equation (Vilhena & 321 Antonelli, 2015). A transition bioregion will not have high-fidelity species, as all species 322 occurring therein will have their distribution spread over multiple bioregions. We also 323 calculated the indicator value (IndVal) for each species in each region as  $A_i * F_i$  – the IndVal 324 will have a high value for species that occupy most of their associated cluster (high affinity) 325 and are not present in any other cluster (high fidelity). We created and analysed the networks 326 using the R package "biogeonetworks" (Leroy, 2021). 327

All analyses were conducted in R (R Core Team, 2021). The R code and data are available online in Zenodo (https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.7704934).

#### 330 Results

331

## *Linnean and Wallacean shortfalls*

334 Our compilation of VME occurrences showed that most of the Indian Ocean was unsampled 335 and that the bulk of available records was distributed in coastal waters, i.e., outside SIOFA's 336 management area (Figure 1A). At 1° spatial resolution, the observed richness per grid cell was very low with a median at 5 species approximately (Figure 1B) and sample completeness 337 338 was nearly 0% for all diversity orders (Figure 1C). For adequately sampled cells (i.e., those 339 that have more than two sample sub-cells of 0.01° spatial resolution, not only singletons, and 340 strictly more than ten species), the sample completeness increased with diversity order 341 (Figure 1D), suggesting that we had at least sampled most of the highly frequent species 342 (q=2) in the inventory.

343

344 We highlighted this issue at all resolutions (Figure S1). The sample and diversity profiles

revealed that, at all spatial resolutions, the inventory was incomplete for infrequent species 246

(q=0), frequent species (q=1) and for highly frequent species (q=2) (Figure S1). The

- 347 estimated sample completeness profiles increased with diversity order (q), implying that there

S1, panel (b)) and sample coverage (Figure S1, panel (d)) indicated that at increasing
 resolutions we would expect higher estimates and that any diversity estimates would be lower

bounds given that the asymptotic estimates and that any diversity estimates would be lower bounds given that the asymptotic estimator does not level off (Figure S1, panel (c)). Evenness

among species was similar regardless of the resolution (Figure S1, panel (e)).

353

### 354 Bioregions in the high seas of the Southern Indian Ocean

355

356 We detected multiple bioregions structured in two hierarchical levels for VME indicator 357 species in the Southern Indian Ocean. At the first level (i.e., largest regions with highest 358 degree of endemism) there were four biogeographical regions (Figure 2A): an inshore and an 359 offshore bioregion, and two bioregions representing the Southern Ocean at latitudes south of 40°S mostly. The four bioregions are present within SIOFA's management area, where the 360 361 offshore bioregion has most of its distribution. The four bioregions have distinct faunas, and a very high degree of endemism with bioregion 1 having the largest endemicity (95.01%), 362 363 followed by bioregion 2 (75.94%), 3 (64.60%) and 4 (64.15%) (Table 2). In addition, we found that all four bioregions had high fidelity species (Figure 3). The top indicator species 364 365 for bioregion 1 were all corals from the order Scleractinia; for bioregion 2, indicators were 366 mostly sponges; for bioregion 3, mostly tunicates; and for bioregion 4, mostly sponges (Table S1). We provide the full list of indicator species for bioregions in Supplemental File 1. 367 368

- At the second level of hierarchy (i.e., subregions nested within the level 1 regions, with a lower degree of endemism), we found nine subregions with distinct geographic
- characteristics (Figure 2B). The large inshore bioregion differentiated into six subregions:
  one covering eastern South Africa; one subregion mostly north of 20°S, and four bioregions
- 372 one covering eastern South Africa, one subregion mostly north of 20 S, and four bioregion 373 along the western coasts of Australia. The offshore bioregion revealed only one subregion
- and the Southern Ocean displayed two subregions. At this level, the lack of sufficient
- available data was reflected by sparse subregions occurrences in the SIOFA's management
- area. The endemicity patterns varied by subregion, wherein subregion 1.1 (29.05%), 1.3
- 377 (41.34%) and 2.1 (43.16%) have the largest endemicity, followed by subregion 1.12
- 378 (21.62%) and subregion 1.5 (17.65%) (Table 2). The fidelity of species to their subregion is
- 379 less marked than at the first level, where in some cases there is a wide bimodal distribution,

380 reflecting species with distribution spreading across multiple subregions (Figure 3). Yet, all

- 381 subregions had species with a high fidelity, suggesting that none of the subregions was a
- transition zone. The top indicator species for subregion 1.1 were all scleractinian corals; for 382
- 383 subregion 1.2, mostly scleractinians too; subregion 1.3 was mostly characterised by bryozoa; subregion 1.5 by tunicates; subregion 1.12 by a mix of scleractinian, alcyonacean, and
- 384 385 antipatharian corals, and actinians; subregion 1.23 by an equal mix of corals (alcyonacean,
- 386 antipatharian, scleractinian and pennatulaceans) and sponges; subregion 2.1 in its majority by
- 387 sponges of several orders; subregion 2.3 by basket stars and brachiopods; and subregion 3.1
- 388 by a mix of tunicates, sponges and antipatharian corals (Table S2). We provide the full list of
- 389 indicator species for subregions in Supplemental File 2.
- 390

#### 391 Discussion

392

#### 393 Major Wallacean and Linnean shortfalls in the Southern Indian Ocean

394 395 We found that VME taxa of the Southern Indian Ocean and, more specifically, within 396 SIOFA's management area, are subject to an extreme version of the Wallacean and Linnean 397 shortfalls (Cardoso et al., 2011). First, there was very little distributional data for VME 398 indicator taxa (Wallacean shortfall), and the bulk of records was distributed in coastal waters 399 within national jurisdiction, where survey effort is typically concentrated (Hughes et al., 400 2021). This first result is particularly worrisome as it suggests that SIOFA's management 401 area has virtually no data at species level, making it extremely challenging to resolve the

- 402 biogeographic patterns of VME indicator species.
- 403

404 Second, considering the large spatial scale over which we calculated the completeness of our 405 inventory, this incompleteness constitutes a major Linnean shortfall (Cardoso et al., 2011). 406 Our analysis on a per-grid cell basis revealed that the top 20% most adequately sampled cells had a median completeness of 55% at 1° spatial resolution, but this was repeatedly observed 407 408 at all resolutions (Figure S2), which is an alarming insight into the incompleteness of our 409 data. For comparison, marine fish inventories with a level of completeness above 80% are considered as good quality (Mora et al., 2008); freshwater fish inventories with a 410 411 completeness above 78% are fair quality and those with > 90% completeness are good quality (Pelayo-Villamil et al., 2018). However, Fautin et al. (2013) propose that inventories 412 413 70% complete are not well inventoried, after they examined the global distribution of the 414 Order Actiniaria (Phylum Cnidaria) and statistically compared observed with theoretical 415 completeness values. More recently, global marine benthic inventories have been quantified to be less than 80% complete in general, particularly in southern hemispheres and subtropical 416 417 regions (Menegotto & Rangel, 2018). The fact that the percentage of undetected diversity for 418 adequately sampled cells is 50% for all q diversity orders (i.e., for infrequent, frequent, and 419 very highly frequent species) at all spatial resolutions (Figure S3) and that these cells were all 420 in territorial waters (Figure S4) corroborate these geographic and taxonomic biases for VME 421 taxa of the Southern Indian Ocean. 422

423

### Unique vet unknown bioregions

424

425 Our bioregionalization analysis has two main implications. First, SIOFA's management area hosts several biogeographical regions both at the first and second level of the hierarchy. Such

- 426 427 diversity suggests a decisive responsibility for this regional fisheries management
- 428 organization to preserve deep-sea biodiversity. On one hand, the percentage of endemicity is
- 429 high for all regions (10% is proposed as the threshold to define a biogeographic region;

430 Briggs & Bowen, 2012) and comparable to the endemicity of the Indian Ocean marine realms 431 (Costello et al., 2017), which provides robustness to our findings. On the other hand, the completeness analyses suggest that, in grid cells that are not undersampled, the majority of 432 433 frequent species have been recorded (Figure 1D) additionally suggesting that the biogeographical regions based on these cells are robust. Nonetheless, the bioregions will 434 435 likely become better defined as new taxa are identified or existing data are added to 436 biodiversity inventories. For now, the first-level bioregions appear to reveal differences in the 437 species composition across different depth environments, observed in the distribution across 438 the continental shelves and slopes and the deeper offshore areas (Figure 2A). The subregions, 439 in contrast, have a marked geographic distribution (Figure 2B). The complex seafloor 440 topography and oceanography of the Indian Ocean are likely to be playing a central role in 441 structuring these subregions, such as for octocorals in the North Pacific (Summers & 442 Watling, 2021) and anthozoans globally (Watling & Lapointe, 2022), but future research will 443 need to adequately address the environmental drivers behind these biogeographic patterns. 444 Deep-sea biodiversity provides a central role in provisioning services such as fisheries and 445 biochemical compounds (Armstrong et al., 2012; Thurber et al., 2014), and biodiversity 446 maintenance increases resilience after a disturbance (Danovaro et al., 2008); thus, 447 maintaining such biodiversity should be a key management objective in the pursuit of

447 maintaining such biodiversity should be a key management objective in the pursuit of

- 448 sustainable use of resources by SIOFA.
- 449

450 Second, data shortfalls, however, make it impossible to: (1) identify comprehensively the 451 nested biogeographical regions within their management area, and (2) map them at a higher 452 spatial resolution relevant for conservation decisions. In other words, neither we can resolve 453 spatially finer biogeographic clusters at a scale that matches habitat complexity and fishing 454 operating distances, nor understand the extent of clusters, or identify new ones, because most 455 of the area lacks distributional data, especially in the easternmost side. Presently, there are only detailed descriptions of the habitats, biological communities, and oceanography for a 456 few seamounts in the Southwest Indian Ocean Ridge (Hestetun et al., 2017; Pollard & Read, 457 458 2017; Pratt et al., 2019; Read & Pollard, 2017; Rogers et al., 2017; Taylor & Rogers, 2017) 459 as part of the IUCN Seamount Project (Rogers, 2012; Rogers et al., 2017) and MADRidge Project (Roberts et al., 2020). With such few information we are not able to make informative 460 461 maps, nor make robust predictions that translate into fine-scale characterisation of habitats 462 across SIOFA's management area. Therefore the only solution is to resort to using this information at a coarse spatial scale (1° spatial resolution) so that analyses can only provide a 463 first signal (reflected in the lower endemicity of some subregions) that multiple bioregions 464 465 are expected to be found in the Southern Indian Ocean, but not useful for the finer grain 466 resolution needed for conservation measures. Future work might include the exploration of 467 predictive modelling as a first solution to tackle the lack of data.

468

469 In light of the many unknowns, the precautionary approach will be instrumental for the 470 designation of conservation management measures to meet UN Resolutions towards 471 protection of deep-sea habitats in the SIOFA area. Yet, negotiations to reach an agreement in 472 the implementation of conservation measures may result in internal divisions in RFMOs due 473 to limited cooperation and coordination among their members. This has been previously 474 observed for seamounts, for instance, where those falling in the areas of competence of 475 RFMOs eventually are more heavily fished than seamounts outside areas of competence in 476 the same ocean basin (Kerry et al., 2022). 477

478 The absolute necessity of deep-sea biodiversity inventories

480 The shortfalls we identified here corroborate previous global data-driven biogeographic 481 analyses (Watling & Lapointe, 2022) and global habitat suitability maps of different groups of deep-sea habitat-forming taxa (stony corals, Tittensor et al., 2009; octocorals, Yesson et al. 482 483 2012; black corals, Yesson et al. 2017; framework cold-water corals, Davies and Guinotte 2011). These knowledge shortfalls imply that global biogeographic analyses and conservation 484 485 of marine biodiversity are not truly global, a fact increasingly recognized in the literature 486 (Lenoir et al., 2020). Given the unique composition and endemicity of deep-sea ecosystems, 487 and the increasing pressures on them due to the blue acceleration (Jouffray et al., 2020), we 488 strongly urge the absolute necessity of investing in biodiversity inventories to start filling out 489 these knowledge gaps. Although we advocate for this solution, we foresee that it will not 490 change in the near future; hence, conservation decisions will have to rely on predictive 491 modelling approaches in the short-term, which in turn will create an uncertain decision 492 context.

493

494 Predictive approaches are useful for marine ecosystem management in data-poor situations, 495 but are not the panacea (Reiss et al., 2015; Ross & Howell, 2013). Indeed, predictive 496 approaches require complex models whose adequacy for the implementation of management 497 measures needs to be well-understood by model-builders and users (Guillera-Arroita et al., 498 2015). More importantly, they cannot address the fundamental and underlying key issue of 499 missing data: models cannot predict incompletely sampled biodiversity or habitats, let alone 500 unsampled biodiversity and habitats. For example, Stephenson et al. (2021) demonstrated the 501 shortcomings of predictive models for informing the design of spatial management measures 502 for VME taxa in the South Pacific, and urged for the need for better quality data, such as 503 presence-absence and abundance. In addition, the applicability of predictive approaches for 504 the management of these taxa is further challenged by disagreements specific to the definition 505 of VMEs (Gros et al., 2022). Thus, despite the development of state-of-the-art predictive 506 approaches for VME taxa designed to cope with their typical presence-only nature (Ardron et 507 al., 2014), the high seas of the Southern Indian Ocean will still necessitate of exploration 508 efforts and release of data to overcome the alarming observed data deficiency.

509

510 Yet, detailed knowledge on the bathymetry and biodiversity of the Southern Indian Ocean 511 exists for some areas on the high seas, through the fishing industry (e.g., Shotton, 2006; SIODFA, 2022). It will be critical that regional fisheries management organizations make 512 513 information readily available just as international negotiations have agreed to a United 514 Nations treaty on the conservation and sustainable use of biodiversity beyond national jurisdiction (the "BBNJ Treaty" or "UN High Seas Treaty"; UNGA, 2023). However, data 515 mobilisation and digitisation of museum collections also constitute an important step in 516 517 closing the gap of biodiversity synthesis to underpin conservation measures, more so in the realization of the post-2020 Global Biodiversity Framework (Orr et al., 2022). For now, 518 519 conservation and management measures can be implemented in areas that benefit from 520 existing data, building on a combination of key knowledge from RFMOs, bioregionalization 521 schemes based on informed predictive approaches, and the precautionary approach. However, 522 these areas are but snapshots of the deep-sea ecosystems and therefore it is unquestionable 523 that much research exploration remains to be conducted to build comprehensive biodiversity 524 inventories that serve to equip conservation managers with appropriate tools. In this respect, 525 the recently proclaimed United Nations Decade of Ocean Science for Sustainable 526 Development (2021 - 2030) might serve as a platform to catalyse opportunities and develop 527 projects in the Southern Indian Ocean to ensure achieving sustainable management in line 528 with international commitments (Sustainable Development Goals; UNGA, 2015). 529

530 The deep-sea community has paved the way with the development of a blueprint for a global

- 531 deep-sea field programme that identifies and maps the needs and actions to achieve the
- 532 objectives of the "Ocean Decade" (Howell et al., 2020). Similar as to the progress of the
- basin-wide Indian Ocean Observing System programme (IndOOS; Beal et al., 2020; Hermes
- et al., 2019), among them are identified the development of effective strategies that merge
- regional and basin-scale objectives, international coordination, capacity building, data sharing
- and, importantly, data release. These will be critical to finally put an end to the artificial
  empty maps that are systematically observed throughout the literature for this world's ocean
- 538 region.
- 539
- 540

### 541

## 542 References543

- Ardron, J. A., Clark, M. R., Penney, A. J., Hourigan, T. F., Rowden, A. A., Dunstan, P. K.,
  Watling, L., Shank, T. M., Tracey, D. M., Dunn, M. R., & Parker, S. J. (2014). A
  systematic approach towards the identification and protection of vulnerable marine
- 547 ecosystems. *Marine Policy*, 49, 146–154.
  548 https://doi.org/10.1016/J.MARPOL.2013.11.017
- Armstrong, C. W., Foley, N. S., Tinch, R., & van den Hove, S. (2012). Services from the
   deep: Steps towards valuation of deep sea goods and services. *Ecosystem Services*, 2, 2–
- 551 13. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.ECOSER.2012.07.001
- Baillon, S., English, M., Hamel, J. F., & Mercier, A. (2016). Comparative biometry and
  isotopy of three dominant pennatulacean corals in the Northwest Atlantic. *Acta Zoologica*, 97(4), 475–493. https://doi.org/10.1111/AZO.12141
- Beal, L. M., Vialard, J., Roxy, M. K., Li, J., Andres, M., Annamalai, H., Feng, M., Han, W.,
  Hood, R., Lee, T., Lengaigne, M., Lumpkin, R., Masumoto, Y., McPhaden, M. J.,
  Ravichandran, M., Shinoda, T., Sloyan, B. M., Strutton, P. G., Subramanian, A. C., ...
- Parvathi, V. (2020). A Road Map to IndOOS-2: Better Observations of the Rapidly
  Warming Indian Ocean. *Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society*, *101*(11),
- 560 E1891–E1913. https://doi.org/10.1175/BAMS-D-19-0209.1
- Bini, L. M., Diniz-Filho, J. A. F., Rangel, T. F. L. V. B., Bastos, R. P., & Pinto, M. P. (2006).
  Challenging Wallacean and Linnean shortfalls: knowledge gradients and conservation
  planning in a biodiversity hotspot. *Diversity and Distributions*, *12*(5), 475–482.
  https://doi.org/10.1111/J.1366-9516.2006.00286.X
- Bloomfield, N. J., Knerr, N., & Encinas-Viso, F. (2018). A comparison of network and
  clustering methods to detect biogeographical regions. *Ecography*, 41(1), 1–10.
  https://doi.org/10.1111/ECOG.02596
- Briggs, J. C., & Bowen, B. W. (2012). A realignment of marine biogeographic provinces with
  particular reference to fish distributions. *Journal of Biogeography*, *39*(1), 12–30.
  https://doi.org/10.1111/J.1365-2699.2011.02613.X
- 571 Brown, J. H., & Lomolino, M. v. (1998). *Biogeography*. Sinuer Associates Publishers.
  572 https://suny-esf573 magnetic state and an article and an article and article article and article ar
- researchportal.esploro.exlibrisgroup.com/esploro/outputs/99885909704826?institution=
   01SUNY\_ESF&skipUsageReporting=true&recordUsage=false
- 575 Cairns, S. D. (n.d.). On line appendix: Phylogenetic list of the 711 valid Recent
- 576 azooxanthellate scleractinian species with their junior synonyms and depth ranges. In
- 577 *Cold-Water Corals: The Biology and Geology of Deep-Sea Coral Habitats.* (p. 28).
- 578 Cambridge University Press. Retrieved April 4, 2022, from
- 579 https://www.marinespecies.org/introduced/aphia.php?p=sourcedetails&id=142534

- Cairns, S. D. (2007). Deep-water corals: An overview with special reference to diversity and
   distribution of deep-water scleractinian corals. *Bulletin of Marine Science*, 81(3), 311–
   322.
- Cardoso, P., Erwin, T. L., Borges, P. A. V., & New, T. R. (2011). The seven impediments in
  invertebrate conservation and how to overcome them. *Biological Conservation*, *144*(11),
  2647–2655. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.BIOCON.2011.07.024
- Chao, A., Gotelli, N. J., Hsieh, T. C., Sander, E. L., Ma, K. H., Colwell, R. K., & Ellison, A.
  M. (2014). Rarefaction and extrapolation with Hill numbers: a framework for sampling and estimation in species diversity studies. *Ecological Monographs*, 84(1), 45–67. https://doi.org/10.1890/13-0133.1
- Chao, A., & Hu, K. (2023). *iNEXT.4steps: four steps of INterpolation and EXTrapolation analysis* (R package version 1.0.1).
- 592 Chao, A., Kubota, Y., Zelený, D., Chiu, C. H., Li, C. F., Kusumoto, B., Yasuhara, M., Thorn,
  593 S., Wei, C. L., Costello, M. J., & Colwell, R. K. (2020). Quantifying sample
  594 completeness and comparing diversities among assemblages. *Ecological Research*,
  595 35(2), 292–314. https://doi.org/10.1111/1440-1703.12102
- 595 55(2), 292–514. https://doi.org/10.1111/1440-1705.12102
  596 Clark, M. R., Vinnichenko, V. I., Gordon, J. D. M., Beck-Bulat, G. Z., Kukharev, N. N., &
  597 Kakora, A. F. (2007). Large-Scale Distant-Water Trawl Fisheries on Seamounts. In T. J.
  598 Pitcher, T. Morato, P. J. B. Hart, M. R. Clark, N. Haggan, & R. S. Santos (Eds.),
- Seamounts: Ecology, Fisheries & Conservation (pp. 361–399). John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.
   https://doi.org/10.1002/9780470691953.CH17
- Costello, M. J., Cheung, A., & de Hauwere, N. (2010). Surface area and the seabed area,
  volume, depth, slope, and topographic variation for the world's seas, oceans, and
  countries. *Environmental Science and Technology*, 44(23), 8821–8828.
  https://doi.org/10.1021/ES1012752
- Costello, M. J., Tsai, P., Wong, P. S., Cheung, A. K. L., Basher, Z., & Chaudhary, C. (2017).
  Marine biogeographic realms and species endemicity. *Nature Communications*, 8(1), 1–
  10. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-017-01121-2
- Danovaro, R., Canals, M., Gambi, C., Heussner, S., Lampadariou, N., & Vanreusel, A.
  (2009). Exploring Benthic Biodiversity Patterns and Hotspots on European Margin
  Slopes. *Oceanography*, 22(1), 16–25. https://www.jstor.org/stable/24860919?seq=1
- 611 Danovaro, R., Gambi, C., Dell'Anno, A., Corinaldesi, C., Fraschetti, S., Vanreusel, A.,
- Vincx, M., & Gooday, A. J. (2008). Exponential Decline of Deep-Sea Ecosystem
   Functioning Linked to Benthic Biodiversity Loss. *Current Biology*, 18(1), 1–8.
   https://doi.org/10.1016/J.CUB.2007.11.056
- Davies, A. J., & Guinotte, J. M. (2011). Global Habitat Suitability for Framework-Forming
  Cold-Water Corals. *PLoS ONE*, 6(4), e18483.
- 617 https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0018483
- Edler, D., Guedes, T., Zizka, A., Rosvall, M., & Antonelli, A. (2017). Infomap Bioregions:
  Interactive Mapping of Biogeographical Regions from Species Distributions. *Systematic Biology*, 66(2), 197–204. https://doi.org/10.1093/SYSBIO/SYW087
- FAO. (2009). International Guidelines for the Management of Deep-Sea Fisheries in the High
  Seas Directives. In *FAO Fisheries and Aquaculture Circular. No. 1036* (Vol. 1036,
  Issue 1036).
- Fautin, D. G., Malarky, L., & Soberón, J. (2013). Latitudinal Diversity of Sea Anemones
  (Cnidaria: Actiniaria). *The Biological Bulletin*, 224(2), 89–98.
  https://doi.org/10.1086/BBLV224N2P89
- 627 Freiwald, A., & Roberts, J. M. (2005). Cold-water corals and ecosystems. Springer.
- 628 GEBCO. (2021). GEBCO Gridded Bathymetry Data. https://www.gebco.net

- Gros, C., Jansen, J., Dunstan, P. K., Welsford, D. C., & Hill, N. A. (2022). Vulnerable, but
  Still Poorly Known, Marine Ecosystems: How to Make Distribution Models More
  Relevant and Impactful for Conservation and Management of VMEs? *Frontiers in Marine Science*, 0, 925. https://doi.org/10.3389/FMARS.2022.870145
- Guillera-Arroita, G., Lahoz-Monfort, J. J., Elith, J., Gordon, A., Kujala, H., Lentini, P. E.,
  Mccarthy, M. A., Tingley, R., & Wintle, B. A. (2015). Is my species distribution model
  fit for purpose? Matching data and models to applications. *Global Ecology and Biogeography*, 24(3), 276–292. https://doi.org/10.1111/GEB.12268/SUPPINFO
- Halpern, B. S., Frazier, M., Afflerbach, J., Lowndes, J. S., Micheli, F., O'Hara, C.,
- 638 Scarborough, C., & Selkoe, K. A. (2019). Recent pace of change in human impact on the
  639 world's ocean. *Scientific Reports*, 9(1), 1–8. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-019-47201640 9
- Hermes, J. C., Masumoto, Y., Beal, L. M., Roxy, M. K., Vialard, J., Andres, M., Annamalai,
  H., Behera, S., D'Adamo, N., Doi, T., Feng, M., Han, W., Hardman-Mountford, N.,
  Hendon, H., Hood, R., Kido, S., Lee, C., Lee, T., Lengaigne, M., ... Yu, W. (2019). A
  sustained ocean observing system in the indian ocean for climate related scientific
  knowledge and societal needs. *Frontiers in Marine Science*, 6(JUN), 355.
- 646 https://doi.org/10.3389/FMARS.2019.00355/BIBTEX
- Hestetun, J. T., Rapp, H. T., & Xavier, J. (2017). Carnivorous sponges (Porifera,
  Cladorhizidae) from the Southwest Indian Ocean Ridge seamounts. *Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography*, *137*, 166–189.
  https://doi.org/10.1016/J.DSR2.2016.03.004
- Hill, M. O. (1973). Diversity and Evenness: A Unifying Notation and Its Consequences.
   *Ecology*, 54(2), 427–432. https://doi.org/10.2307/1934352
- Hortal, J., Bello, F. de, Diniz-Filho, J. A. F., Lewinsohn, T., Lobo, J. M., & Ladle, R. J.
  (2015). Seven shortfalls that beset large-scale knowledge of biodiversity. *The Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics*, 46, 523–549.
- 656 https://www.annualreviews.org/doi/pdf/10.1146/annurev-ecolsys-112414-054400
- Howell, K. L., Hilário, A., Allcock, A. L., Bailey, D. M., Baker, M., Clark, M. R., Colaço,
  A., Copley, J., Cordes, E. E., Danovaro, R., Dissanayake, A., Escobar, E., Esquete, P.,
  Gallagher, A. J., Gates, A. R., Gaudron, S. M., German, C. R., Gjerde, K. M., Higgs, N.
  D., ... Xavier, J. R. (2020). A Blueprint for an Inclusive, Global Deep-Sea Ocean
- 661 Decade Field Program. *Frontiers in Marine Science*, 7, 999.
- 662 https://doi.org/10.3389/FMARS.2020.584861/BIBTEX
- Hughes, A. C., Orr, M. C., Ma, K., Costello, M. J., Waller, J., Provoost, P., Yang, Q., Zhu,
  C., & Qiao, H. (2021). Sampling biases shape our view of the natural world. *Ecography*,
  44(0) 1250 1260 https://doi.org/10.1111/ECOC.05026
- 665 44(9), 1259–1269. https://doi.org/10.1111/ECOG.05926
- Ingole, B., & Koslow, J. A. (2005). Deep-sea ecosystems of the Indian Ocean. *Indian Journal of Marine Sciences*, 34(1), 27–34.
- Jouffray, J. B., Blasiak, R., Norström, A. V., Österblom, H., & Nyström, M. (2020). The Blue
  Acceleration: The Trajectory of Human Expansion into the Ocean. *One Earth*, 2(1), 43–
  54. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.ONEEAR.2019.12.016
- Kerry, C. R., Exeter, O. M., & Witt, M. J. (2022). Monitoring global fishing activity in
  proximity to seamounts using automatic identification systems. *Fish and Fisheries*,
  23(3), 733–749. https://doi.org/10.1111/FAF.12647
- Kocsis, Á. T., Reddin, C. J., & Kiessling, W. (2018). The stability of coastal benthic
  biogeography over the last 10 million years. *Global Ecology and Biogeography*, 27(9),
- 676 1106–1120. https://doi.org/10.1111/GEB.12771

- Lenoir, J., Bertrand, R., Comte, L., Bourgeaud, L., Hattab, T., Murienne, J., & Grenouillet, G.
  (2020). Species better track climate warming in the oceans than on land. *Nature Ecology & Evolution*, 4(8), 1044–1059. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41559-020-1198-2
- Leroy, B. (2012). Utilisation des bases de données biodiversité pour la conservation des
  taxons d'invertébrés: indices de rareté des assemblages d'espèces et modèles de
  prédiction de répartition d'espèces [Doctoral dissertation]. Muséum national d'histoire
- 683 naturelle.
  684 Leroy, B. (2021). *biogeonetworks: Biogeographical Network Manipulation And Analysis. R*
- 685 package version 0.1.2.
  686 Leroy, B., Dias, M. S., Giraud, E., Hugueny, B., Jézéquel, C., Leprieur, F., Oberdorff, T., &
  687 Tedesco, P. A. (2019). Global biogeographical regions of freshwater fish species.
- *Journal of Biogeography*, *46*(11), 2407–2419. https://doi.org/10.1111/JBI.13674 Leroy, B., Gallon, R., Feunteun, E., Robuchon, M., & Ysnel, F. (2017). Cross-taxon
- congruence in the rarity of subtidal rocky marine assemblages: No taxonomic shortcut
  for conservation monitoring. *Ecological Indicators*, 77, 239–249.
  https://doi.org/10.1016/J.ECOLIND.2017.02.012
- Lobo, J. M., Hortal, J., Yela, J. L., Millán, A., Sánchez-Fernández, D., García-Roselló, E.,
  González-Dacosta, J., Heine, J., González-Vilas, L., & Guisande, C. (2018). KnowBR:
  An application to map the geographical variation of survey effort and identify wellsurveyed areas from biodiversity databases. *Ecological Indicators*, *91*, 241–248.
- https://doi.org/10.1016/J.ECOLIND.2018.03.077
  Lomolino, M. v. (2004). Conservation Biogeography. In M. v. Lomolino & L. R. Heaney
- (Eds.), Frontiers of Biogeography: New Directions in the Geography of Nature (pp. 293–296). Sinauer Associates.
- Lourie, S. A., & Vincent, A. C. J. (2004). Using Biogeography to Help Set Priorities in
  Marine Conservation. *Conservation Biology*, *18*(4), 1004–1020.
  https://www.jstor.org/stable/3589174?seq=1
- McFadden, C. S., France, S. C., Sánchez, J. A., & Alderslade, P. (2006). A molecular
  phylogenetic analysis of the Octocorallia (Cnidaria: Anthozoa) based on mitochondrial
  protein-coding sequences. *Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution*, 41(3), 513–527.
  https://doi.org/10.1016/J.YMPEV.2006.06.010
- McFadden, C. S., Ofwegen, L. P. van, & Quattrini, A. M. (2022). Revisionary systematics of
   Octocorallia (Cnidaria: Anthozoa) guided by phylogenomics. *Bulletin of the Society of Systematic Biologists*, 1(3). https://doi.org/10.18061/BSSB.V1I3.8735
- McFadden, C. S., Sánchez, J. A., & France, S. C. (2010). Molecular Phylogenetic Insights
  into the Evolution of Octocorallia: A Review. *Integrative and Comparative Biology*,
  50(3), 389–410. https://doi.org/10.1093/ICB/ICQ056
- Menegotto, A., & Rangel, T. F. (2018). Mapping knowledge gaps in marine diversity reveals
  a latitudinal gradient of missing species richness. *Nature Communications 2018 9:1*,
  9(1), 1–6. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-018-07217-7
- Mora, C., Tittensor, D. P., & Myers, R. A. (2008). The completeness of taxonomic
  inventories for describing the global diversity and distribution of marine fishes. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences*, 275(1631), 149–155.
  https://doi.org/10.1098/RSPB.2007.1315
- O'Hara, C. C., Frazier, M., & Halpern, B. S. (2021). At-risk marine biodiversity faces
  extensive, expanding, and intensifying human impacts. *Science*, *372*(6537), 84–87.
  https://doi.org/10.1126/SCIENCE.ABE6731
- Orr, M. C., Hughes, A. C., Costello, M. J., & Qiao, H. (2022). Biodiversity data synthesis is
  critical for realizing a functional post-2020 framework. *Biological Conservation*, 274,
  109735. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.BIOCON.2022.109735

- Pelayo-Villamil, P., Guisande, C., Manjarrés-Hernández, A., Jiménez, L. F., GranadoLorencio, C., García-Roselló, E., González-Dacosta, J., Heine, J., González-Vilas, L., &
  Lobo, J. M. (2018). Completeness of national freshwater fish species inventories around
  the world. *Biodiversity and Conservation*, 27(14), 3807–3817.
- 731 https://doi.org/10.1007/S10531-018-1630-Y/FIGURES/6
- Pollard, R., & Read, J. (2017). Circulation, stratification and seamounts in the Southwest
  Indian Ocean. *Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography*, *136*, 36–
  43. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.DSR2.2015.02.018
- Pratt, N., Chen, T., Li, T., Wilson, D. J., van de Flierdt, T., Little, S. H., Taylor, M. L.,
  Robinson, L. F., Rogers, A. D., & Santodomingo, N. (2019). Temporal distribution and
  diversity of cold-water corals in the southwest Indian Ocean over the past 25,000 years. *Deep Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers*, 149, 103049.
  https://doi.org/10.1016/J.DSR.2019.05.009
- R Core Team. (2021). *R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing* (v4.1.2). R
   Foundation for Statistical Computing.
- Rakka, M., Godinho, A., Orejas, C., & Carreiro-Silva, M. (2021). Embryo and larval biology
   of the deep-sea octocoral Dentomuricea aff. meteor under different temperature regimes.
   *PeerJ*, 9, e11604. https://doi.org/10.7717/PEERJ.11604/SUPP-7
- Rakka, M., Maier, S. R., van Oevelen, D., Godinho, A., Bilan, M., Orejas, C., & CarreiroSilva, M. (2021). Contrasting metabolic strategies of two co-occurring deep-sea
  octocorals. *Scientific Reports*, *11*(1), 1–12. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-021-90134-5
- Read, J., & Pollard, R. (2017). An introduction to the physical oceanography of six
   seamounts in the southwest Indian Ocean. *Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography*, 136, 44–58. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.DSR2.2015.06.022
- Reiss, H., Birchenough, S., Borja, A., Buhl-Mortensen, L., Craeymeersch, J., Dannheim, J.,
  Darr, A., Galparsoro, I., Gogina, M., Neumann, H., Populus, J., Rengstorf, A. M., Valle,
  M., Hoey, G. van, Zettler, M. L., & Degraer, S. (2015). Benthos distribution modelling
  and its relevance for marine ecosystem management. *ICES Journal of Marine Science*,
  752 72(2), 297–315. https://doi.org/10.1093/ICESJMS/FSU107
- Rice, J., Gjerde, K. M., Ardron, J., Arico, S., Cresswell, I., Escobar, E., Grant, S., & Vierros,
  M. (2011). Policy relevance of biogeographic classification for conservation and
  management of marine biodiversity beyond national jurisdiction, and the GOODS
  biogeographic classification. *Ocean & Coastal Management*, *54*(2), 110–122.
  https://doi.org/10.1016/J.OCECOAMAN.2010.10.010
- Roberts, M. J., Ternon, J. F., Marsac, F., Noyon, M., & Payne, A. I. L. (2020). The
  MADRidge project: Bio-physical coupling around three shallow seamounts in the South
  West Indian Ocean. *Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography*, *176*,
  104813. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.DSR2.2020.104813
- Rogers, A. D. (2012). An Ecosystem Approach to Management of Seamounts in the Southern
   Indian Ocean. Volume 1 Overview of Seamount Ecosystems and Biodiversity .
   www.iucn.org/publications
- Rogers, A. D. (2018). The Biology of Seamounts: 25 Years on. Advances in Marine Biology,
   769 79, 137–224. https://doi.org/10.1016/BS.AMB.2018.06.001
- Rogers, A. D., Alvheim, O., Bemanaja, E., Benivary, D., Boersch-Supan, P., Bornman, T. G.,
  Cedras, R., du Plessis, N., Gotheil, S., Høines, A., Kemp, K., Kristiansen, J., Letessier,
  T., Mangar, V., Mazungula, N., Mørk, T., Pinet, P., Pollard, R., Read, J., & Sonnekus,
- 773 T. (2017). Pelagic communities of the South West Indian Ocean seamounts: R/V Dr
- 774 Fridtjof Nansen Cruise 2009-410. Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in
- 775 *Oceanography*, *136*, 5–35. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.DSR2.2016.12.010

- Rogers, A. D., & Taylor, M. L. (2012). Benthic Biodiversity of Seamounts in the Southwest
   Indian Ocean: Cruise Report R/V James Cook 066 Southwest Indian Ocean Seamounts
   Expedition.
- Rojas, A., Patarroyo, P., Mao, L., Bengtson, P., & Kowalewski, M. (2017). Global
  biogeography of Albian ammonoids: A network-based approach. *Geology*, 45(7), 659–
  662. https://doi.org/10.1130/G38944.1
- Ross, R. E., & Howell, K. L. (2013). Use of predictive habitat modelling to assess the
  distribution and extent of the current protection of 'listed' deep-sea habitats. *Diversity and Distributions*, *19*(4), 433–445. https://doi.org/10.1111/DDI.12010
- Rossi, S., Bramanti, L., Gori, A., & Orejas, C. (2017). *Marine animal forests: the ecology of benthic biodiversity hotspots*. Springer International Publishing.
- Rosvall, M., & Bergstrom, C. T. (2008). Maps of random walks on complex networks reveal
   community structure. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*, 105(4), 1118–1123. https://doi.org/10.1073/PNAS.0706851105
- Saraswat, R., Nanajkar, M., Damare, S. R., Khare, N., & Lei, Y. (2022). Editorial: Benthic
  Biodiversity of the Indian Ocean. *Frontiers in Marine Science*, *9*, 372.
  https://doi.org/10.3389/FMARS.2022.877196/BIBTEX
- Scanes, E., Kutti, T., Fang, J. K. H., Johnston, E. L., Ross, P. M., & Bannister, R. J. (2018).
  Mine waste and acute warming induce energetic stress in the deep-sea sponge Geodia atlantica and coral Primnoa resedeaformis; results from a mesocosm study. *Frontiers in Marine Science*, 5(APR), 129. https://doi.org/10.3389/FMARS.2018.00129/BIBTEX
- Shotton, R. (2006). Management of demersal fisheries resources of the Southern Indian
   Ocean. FAO Fisheries Circular No. 1020. https://agris.fao.org/agris-
- 799 search/search.do?recordID=XF2007430299
- SIODFA. (2022). Setting thresholds of sessile benthos bycatch from benthi-pelagic trawling.
  4th Meeting of the Protected Area and Ecosystem Working Group (PAEWG4). 7-11
  March 2022. PAEWG4-04-INFO-01 (Technical Paper 22/01).
- Soberón, J., Jiménez, R., Golubov, J., & Koleff, P. (2007). Assessing completeness of
  biodiversity databases at different spatial scales. *Ecography*, *30*(1), 152–160.
  https://doi.org/10.1111/J.0906-7590.2007.04627.X
- Stephenson, F., Rowden, A. A., Anderson, O. F., Pitcher, C. R., Pinkerton, M. H., Petersen,
  G., & Bowden, D. A. (2021). Presence-only habitat suitability models for vulnerable
  marine ecosystem indicator taxa in the South Pacific have reached their predictive limit. *ICES Journal of Marine Science*. https://doi.org/10.1093/ICESJMS/FSAB162
- Summers, N., & Watling, L. (2021). Upper Bathyal Pacific Ocean biogeographic provinces
  from octocoral distributions. *Progress in Oceanography*, *191*, 102509.
  https://doi.org/10.1016/J.POCEAN.2020.102509
- Sweetman, A. K., Thurber, A. R., Smith, C. R., Levin, L. A., Mora, C., Wei, C.-L., Gooday,
  A. J., Jones, D. O. B., Rex, M., Yasuhara, M., Ingels, J., Ruhl, H. A., Frieder, C. A.,
  Danovaro, R., Würzberg, L., Baco, A., Grupe, B. M., Pasulka, A., Meyer, K. S., ...
- Roberts, J. M. (2017). Major impacts of climate change on deep-sea benthic ecosystems. *Elementa Science of the Anthropocene*, 5(0), 4. https://doi.org/10.1525/elementa.203
- Taylor, M. L., & Rogers, A. D. (2017). Primnoidae (Cnidaria: Octocorallia) of the SW Indian
  Ocean: new species, genus revisions and systematics. *Zoological Journal of the Linnean Society*, 181(1), 70–97. https://doi.org/10.1093/ZOOLINNEAN/ZLX003
- 821 Thurber, A. R., Sweetman, A. K., Narayanaswamy, B. E., Jones, D. O. B., Ingels, J., &
- Hansman, R. L. (2014). Ecosystem function and services provided by the deep sea.
- Biogeosciences, 11(14), 3941–3963. https://doi.org/10.5194/BG-11-3941-2014
   Tittensor, D. P., Baco, A. R., Brewin, P. E., Clark, M. R., Consalvey, M., Hall-Spencer, J.,
- Rowden, A. A., Schlacher, T., Stocks, K. I., & Rogers, A. D. (2009). Predicting global

- habitat suitability for stony corals on seamounts. *Journal of Biogeography*, *36*(6), 1111–
  1128. https://doi.org/10.1111/J.1365-2699.2008.02062.X
- Resolution 61/105 Sustainable fisheries, including through the 1995 agreement for the
   Implementation of the Provisions of the United nations Convention on the law of the Sea
- of 10 December 1982 relating to the Conservation and management of Straddling fish
- Stocks and highly migratory fish Stocks, and related instruments, UNGA A/RES/61/105
  21 (2007).
- United Nations General Assembly. (2015). Transforming Our World: The 2030 Agenda For
  Sustainable Development.
- United Nations General Assembly. (2023, March 5). Intergovernmental conference on an
  international legally binding instrument under the United Nations Convention on the
  Law of the Sea on the conservation and sustainable use of marine biological diversity of
  areas beyond national jurisdiction. Resumed fifth session. 20 February–3 March 2023. *Further Refreshed Draft Text of an Agreement under the United Nations Convention on*the Law of the Sea on the Conservation and Sustainable Use of Marine Biological
- 841 *Diversity of Areas beyond National Jurisdiction.*
- Vilhena, D. A., & Antonelli, A. (2015). A network approach for identifying and delimiting
  biogeographical regions. *Nature Communications*, 6(1), 1–9.
- 844 https://doi.org/10.1038/ncomms7848
- Wafar, M., Venkataraman, K., Ingole, B., Khan, S. A., & LokaBharathi, P. (2011). State of
  Knowledge of Coastal and Marine Biodiversity of Indian Ocean Countries. *PLOS ONE*,
  6(1), e14613. https://doi.org/10.1371/JOURNAL.PONE.0014613
- Watling, L., Guinotte, J., Clark, M. R., & Smith, C. R. (2013). A proposed biogeography of
  the deep ocean floor. *Progress in Oceanography*, *111*, 91–112.
  https://doi.org/10.1016/J.POCEAN.2012.11.003
- Watling, L., & Lapointe, A. (2022). Global biogeography of the lower bathyal (700–3000 m)
  as determined from the distributions of cnidarian anthozoans. *Deep Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers*, 181, 103703.
- 854 https://doi.org/10.1016/J.DSR.2022.103703
- Woolley, S. N. C., Foster, S. D., Bax, N. J., Currie, J. C., Dunn, D. C., Hansen, C., Hill, N.
  A., O'Hara, T. D., Ovaskainen, O., Sayre, R., Vanhatalo, J. P., & Dunstan, P. K. (2020).
  Bioregions in Marine Environments: Combining Biological and Environmental Data for
  Management and Scientific Understanding. *BioScience*, 70(1), 48–59.
  https://doi.org/10.1093/BIOSCI/BIZ133
- 860 WoRMS. (2021). WoRMS World Register of Marine Species.
- 861 https://www.marinespecies.org/
- Yesson, C., Bedford, F., Rogers, A. D., & Taylor, M. L. (2017). The global distribution of
  deep-water Antipatharia habitat. *Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography*, *145*(December), 79–86. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.dsr2.2015.12.004
- Yesson, C., Clark, M. R., Taylor, M. L., & Rogers, A. D. (2011a). The global distribution of
  seamounts based on 30 arc seconds bathymetry data. *Deep Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers*, 58(4), 442–453.
- 868 https://doi.org/10.1016/J.DSR.2011.02.004
- Yesson, C., Clark, M. R., Taylor, M. L., & Rogers, A. D. (2011b). The global distribution of
  seamounts based on 30 arc seconds bathymetry data. *Deep Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers*, 58(4), 442–453.
- 872 https://doi.org/10.1016/J.DSR.2011.02.004
- 873 Yesson, C., Taylor, M. L., Tittensor, D. P., Davies, A. J., Guinotte, J., Baco, A., Black, J.,
- Hall-Spencer, J. M., & Rogers, A. D. (2012). Global habitat suitability of cold-water

- 875 octocorals. *Journal of Biogeography*, *39*(7), 1278–1292. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365 876 2699.2011.02681.x
- Zizka, A., Silvestro, D., Andermann, T., Azevedo, J., Duarte Ritter, C., Daniel Edler, |,
  Farooq, H., Herdean, A., Ariza, M., Ruud Scharn, |, Svantesson, S., Wengström, N.,
- Zizka, V., & Antonelli, | Alexandre. (2019). CoordinateCleaner: Standardized cleaning
  of occurrence records from biological collection databases. *Methods Ecol Evol*, 1–8.
- 881 https://doi.org/10.1111/2041-210X.13152
- 882
- 883

884 Figure 1. (A) Distribution of observed richness in the study area at 1° latitude-longitude 885 spatial resolution. The black polygon represents SIOFA's management area. (B) Observed richness calculated over different subsets of our data at 1° spatial resolution. (C) Sample 886 887 completeness profiles calculated for all cells, and (D) Sample completeness profiles calculated for adequately sampled cells only, for all q diversity orders at 1° spatial resolution. 888 Undersampled cells are cells that had less than 10 species, only singletons, or less than 3 889 890 sampled sub-cells. Numbers over the boxplots indicate sample size (i.e., number of cells). 891



0.00

0

1

q

2

1

q



0.00

0

Figure 2. Distribution of bioregions (A) and subregions (B) at 1° spatial resolution. There are four bioregions at the first level: an inshore (1), an offshore (3), a Southern Ocean (2) and a sparse (4) bioregion. At the second level, there were six subregions nested within bioregion 1 (prefix 1), two subregions in the Southern Ocean bioregion (prefix 2) and one in the offshore bioregion (prefix 3). The black polygon denotes SIOFA's management area. Bathymetric contours (every 1000 m) are shown for reference.

900



902 Figure 3. Distribution of fidelity values of species to their assigned first-level (A) and second-

903 level (B) bioregions.









- 91<del>4</del>

918 Table 1. Number of species and endemicity of each biogeographical region for the species-919 based bioregionalization. Total richness refers to the total number of species found in a bioregion. Assigned richness refers to taxa that the Map Equation algorithm has grouped into 920 921 the same bioregion (even if a species is assigned to a bioregion, its distribution can expand into other bioregions). Endemic richness refers to taxa exclusively found in a bioregion. 922 923 Percentage of endemicity refers to the endemic richness in a bioregion divided by the total 924 number of species in that bioregion. Percentage of species in the study area refers to the 925 number of assigned species to a bioregion divided by the total richness in the database.

Bioregion	Total richness	Assigned richness	Endemic richness	Percentage of endemicity	Percentage of species in study area
Level 1					
1	1664	1621	1581	95.01	83.32
2	212	183	161	75.94	10.62
3	113	93	73	64.60	5.66
4	53	44	34	64.15	2.65
Level 2					
1.1	754	416	219	29.05	37.75
1.2	206	90	27	6.89	10.32
1.3	179	119	74	41.34	8.96
1.5	95	38	15	17.65	4.76
1.12	48	18	8	21.62	3.00
1.23	22	9	3	6.00	1.10
2.1	96	60	41	43.16	4.81
2.3	8	3	1	10.00	0.40
3.1	22	11	4	9.09	1.10